

COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS
MASSACHUSETTS GAMING COMMISSION
PUBLIC MEETING #242

COMMISSIONERS

Eileen O'Brien

Enrique Zuniga

Bruce Stebbins

Gayle Cameron

MASSACHUSETTS GAMING COMMISSION

101 Federal Street

Boston, Massachusetts

May 10, 2018

10:00 a.m. - 1:40 p.m.

P R O C E E D I N G

COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Good morning.
I am going to call to order public meeting
242. It's Thursday, May 10th at 10:00.
Commissioner Stebbins, can we have the
minutes, please?

COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Sure. Madam
Chair, I move that the Commission approve
the minutes from the April 26, 2018 meeting
out in Springfield, Massachusetts, again,
subject to any correction or typographical
errors or other nonmaterial matters.

COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: I second that.

COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Any
discussion? All in favor? Aye.

COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Aye.

COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Aye.

COMMISSIONER O'BRIEN: Aye.

COMMISSIONER CAMERON: 4/0 for
approval of the minutes. Next we have our
administrative update, Executive Director
Bedrosian.

MR. BEDROSIAN: Yes. Good morning,

1 Commissioners. You will know note that we
2 don't have a stenographer present today,
3 which means we are doing a remote
4 stenographer, so I would just ask folks to
5 be diligent with having their mics on.

6 So in terms of an update, general
7 update, I plan to have our summer staff
8 meeting sometime in June, so please look
9 forward to that, and that I will try and
10 work with our updated training program that
11 we're going to have our new gaming agents
12 and members on our gaming enforcement unit
13 start here at the end of the month on a
14 training program for the opening of MGM
15 Springfield. So, as I said, look forward
16 to that.

17 We also have had, as you know, our
18 racing season has restarted. We had 18
19 rehires from our seasonal staff of last
20 year, one new hire. The new hire was a
21 gentleman by the name of Tad Stockman.
22 He's an alternate steward and judge, so
23 that gives us flexibility in the judge's
24 roles.

1 We've had a bunch of internal
2 promotion as a result of getting ready for
3 the MGM opening and expanding our staff.
4 We have had some new hires in the last
5 couple of months, mainly the gaming agents,
6 but I'll list those out. We have Holly
7 Cantell started as a supervising gaming
8 agent in February, Heidi Lorianio started as
9 a gaming agent in March, Christopher
10 Johnson started as a gaming agent in March,
11 Jessica Ofiery and I'm going to apologize
12 to Jessica if I got her last name wrong,
13 she started as a financial intern in March,
14 Scott Helwig is our new gaming compliance
15 manager. You might remember Scott was with
16 IGT and then he came over to the MGC, so
17 welcome to Scott. Dustin Nygro who started
18 as a gaming agent. Both Scott and Dustin
19 just started this week, so congratulations.
20 So, as I said, we had a bunch of also
21 internal promotions for folks.

22 As far as our preparations for MGM,
23 the building is going along -- it appears
24 to be going along fine. I was out there,

1 and I know Commissioner Stebbins was out in
2 Springfield this week. And if you
3 literally walk around the property, you
4 will see that it feels like literally every
5 street in Springfield is being brought down
6 to the -- I don't know what you call it.

7 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: The subbase.

8 MR. BEDROSIAN: The subbase, yes.
9 And the manholes are elevated, and they are
10 getting ready to do a new paving level. I
11 have heard that Springfield has told the
12 utilities take care of whatever you need to
13 take care under the streets, because we're
14 not cutting them open for a long time. So
15 there appears to be a lot of utility work
16 going along. The casino just from the
17 outside appears to be coming along. Signs
18 are actually going up making it look like
19 identify exactly what it is.

20 The most important thing we continue
21 to do obviously is with our gaming agents
22 who are on premises who are taking delivery
23 of the slot machines and table games, we
24 obviously we have a floor plan of what

1 machines are going where. We need to
2 verify when those machines come in. Those
3 are the machines that are in their proper
4 place, and then they will be tested.

5 So far we have a total of as of
6 Monday 1,428 slot machines have been
7 delivered. We have verified almost 90
8 percent, 1,284 of them. And we have
9 actually started a testing program to
10 verify the machines that are in their
11 proper place are working and are
12 communicating both with the house casino
13 management system and with our casino
14 management system.

15 We verified that we have a process
16 to do that, and we're going to start that
17 process aggressively probably in the next
18 two to three weeks hoping to have that all
19 the slot machines verified by the end of
20 June.

21 So, as I said, tables are also
22 showing up, and they are making sure they
23 are going in the right places. So as far
24 as our regulatory responsibilities are, I

1 am told by Mr. Band we seem to be right on
2 track, but there is a lot of other things.
3 I think I've told you individually and
4 collectively the next thing I think you
5 will see from MGM hourly in the process is
6 a liquor license submission, which I
7 anticipate is going to happen at least an
8 introduction of the liquor license
9 submission would be at the next meeting
10 later this month with anticipation that you
11 would hear it, understand it, potentially
12 put it out for public comment for a period
13 of time and have an opportunity to vote on
14 that sometime in June. So that is my
15 update.

16 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: You reported
17 last time that you thought we were close to
18 the MOU getting signed. Any update on
19 that?

20 MR. BEDROSIAN: I still think we're
21 close to the MOU getting signed. I
22 actually did check on that yesterday, and I
23 am told there are meetings going on. I
24 think we're very close. The good news is

1 people are acting and preparing as if it is
2 signed. So Springfield is acting and
3 putting people in training and getting
4 ready to assign people. Brian Connors has
5 gone out and had a posting, which for those
6 of you have been in law enforcement
7 understand a posting is internally a job
8 application for a specific unit.

9 They have done a posting for the
10 GEU. He has gone out and done applications
11 and talked to people who are interested in
12 the GEU, and he might even have his
13 selection of folks who he wants in the GEU.
14 So while the signatures aren't on the line,
15 everyone is acting like it will get done,
16 which I think is a good thing.

17 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Good.

18 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: And members
19 of the Springfield PD will attend our
20 mini-academy with the state police and our
21 gaming agents?

22 MR. BEDROSIAN: Exactly, yeah.
23 There is a little bit of enhanced ethics we
24 all have to go through as being members of

1 either the commission or the GEU, and
2 they'll be part of that also. And I will
3 say, also in terms of preparations, but I
4 will leave this to Commissioner Stebbins
5 and his comments, Commissioner Stebbins and
6 Director Griffin and I were out in
7 Springfield earlier this week to watch part
8 of a Mass. hiring event, very interesting.
9 But as I said, I'm going to defer to
10 Commissioner Stebbins for those comments.
11 So that's all I have, thank you.

12 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Thank you.
13 Before I turn it over to Director Vander
14 Linden, I failed to mention that Chairman
15 Crosby is away on business, so he has asked
16 me to chair today's meeting. Director
17 Vander Linden?

18 MR. VANDER LINDEN: Good morning,
19 Commissioners.

20 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Good
21 morning.

22 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Good morning.

23 MR. VANDER LINDEN: So I have three
24 agenda items for you today. The first one

1 is presenting to you and for vote Version 2
2 of the Responsible Gaming Framework. After
3 that I will transition over and we have two
4 presentations. One, looking at lottery
5 impacts following the opening of Plainridge
6 Park Casino, so we're looking at a two-year
7 report, and then with a very interesting
8 presentation on Mass-At-A-Glance, which is
9 a way in which we are looking to share the
10 large amount of data that we've been
11 collecting over the past several years now.

12 But, first, let's talk about the
13 framework. I think that it's safe to say
14 that embedded within the Expanded Gaming
15 Act and certainly within the values of this
16 Commission is a value of promoting
17 responsible gaming. Promoting responsible
18 gaming is a way of mitigating the negative
19 and unintended consequences of introducing
20 casinos to the State of Massachusetts.

21 Also very early on in the
22 Commission's life, we decided to write a
23 framework to articulate what our
24 orientation is towards responsible gaming;

1 namely, that responsible gaming is not one
2 dimensional. That there's many dimensions
3 to this if we truly want to do this in any
4 type of meaningful way.

5 We took into consideration a breath
6 of information, including what work has
7 been done in other jurisdictions, what
8 research exists, what do experts in this
9 field tell us about responsible gaming, and
10 what should we consider as we move forward
11 even in the absence of clear and concrete
12 evidence.

13 The summation of that work was the
14 very first version of the responsible
15 gaming framework. It was incredibly
16 helpful to me, I think, and in turn
17 incredibly helpful to the Commission as we
18 began to introduce some of the core
19 programs, responsible gaming programs that
20 we have, whether it's GameSense, whether
21 it's our unique approach to doing voluntary
22 self-exclusion, which was also mandated
23 through the Expanded Gaming Act up to and
24 including PlayMyWay. There are many others

1 that are outlined within that original
2 framework, but I won't go into greater
3 detail.

4 What was also, I think, really
5 important in that first framework was the
6 recognition that our strategies, that are
7 approach needs to remain flexible. We need
8 to pay attention to what additional
9 evidence is out there as it evolves over
10 time, and that we should consider rewriting
11 that framework.

12 So after four years of Version 1, we
13 engaged -- actually, three years. It's
14 four years now. After three years, we
15 recognized that it was time to update the
16 framework to take into consideration such
17 additional evidence that there is.

18 So we went back and began working
19 again with Dr. Jeff Morrata, who was a key
20 architect and author in the original
21 framework. We also asked for the
22 assistance of Commissioner Zuniga, Marlene
23 Warner, who is the executive director of
24 the Mass. Council on Compulsive Gambling

1 and Teresa Fiore also joined our group and
2 kind of as the steering committee.

3 We looked at what additional
4 evidence, what research has come about to
5 date. We went out and we approached some
6 of the same key stakeholder groups that we
7 did in the first round, including experts
8 in the field, including our gaming
9 licensees. We expanded that and included a
10 community of persons that are recovering
11 from a gambling disorder and received some
12 pretty phenomenal feedback and support for
13 doing this framework.

14 We also had the advantage of
15 hindsight. What was our experience thus
16 far, very limited experience all be it but
17 our experience thus far and the responsible
18 gaming programs that we have. The
19 summation of that work is before you today
20 in Version 2 of the framework.

21 There were a number of key updates.
22 The foundation of it stays the same, but
23 there are also a number of key updates.
24 Just a few highlights for you before I open

1 it up. But the concept of positive play
2 has been integrated throughout the
3 framework. It's something that I've talked
4 about before the Commission for quite some
5 time and we felt like there was enough
6 research, enough foundation behind positive
7 play at this point that we could integrate
8 it into the framework.

9 Positive play is basically the
10 concept of let's not necessarily pay
11 attention to what problem gambling looks
12 like, but let's pay attention to what does
13 responsible gaming look like. What are the
14 characteristics of persons who gamble but
15 gamble without any negative consequences
16 associated with it, and let's try to
17 promote that through our different
18 strategies that we've employed.

19 We integrated this concept of a step
20 care approach as a guiding principal. A
21 step care approach says not every person
22 who gambles is the same, and that we need
23 to adapt our strategies in the way we
24 communicate with individuals differently

1 depending on what their needs are. Perhaps
2 it's providing information about how slot
3 machines work so they can make an informed
4 choice about how they gamble. Perhaps it's
5 making sure that they have options
6 presented to them, because they've gambled
7 to a point where they have experienced a
8 number of negative consequences, and so
9 that we need to provide them with those
10 options.

11 All of which I feel like we've been
12 able to develop a range of different
13 strategies through this framework and
14 especially through our GameSense program
15 that is able to accommodate these sort of
16 wide and varying needs of the different --
17 the gambling landscape in Massachusetts.

18 We also recognize that it's not
19 contained within the walls of a casino and
20 that there is need for our licensees, for
21 the Gaming Commission and by proxy our
22 GameSense program to be out and engaging in
23 the community recognizing that our casinos
24 are part of the community now. That's

1 absolutely true in every case.

2 Springfield is the perfect example
3 of a casino that has become part of the
4 community. And, so, what is the role of
5 our licensees in engaging and being a part
6 of that community beyond just simply
7 receiving a license and being out there.
8 So we provided a specific strategy and some
9 guidance in that area as well.

10 I want to be clear that this is not
11 all parts of the framework are regulation.
12 Again, it's orientation towards the Gaming
13 Commission that should reflect our
14 orientation towards responsible gaming.
15 Certainly some pieces of this have been
16 promulgated into regulation.

17 There are financial components of
18 this that have been promulgated into
19 regulation. There are obviously the
20 voluntary self-exclusion program has been
21 promulgated into regulation. Other pieces
22 of this are recommended practices and
23 tactics which each licensee could adopt in
24 order to meet the broader strategy that --

1 strategies that are outlined within this
2 framework.

3 There are seven different
4 strategies. I won't go through each of
5 them. But it's my belief that as licensees
6 consider their responsible gaming plan, as
7 they consider how they're approaching this
8 very important issue that they will
9 consider each of these seven different
10 strategies and develop a comprehensive plan
11 that addresses these strategies.

12 So with that, I think I would like
13 to turn it over for questions for
14 discussion.

15 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: You know,
16 perhaps before or as part of the comments,
17 I wanted to just emphasize on a couple of
18 points that you make, Mark. Because we had
19 some a couple years, a few years into
20 promulgating regulations and living with
21 this document, there is a lot that made it
22 into this new version from real experience.
23 PlayMyWay and GameSense are key features of
24 the responsible gaming programs that we

1 have, and a lot of that is alluded to here.

2 In the same venue, this group who
3 worked very hard in parsing through every
4 concept in this document was tempted to
5 write things that started to look like a
6 regulation at times. If I can say so
7 myself, I was providing a little bit of
8 that feedback at times to remind everybody
9 that this is the guiding document. It's
10 not meant to be a regulation.

11 There are regulations that flow from
12 this, as you mention in the voluntary
13 self-exclusion and things of the like, but
14 this document was never intended to be a
15 regulatory document and is not. And at
16 least our licensees also are often, at
17 times rather, struggle with that notion as
18 well, because they are in the compliance
19 side of the house. They say, well, what do
20 I need to do to be in compliance?

21 And, I think, the feature of this
22 being a guided document is one important to
23 remember that, again, regulations will flow
24 from here. But there's also an important

1 piece, which is this notion that there is
2 shared responsibilities in this whole topic
3 where traditionally the onus or
4 responsibility was placed either on the
5 individual or some would say on the
6 operator, this tends to get to the notion
7 that there is community engagement. That's
8 one of the strategies. There's shared --
9 everybody shares into a topic like this,
10 including the Gaming Commission but key
11 other stakeholders, social workers,
12 individuals, operators, et cetera.

13 So that's a thing that's worthy of
14 highlighting in my view.

15 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Yes. I
16 looked at Mark's document or the new
17 framework is not just a prospective
18 document, but it's also a report card.
19 It's a report card on what we implemented
20 with partnership from Plainridge Park
21 Casino and some evidence of success on
22 everything that was in the original
23 framework and carries over into this
24 document.

1 So I was impressed. It also
2 reminded me that there is some things that
3 I would like to sit down and talk with you
4 about as we move ahead making sure that
5 strategy number three, which talks about
6 public health and safety, we kind of get
7 back and revisit some of the issues around
8 seniors being put at risk and that it isn't
9 necessarily all about minors and folks
10 under the age of 21 getting on to the
11 gaming floor.

12 That said, I think you and the team
13 did a great job. And, again, it builds on
14 everything you looked for in the first
15 framework. And, again, it has some great
16 kind of report card elements that show
17 we're on a successful path, and a lot of
18 that is attributable to you and Teresa and
19 Marlene and her team, so nice work.

20 MR. VANDER LINDEN: Thank you.

21 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Yeah, I just
22 want to -- I agree with all of that. You
23 know, I just found this document to be
24 really positive. I love the format. The

1 new format, I think you read it and then
2 you get a sense of everyone working
3 together to keep it safe, to keep it
4 secured, to keep it fun, to play
5 responsibly, positive play. I thought that
6 was a -- I love the word "positive" in
7 there.

8 When you read this document,
9 although you're giving clear ideas of what
10 should be happening and what some of the,
11 you know, things to be cautious of, it's
12 done in a very positive way. I just
13 thought that was --

14 And there's lots of regulatory
15 approaches that don't do that that are
16 really scolding as opposed to let's all
17 share this responsibility. And I thought
18 your comment about the licensee, how do I
19 comply. This is more how do we work
20 together? How do we engage the public?
21 And it's really a very interesting
22 approach, and I think the right approach to
23 take. So really good work, thank you.

24 MR. VANDER LINDEN: Thank you.

1 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: There's
2 another thing that I also wanted to
3 highlight. I forget if you did it in your
4 introductory remarks but one of the
5 precautionary approach. Traditionally, the
6 industry has struggled with implementing
7 strategies because of lack of evidence
8 towards their effectiveness. But in
9 this -- you know, there is a shift, if you
10 will, in this notion embedded in this
11 document that where we note that the
12 activity can be harmful to at least some
13 people. We should look at strategies that
14 intuitively make sense to proceed with and
15 proceed with caution, and that's the whole
16 notion of the precautionary approach.

17 It's very important to recognize
18 that we will evaluate those strategies, and
19 we have been doing that in everything we've
20 implemented under that rubric, and that's a
21 key principal that, I think, also dictates
22 a lot of what we do in the responsible
23 gaming world.

24 MR. VANDER LINDEN: Can I say one

1 other point that I think, Enrique, you
2 started talking about this is the shared
3 responsibility and that this hasn't been
4 fully promulgated into regulation, and I
5 think for a very good reason. I also want
6 to recognize the kind of the insight that
7 our licensees have, and that this begins to
8 hopefully become the foundation where we
9 can promote the type of innovation that
10 from our licensees, what can happen
11 organically from our licensees and how can
12 we partner with them.

13 But this isn't completely
14 comprehensive by any stretch of the
15 imagination. There are so many different
16 directions that we could go based under the
17 umbrella of these seven different
18 strategies, so let's do that. And, in
19 fact, PlayMyWay is a perfect example. We
20 chose not to promulgate that into a
21 regulation but instead work through
22 partnership, structured partnership with
23 our licensees, but let's do it in a way
24 where we can figure out the best way to

1 provide this tool.

2 And I'm personally really excited to
3 be a part of that and a partner both
4 leading the framework, leading the program
5 but also partnering with our licensees to
6 try to figure out new directions that we
7 could go with this.

8 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: And, Mark, to
9 that end, have we gotten any feedback yet
10 on this version from licensees or others?
11 I mean, typically, we would put something
12 like this for a public comment but there is
13 a subset very interested stakeholders in
14 our licensees who usually take also a job
15 like public comment period to provide
16 comments. But what's the status of that or
17 how do you see that?

18 MR. VANDER LINDEN: We first
19 received a pretty detailed letter from the
20 American Gaming Association, and then had a
21 follow-up meeting with MGM. MGM basically
22 said we support the comments of the
23 American Gaming Association. They had a
24 few more questions that kind of got into

1 the nitty-gritty and to the details of how
2 they, as a licensee, begin to work with
3 this document as a licensee in
4 Massachusetts.

5 You know, I think that there were
6 certainly pieces that they agreed upon.
7 There were pieces that they continued to
8 not agree on, for example, the
9 precautionary approach that there is a
10 belief that for us to proceed, it should be
11 based on peer-reviewed research and
12 evidence-based practices. And, I think,
13 that the Commission has, as firmly said in
14 many different ways, that the precautionary
15 approach is the way that we are going, and
16 you said it very clearly just a minute ago.

17 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Are there
18 other examples sort of big picture like
19 that that you want to comment on or would
20 we come back with a at a later time with
21 more detailed public comments? I just want
22 to --

23 MR. VANDER LINDEN: I have the
24 American Gaming Association letter here.

1 And so to be clear, to come back to your
2 original question, it was the American
3 Gaming Association and then feedback both
4 through a meeting as well as a follow-up
5 e-mail from MGM, but I did not receive
6 written feedback from either Wynn or Penn.

7 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Wynn or Penn.

8 MR. VANDER LINDEN: So the specific
9 areas of that they felt warranted further
10 consideration were compliance challenges
11 with the framework, but I feel like this
12 has a large degree to do with kind of some
13 confusion about what is the authority of
14 the framework, which I do feel like it's
15 clear within the framework. And in the
16 follow-up conversations that I've had with
17 MGM, I think that was clarified. The
18 permanency of the peer-reviewed research,
19 as I just mentioned, the dangers of
20 precautionary approach, establishing
21 appropriate parameters around assisting
22 patrons in need, effectively encouraging
23 breaks in play. There was concern --
24 criticism about our recommendation that we

1 provide clocks or that clocks be available.

2 Again, this is a recommendation.

3 This is one way in which we outline that if
4 we're wanting to encourage patrons to take
5 breaks and play, which is kind of a core of
6 responsible gaming practice, this is one
7 way in which you can do it. It's not a
8 regulation. It's just one tactic that
9 licensees can employ that would do that.

10 Whether or not they do it, that is
11 ultimately -- that is their choice, because
12 it is not a regulation. But I would be
13 looking for in their responsible gaming
14 plan strategies or tactics which would
15 accomplish the larger goal, larger goal for
16 strategy.

17 They talked about the legal
18 complexities of third party self-exclusion,
19 which we had very little ability to
20 navigate because it was written into the
21 Expanded Gaming Act. Technology and
22 limitations on cash and credit
23 restrictions, which I think is also an
24 issue that the Commission is currently

1 grappling with outside of the responsible
2 gaming framework. An then, finally,
3 opportunities to enhance responsible gaming
4 through payment innovation. Again, I think
5 those two are connected and issues that the
6 Commission has begun to think about.

7 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Now, the flip
8 side is we also took incorporated comments
9 they had into this version; is that a fair
10 statement?

11 MR. VANDER LINDEN: Yes, absolutely.
12 There were pieces, very specific
13 recommendations that they had that we did
14 incorporate that I thought were very good,
15 and so that we were able to include those
16 where it felt like it still fit within our
17 overall orientation.

18 I would love to think that we will
19 continue to engage with the AGA and
20 certainly without question continue to
21 engage with our licensees. Again, it goes
22 back to this is not comprehensive. It's
23 not everything, and they had some really
24 good ideas. So let's come to the table

1 together to consider what those are.

2 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Right.

3 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: I know how
4 extensively you've worked with the folks at
5 Plainridge, in fact, partnered with
6 PlayMyWay and GameSense. So I expect the
7 same thing will happen with MGM and Encore,
8 correct?

9 MR. VANDER LINDEN: Yes, absolutely.

10 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: You'll
11 continue to dialogue and anything that gets
12 implemented, you'll make sure there's a
13 full understanding.

14 MR. VANDER LINDEN: You know, where
15 I would love to see this go that the
16 original framework didn't go is that it's
17 not that we worked together and that we go
18 through on a regular basis and evaluate the
19 different strategies and the tactics that
20 are being employed, and that we have a sort
21 of greater dialogue or greater process
22 about how each individual licensee's
23 responsible gaming plan both works and how
24 it can be improved.

1 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Thank you.
2 Anything else?

3 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: So we put this
4 out for public comment; is that any --

5 MR. VANDER LINDEN: It was out for
6 public comment. I brought it before the
7 Commission -- it's been some months now. I
8 believe it was in January we went through a
9 pretty extensive public comment period, and
10 so now it's back before the Commission for
11 a vote.

12 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: So we'll
13 vote.

14 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Madam Chair,
15 I'd move that the Commission approve the
16 Massachusetts Responsible Gaming Framework
17 Version 2 as presented in the packet.

18 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: I second that.

19 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Discussion?
20 All in favor? Aye.

21 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Aye.

22 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Aye.

23 COMMISSIONER O'BRIEN: Aye.

24 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: 4/0. Thank

1 you very much. Thanks for the hard work on
2 this.

3 MR. VANDER LINDEN: Good, my
4 pleasure.

5 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Thank you.

6 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: So, I think,
7 we're going to take a really quick
8 two-minute break just to set up. We have
9 someone we have set up by phone to get on
10 for this next portion, so why don't we do
11 that now. Just a couple of minutes,
12 thanks.

13
14 (A recess was taken)

15
16 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Director
17 Vander Linden is back on talking about the
18 two-year lottery report. Welcome to our
19 team from UMass.

20 MS. VOLBERG: Thank you,
21 Commissioners. It's good to be back in
22 Boston again. Mark, you were going to do
23 an introduction?

24 MR. VANDER LINDEN: Yes, if I could

1 do just a very brief introduction. Why
2 don't we just go down the line, and you can
3 introduce yourselves.

4 MS. VOLBERG: My name is Rachel
5 Volberg. I'm the associate professor in
6 the School of Public Health and Health
7 Sciences at UMass Amherst, and these are a
8 couple of members of my team.

9 MS. EVANS: I'm Valerie Evans. I'm
10 a biostatistician on the SEIGMA project
11 also in the Department of Public Health at
12 UMass Amherst.

13 MS. KANG: I am Zhenning Kang. I'm
14 a research assistant with SEIGMA, and I'm a
15 master's student of biostatistician at
16 UMass.

17 MR. VANDER LINDEN: And, Mark, if
18 you could introduce yourself?

19 MR. NICHOLS: Yes. I'm Mark
20 Nichols. I'm a professor of economics at
21 the University of Nevada here in Reno.

22 MR. VANDER LINDEN: Great. Just
23 very quickly, the first section of Chapter
24 23K, the legislature recognized the

1 importance of enhancing and supporting the
2 performance of the state lottery and
3 continuing the Commonwealth's dedication to
4 local aid. And that is a direct quote from
5 Section 1.

6 So the question is: How successful
7 are we at meeting this directive and what
8 impact is opening up a casino or casinos
9 have on lottery revenue and local aid? The
10 purpose of the study that we're presenting
11 before you is to exactly answer those
12 questions. We have been directed to do
13 this by the legislature, a very high
14 priority.

15 So we've incorporated as a key
16 deliverable within our research agenda
17 through the SEIGMA project a study that
18 examines the impact of Plainridge Park
19 Casino on lottery revenues and sales and
20 local aid. So with that, I'll turn it over
21 to Drs. Volberg and Nichols.

22 MS. VOLBERG: So this is actually
23 the second year of or second report on the
24 impact of the Plainridge Park Casino on

1 lottery sales. And I am here to advance
2 the slides while Mark Nichols presents the
3 work that he did. And the reason that Mark
4 is not here in person is because he's
5 actually coming out to our annual meeting
6 in a couple of weeks. And I'm going to
7 just mention, Mark, that you happen to be
8 6-foot-8, and so folding you into a plane
9 twice in two weeks was not deemed
10 advisable. So with that, I think, let's
11 have Mark, if you want to get started.

12 MR. NICHOLS: Good morning,
13 Commissioners, and thank you for
14 accommodating me in order to present our
15 analysis of lottery revenue in Plainridge
16 Park Casino, two years of casino operation
17 remotely. So just moving right into it,
18 the first slide --

19 MR. VANDER LINDEN: Mark, if you
20 could hold on just one second while we
21 queue up your slides. Okay, we are queued
22 up now.

23 MR. NICHOLS: Just go to the second
24 slide, Rachel, it says overview and

1 context. So, again, the focus will be on
2 the impact that Plainridge Park Casino has
3 had on lottery for the first few years of
4 operation. I'm going to provide some very
5 brief analysis by fiscal year, but by far
6 the majority of the analysis will be
7 looking at our agent's specific sales data.

8 We look at this biweekly, and it's
9 important to remember that we will be
10 comparing year one and year two relative to
11 the year prior to opening. And as you'll
12 see, we will be analyzing the data in
13 various geographic contents statewide, host
14 and surrounding communities, the designated
15 surrounding communities, varying driving
16 distances from the casino as well as some
17 communities that were identified in the
18 patron survey as generating a lot of casino
19 visitation.

20 So next, just to cut to the chase, I
21 always kind of like to provide the results
22 early. One of the more key findings, I
23 think, as we find no large significant
24 decline in lottery revenue that we can

1 attribute to the opening of Plainridge Park
2 Casino. And, also, notably, lottery sales
3 in Plainville increased 25 percent during
4 the first year of the casino's operation,
5 and they have remained at that level in
6 year two, and that is largely driven by the
7 sales at Plainridge Park Casino.

8 Next you see sales in the
9 surrounding communities, the designated
10 surrounding communities grew more slowly
11 for year one. There are declines in
12 revenue in year two. We see the same thing
13 when we look at agents within a 15-minute
14 drive. Countering that when we look at
15 agents that are only 16 to 30 minutes away,
16 some definitions may be considered close
17 by, they actually grew more rapidly.

18 And then when we combine Plainville
19 and the surrounding communities together in
20 aggregate, we'll see that sales essentially
21 remained unchanged. And, so, the increase
22 in sales in Plainville have essentially
23 offset the decline that we see in the
24 surrounding communities.

1 Next I'd like to provide a little
2 context about the lottery about its size
3 and relevance, and I apologize if people
4 are aware of this but I'll try to make it
5 brief. The Massachusetts lottery is in
6 terms of per capita sales, it's the largest
7 in the country. Per capita sales in 2016
8 were \$767. In contrast, the state with the
9 next largest per capita sales was Georgia,
10 and it's per capita sales were \$412.

11 The Massachusetts lottery is also
12 one of the more generous lotteries. It
13 pays back to two people 73 cents of every
14 sales dollar compared to the U.S. average
15 of 63 cents. And the Massachusetts lottery
16 is not only larger in terms of per capita
17 terms but absolute terms. Up until 2012
18 and 2013, sales for the Massachusetts
19 lottery exceeded lottery sales in Florida
20 and California.

21 Next, as most are aware, the lottery
22 is an important contributor of local aid to
23 the communities in Massachusetts.
24 Plainville in fiscal year '17 the lottery

1 contributed nearly three quarters of a
2 million-dollars to Plainville, and that was
3 16.6 percent of its total state aid. And
4 as we'll see through -- well, fiscal year
5 sales decreased compared to 2016, the
6 lottery actually posted a record profit of
7 just over one billion, and sales in fiscal
8 year '16 were a record high. The
9 Massachusetts lottery is large, it's
10 well-established, it's mature, but it still
11 seems to be getting some milestones.

12 Next you can see the trends in
13 fiscal year sales between 2003 and 2017.
14 And then you can see the sales have
15 generally grown slowly, relatively
16 steadily. The average growth over this
17 time period is about 1.4 percent but has
18 been below the rate of inflation, which has
19 averaged about two percent. And, again,
20 here you can see the peak in fiscal year
21 2016 followed by the decline in fiscal year
22 '17.

23 The next slide shows the changes
24 from year to year in sales. I don't want

1 to focus on magnitude. Again, you can see
2 fiscal year '17 failed to decline
3 2.6 percent. But, more importantly, sales
4 are volatile from year to year. So
5 movement in sales of two to four percent
6 are not at all uncommon, so it's important
7 not to focus too much on a percentage
8 increase or decrease in sales in any one
9 particular year.

10 The next slide shows the Mass.
11 lottery relative to the U.S. and the New
12 England average. And, again, these are all
13 sales relative to compared to 2005. Again,
14 you can see that the Massachusetts lottery
15 has grown more slowly than lotteries
16 nationwide and even than other lotteries in
17 New England. But, again, that's not
18 surprising given it's size. I don't think
19 there is a lot of opportunity for expansion
20 in Massachusetts. It's consistent with
21 being a very mature industry.

22 And next will be the last slide of
23 looking at fiscal year sales data. Year
24 over year changes, and this is drilling

1 more closely into Plainville and the
2 surrounding communities. Again, I think
3 everybody knows which communities those are
4 but they are Attleboro, Foxborough,
5 Mansfield, North Attleboro and Wrentham.

6 We can see fiscal year '16 sales
7 increased in those communities
8 collectively, but they increased less than
9 the rest of the state. And in the fiscal
10 year '17, again, year over year sales
11 declined, and they decreased slightly more
12 in those communities and stayed as a whole.

13 So next, and the remaining analysis
14 will look at our -- it's weekly lottery
15 data by agents. So we have weekly lottery
16 sales for every lottery agent in the State
17 of Massachusetts. And I can't tell you
18 really or emphasize enough how unique that
19 data is and I would actually like to
20 really, really acknowledge the cooperation
21 of the Massachusetts lottery in this regard
22 and its true precedence.

23 And it provides us a little unique
24 opportunity to analyze lottery sales at

1 various geography, so by community, by
2 driving time, by mileage from the casino,
3 various regions. And, more importantly, it
4 allows us to really compare pre and post
5 casino.

6 The fiscal year data closely
7 coincides with the opening of Plainridge
8 Park Casino, but it's not perfect. So if
9 we want to do year to year comparison,
10 truly pre and post casino, they don't allow
11 us to do that. The fiscal year data, there
12 is going to be some overlap of the casino
13 actually opening during some years.

14 So the next slide shows the change
15 in Plainville and the surrounding
16 communities. Again, keep in mind this is
17 compared to the year prior to the casino
18 opening. And the thing that stands out
19 dramatically in this slide is if you look
20 at the change in Plainville, sales in year
21 one increased by 25 percent in Plainville,
22 and they've remained at that level in year
23 two.

24 The surrounding communities is a bit

1 more of a mixed story. In year one,
2 Attleboro and Mansfield actually performed
3 better than the rest of the state, but in
4 year two pretty consistently every
5 community even grew more slowly or declined
6 compared to the rest of the state.

7 And the next slide shows us a little
8 different context. This is just aggregate
9 total sales and the year prior to the
10 casino opening, the first year after its
11 opening, and the second year after its
12 opening. And when we look at the
13 surrounding communities combined, you can
14 see in the first operation sales grew
15 3.6 percent versus roughly 5.2 percent for
16 the state. And in the second year of
17 operation, collectively they declined by
18 one and a half percent versus a 2.8 percent
19 increase compared to the year prior to
20 opening for the state as a whole.

21 The next slide, however, combines
22 both Plainville and the surrounding
23 communities, and you can see the story
24 changes a little bit. In the first year of

1 operation they grew slightly higher than
2 the rest of the state but by year two sales
3 are flat. They increased only .74 percent
4 versus, again, a 2.8 percent increase in
5 statewide sales.

6 So in the second year of operation,
7 what we have seen is the increased sales in
8 Plainville have essentially been enough to
9 offset the decline that have occurred in
10 surrounding communities, but they've not
11 been quite enough to keep up with the
12 growth in the rest of the state.

13 The next slide shows some select
14 cities in the surrounding communities.
15 There was a patron survey that the SEIGMA
16 project conducted. And in that survey, we
17 discover which communities people were
18 coming from. Plainville and the
19 surrounding communities were a popular
20 community itself, but these communities
21 form were identified as the top five
22 communities generating visitation.

23 Again, you can kind of see a very,
24 very mixed pattern. I don't want to go

1 into specific numbers. But Fall River and
2 Taunton, for example, in year one grew more
3 rapidly in the state. But then in year
4 two, all of these communities are
5 underperforming compared to the state.

6 And the next slide, again, just
7 shows the changes in total sales combined
8 collectively. We can see that in year one
9 the patron origination cities grew roughly
10 at the same rate as the state. But in the
11 second year of operation, they tend to
12 remain flat, very similar to the
13 surrounding communities. They actually
14 also declined about less than one-tenth of
15 one percent.

16 And the next slide shows sales by
17 drive time. And, again, a little kind of
18 bit of repetition here in terms of the
19 story in year one was slightly close to the
20 state and in year two sales for agents
21 within a 15-minute drive actually declined.
22 But when we look at, again, sales for 16 to
23 30 minutes away, we can see sales go up in
24 those communities and actually exceeded the

1 state average.

2 Next we conducted a regional
3 analysis and the map there shows the
4 various regions that were identified by the
5 Donahue Institute. These regions coincide
6 with the Reminy analysis, which is the
7 economic modeling impact model that they
8 use in the economic impact of the lottery.

9 And the reason this is important in
10 the patron survey, I believe, identified
11 the metro Boston and southeast region as
12 generating 85 percent of the recapture
13 dollars coming back into Massachusetts, so
14 we wanted to examine what happened for
15 sales in those regions.

16 The next slide shows us sort of a
17 trend of lottery sales for these regions,
18 the whole metro Boston and southeast
19 region. Again, you can see they very much
20 track one another. Perhaps not surprising
21 given that a lot of the population lives in
22 that part of the state.

23 The next slide shows two different
24 regions. And while it's not germane to the

1 current study, I found interesting in
2 contrast. So it shows the state relative
3 to the Berkshires and the Pioneer Valley.
4 And the Pioneer Valley has generally
5 performed better than the state on the
6 lottery sales growth, and that will be
7 interesting going forward when MGM
8 Springfield opens up to see what happens in
9 that region. And the Berkshire region has
10 generally underperformed compared to the
11 state, particularly beginning in 2012 where
12 sales seem to flatten out notably compared
13 to the states.

14 And the next slide, again, shows
15 sales growth in the regions. Again, no
16 real detectable pattern of sales declining
17 in metro Boston or the southeast, which,
18 again, generating a lot of the casino
19 visitation. And, indeed, sales in the
20 southeast actually performed slightly
21 better in both years compared to the state.
22 Remember the state grew 5.2 percent and
23 2.81 percent, respectfully, in years one
24 and two.

1 And the next slide just, again, kind
2 of spoke to the analysis of dynamics of
3 sales for Plainville and the surrounding
4 communities in the rest of the state.

5 Again, just kind of reemphasizing what was
6 shown earlier. You can see that the sales
7 in Plainville increased. They stay at that
8 level. You can see the green line jumps up
9 above the state average. These sales are
10 all relative to the two-week period prior
11 to the casino opening.

12 The surrounding communities pretty
13 much maintain track with the rest of the
14 state. You might see a slight decrease
15 there between May of 2016 and say maybe
16 December of 2016 where it looks like the
17 surrounding community is slightly
18 underperformed compared to the state, but
19 buy and large no decline in the surrounding
20 community.

21 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Mark, I had a
22 question on that chart and the next chart.
23 The why access shows a ratio of relative
24 sales. Can you just explain that?

1 MR. NICHOLS: Yes, I apologize.
2 Because we're comparing regions of such
3 different magnitude, so I'm comparing
4 Plainville with the rest of Massachusetts,
5 for example. What I did is relative sales
6 are sales relative to the two-week period
7 prior to the casino opening. And, so, I
8 just took sales in each period and divided
9 it by the sales in that two-week period
10 prior to the casino opening.

11 So for that period, relevant sales
12 equal one for everybody because everybody
13 was equal to their sales. And, so, numbers
14 greater than one show that sales have
15 increased compared to the year prior to
16 opening numbers less than one show that
17 sales have declined relative to the period
18 prior to opening.

19 The next slide just shows -- it
20 separates out Plainridge Park Casino. And,
21 again, there is no disclosure of actual
22 sales here. Because, again, sales are all
23 relative to the year prior to opening. But
24 it's very obvious the dramatic increase in

1 lottery sales that occurred following the
2 opening of the casino.

3 And to my knowledge, Massachusetts
4 is unique in certainly requiring but having
5 lottery outlets in casinos. You can see in
6 this graph certainly sales for that have
7 increased dramatically. The yellowish line
8 there is the rest of Plainville excluding
9 Plainridge Park. And, again, you just
10 notice no real noticeable dramatic decline.

11 So next to conclude, again, there's
12 no real clear evidence of any significant
13 decline in lottery revenue that we can
14 attribute to Plainridge Park Casino. It
15 grew -- lottery revenue at Plainridge Park
16 grew significantly, 25 percent in year one.
17 It's maintained and stayed at that level in
18 year two. Sales in the surrounding
19 communities grew more slowly in year one.
20 They did decline in year two. The same is
21 true for agents within a 15-minute drive of
22 the casino, and that includes sales at the
23 casino.

24 Next, if we look at sales in

1 Plainville and the surrounding communities
2 combined, essentially what we see is that
3 the games in Plainville have been
4 sufficient to offset decline in surrounding
5 communities, and together those have left
6 sales essentially unchanged. They haven't
7 quite matched the rest of the state. But
8 in the report that we've submitted, we see
9 that those differences aren't statistically
10 significant.

11 And, again, when you look at
12 something like agents who live in a 16 to
13 30-minute drive, we actually see those
14 agents performing better. And, so, if we
15 were seeing negative impacts, I think we
16 would see a more widespread noticeable
17 decline in sales, and we're just not seeing
18 that.

19 Next, just to further conclude, it's
20 important to recognize that even though
21 this is two years of data, I would still
22 consider it a short-term impact just given
23 the volatility in sales. They do tend to
24 fluctuate week to week, year to year.

1 These results may change over time, and
2 they may definitely be very different for
3 casinos in Springfield and Everett. Both
4 will be of a much different scale than we
5 see in Plainville.

6 So I don't think we can necessarily
7 project these conclusions on those casinos,
8 which leads to the next slide which is
9 future analysis. Obviously we'll continue
10 to analyze the impacts of Plainridge Park
11 Casino. But with the opening of MGM
12 Springfield, it will be a great opportunity
13 to see what happens when the second casino
14 and more traditional, if you will, more
15 resort-based casino opens and we're going
16 to have very, very nice pre-casino data.
17 We will have at least three years of agent
18 specific pre-casino data, so we look
19 forward to looking at that.

20 Again, we'll continue to look at
21 various geography of host and surrounding
22 communities, and I'm hoping that we can
23 combine it further with the patron survey
24 to better understand where people are

1 coming from, specifically to the casinos
2 and, in particular, I'd like to actually
3 have some questions about whether their
4 lottery expenditures have actually changed,
5 because we really don't know what
6 individual people are doing. We just know
7 what's happening with sales overall.

8 So with that, I thank everybody for
9 your attention, and I'm happy to entertain
10 any questions.

11 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Questions?

12 COMMISSIONER O'BRIEN: I just had
13 one question about how you determine how
14 far you can get in 15 minutes or 16 to 30
15 given that it can change dramatically.
16 Maybe not so much in Plainville but going
17 forward. So do you do that at a set time
18 and then just stick statically to that
19 driving time in terms of how far out you
20 get from the casino?

21 MR. NICHOLS: What was the question,
22 how do we determine...

23 COMMISSIONER O'BRIEN: The driving
24 time can fluctuate wildly depending on when

1 you do it. And, so, do you pick one static
2 time to get 15 minutes out or 16 to
3 30-minute drive time out and then stick
4 with that for the analysis?

5 MR. NICHOLS: Yes, that's true. Tom
6 from the Donahue Institute did the driving
7 time, and it does vary -- I believe he used
8 a Google application to determine that. I
9 do think that it actually determines
10 traffic at the time, but you are correct
11 that it will depend on the day and time
12 that you did that.

13 And, so, there could be some
14 fluctuations within 15 to 30 minutes and we
15 are sort of determining it based on one
16 particular time period. So, I mean, we're
17 comparing the same agents year to year. We
18 are not updating the agents that are within
19 a 15-minute drive year to year, so it's all
20 based on the first year.

21 But that is also why we look at
22 other regions, because the drive time is
23 just one indicator. We have mileage as
24 well. We haven't looked at mileage, but we

1 certainly could. So we try to look at it
2 from as many angles as we can, but that is
3 certainly a fair criticism of driving time.
4 It really depends on what day you're
5 looking at. It depends on what time you're
6 looking at, and that could change who is
7 considered in that radius.

8 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Dr. Nichols,
9 this is Gayle Cameron. I had a question.
10 Early in your presentation under lottery
11 size and relevance, you mentioned the sales
12 have decreased in FY '17 but total profit
13 increased and there was a record, you know,
14 1.039 billion. Did you have a further
15 explanation for that statement as to
16 exactly what happened there?

17 MR. NICHOLS: I cannot answer that
18 question. If Commissioner or if Director
19 Sweeney were there, he probably could tell.
20 How they manage that I do not know. But
21 given those sales were down, they did
22 manage a record profit. But how they did
23 that or why it occurred or whether it could
24 occur again, I really can't comment on

1 that. The Massachusetts lottery would know
2 much more about that.

3 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Let me take a
4 stab at it. And, by the way, Director
5 Sweeney is here in the audience. I'm not
6 sure he was prepared to speak. He is
7 welcome to, but let me take a stab at that.
8 There's a number of factors like in any
9 operator cost measures, cost cutting
10 measures could be one. Ratio would
11 obviously be one that would affect the
12 profitability as well as any other measures
13 like any other operator being efficient
14 with cost and what have you.

15 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Great. One
16 last point, Dr. Nichols. So you don't feel
17 like this is an indicator of future casinos
18 mostly because of the size, you just don't
19 feel like you can make any prediction at
20 all as to what will happen in Springfield
21 and Everett; is that right?

22 MR. NICHOLS: Yes, that's right. I
23 mean, I think maybe Springfield and Everett
24 casinos will actually draw a lot more

1 visitors because there will be more
2 entertainment options. Generally speaking,
3 slot parlors and resort casinos tend to
4 draw a little bit different demographic.
5 People may be going to the resort casinos
6 for other amenities. Gambling may be
7 certainly one of the factors that causes
8 people to visit, but it may not be the only
9 factor.

10 And, so, you know, it's very
11 possible that lottery sales for those
12 agents in those casinos may do better than
13 Plainridge Park. But whether you have more
14 people spending money there and whether
15 that leaves less money for lottery and what
16 the impact is going to be is really
17 difficult to say, because a casino like
18 Plainridge Park Casino is going to be much
19 different than the others.

20 The others are going to draw people
21 from a wider area, hopefully from out of
22 state as well, and I don't feel comfortable
23 saying that these conclusions will carry
24 forward to the other casinos.

1 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Okay, thank
2 you.

3 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: I think the
4 out of area is key. Just in Springfield,
5 we know from the market area they are going
6 to draw. It's significantly from the
7 Hartford area as well as the Encore might
8 draw international players. I did want to
9 ask or make a point in the form of a
10 question, Mark, one that I know Director
11 Sweeney has made, I believe, to you in the
12 past.

13 And just to frame the comment, I'm
14 looking specifically at the slide that has
15 the relative sales, the ones that I asked
16 you a question on. And either one, the one
17 on Plainridge or the one that shows the
18 surrounding communities, is it possible
19 that there is enough variability here in
20 the sales numbers, you know, attributable
21 to the confines of a very mature lottery,
22 is it possible that we are observing things
23 like the Powerball or the weather, changes
24 in the weather.

1 Director Sweeney has made a point
2 that simply a merger of operators, an
3 acquisition by one operator of others where
4 they present the product in a different way
5 may be at play here in some capacity. Do
6 you want to comment on any of that relative
7 to these two graphs or the overall notion
8 of the variability that we see?

9 MR. NICHOLS: Yes. So it's one
10 thing I discovered is that when you look at
11 the weekly sales data by agents, agents
12 there is a lot of volatility. So, you
13 know, the slides that you referred to
14 showing the relative sales you can see week
15 to week how they tend to jump. And I
16 noticed something. I've identified where
17 there was a large Powerball jackpot where
18 you see a large spike.

19 But in working with the lottery, one
20 thing that we have learned is that there
21 are a lot of reasons that sales may change.
22 Doors may close to remodel. Owners, new
23 owners may take over. You can have a lot
24 of turnover of employees. And, so, lottery

1 sales are actually very subject to that.

2 And one thing that I didn't put in
3 the report but I have looked at because I
4 was just curious is, you known, you do see
5 some openings and closings of lottery
6 agents. I assume they are closing. In
7 other words, in some years they just don't
8 have sales. But over this time there was
9 actually an increase in the number of
10 agents selling lottery tickets in these
11 areas, not a dramatic increase, but there
12 was an increase. And some lottery agents
13 you see their sales increasing in both
14 years. It's about a third of them
15 actually, about a third of the lottery
16 agents declined in both years and about a
17 third was mixed.

18 So, I think, that is just a lot of
19 the variation that you referred to, and
20 maybe that there is changes that are
21 occurring there. It could be construction.
22 It could be weather. It could be a change
23 in ownership. It could be a remodeling of
24 a store that we are just not aware of.

1 And, so, that is why sales is considered a
2 short-term impact and we really just -- if
3 there was something that there was one sort
4 of root cause that was influencing
5 something, I think we would see it more
6 widespread and universal. There's just not
7 a lot of evidence to that.

8 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Thank you for
9 that. So to that end, is it worthwhile to
10 compare the pre and post casino to not just
11 figures, not to the first or to that two
12 week period prior to the opening but more
13 to a historical, I guess, normalized number
14 either by the group of operators, retailers
15 within the drive time or overall throughout
16 the state; would that make any sense?

17 MR. NICHOLS: Yes, that would
18 certainly be nice. The nice thing going
19 forward is at least for Springfield we are
20 going to have three years of pre-casino,
21 perhaps more normalized data. The
22 construction may influence some of that.
23 There's the casino construction, but we'll
24 at least have more observations of this

1 kind of weekly agents specific sales data.
2 For Plainridge Park, we only had a single
3 year.

4 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Thank you.

5 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: I think it's
6 going to be interesting, Mark, as you
7 pointed out, looking at some of these
8 fluctuations just based on -- I mean, all
9 of our licensees will have lottery
10 agreements but location is different,
11 access to other lottery retail
12 establishments is going to be different.

13 In Springfield, you have several
14 places in downtown Springfield that sells.
15 So you're going to be able to drill deeper
16 into the numbers whereas Plainridge you go,
17 you park, you drive off site, you are now
18 walking to and from. But interesting data
19 to watch and hopefully overall it won't
20 have a negative impact on the lottery. I
21 certainly can foresee in Springfield might
22 have an impact on some of the local agents
23 or convenience stores that are selling
24 product as well.

1 MR. NICHOLS: And that's the nice
2 fact about the data that we have is we can
3 actually look at that. One other thing
4 that I didn't mention earlier, you saw a
5 pretty noticeable decline in year two in
6 Foxborough. And I looked into why that
7 might have been, and there was a
8 well-established business, and I won't name
9 it, but that had been open for many, many
10 years and it was actually a relatively
11 productive lottery agent. I think it had
12 big sales and it closed it, and it even
13 made local headlines in the area.

14 So it seems like that can happen.
15 And so having this agent level data,
16 really, really does allow it to drill down
17 and kind of give us an idea of what is
18 going on. Again, I really have to thank
19 the lottery for providing this because it's
20 really unprecedented that they provide that
21 level of detail data to anyone.

22 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Yes, let me
23 make a point about that. I do want to
24 thank the lottery Director Sweeney is here.

1 He's been cooperating with this effort and
2 many others that we have here as well for
3 now three years, I think, and that has been
4 really, really helpful to this effort, so
5 thank you.

6 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Dr. Nichols,
7 is this the most comprehensive study you
8 have been able to be involved with as far
9 as the direct impact of casinos on a
10 lottery?

11 MR. NICHOLS: Absolutely, no doubt.

12 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Great,
13 thanks. Anything else? Thank you very
14 much. Very well done report. Thank you,
15 team.

16 MR. NICHOLS: Thank you,
17 Commissioners.

18 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Thank you.

19 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Bye-bye.

20 Next we stay with Director Vander
21 Linden and his team from UMass, and they
22 have one more item for us to discuss, so
23 Director Vander Linden.

24 MR. VANDER LINDEN: Thank you. I

1 was trying to figure out how to best
2 introduce this item. I think I'm going to
3 take it from a larger perspective. The
4 Gaming Commission has developed quite an
5 impressive research program that has and
6 will continue to gather a significant
7 amount of data, both social economic data.
8 Eventually this will include player card
9 data.

10 And the question is: How do we --
11 what do we do with this? How do we
12 maximize the data that we have in a way to
13 the broadest audience possible? The
14 reports in and of themselves are incredibly
15 instructive and informative, and that's
16 great. But the data we believe can be used
17 in many different ways, and it only serves
18 to magnify the power of the research that
19 we're doing.

20 Mass-At-A-Glance is one such effort
21 that we will undertake to share the data
22 that we have been collecting, and it makes
23 sense that our very great team at the
24 University of Massachusetts Amherst has

1 undertaken as they have been the lead on
2 our SEIGMA project, which has a number of
3 different measures with an enormous number
4 of different datasets with an enormous
5 amount of data in each one of those to try
6 to help us how to figure out how to roll
7 this out so that it goes beyond just the
8 reports we have, but is useful to all the
9 way down to the individuals at the
10 community level that are just curious about
11 their community.

12 So moving forward, we will
13 certainly, I think, continue to support
14 this type of initiative. We also have a
15 broader mandate, as I just mentioned.
16 There's Section 97 of the Expanded Gaming
17 Act that requires that we collect all
18 player card data and deposit that into a
19 repository and make that available for
20 research purposes.

21 I think it's, you know, that was
22 contemplated early on years ago as this act
23 was being -- as this act was being drafted.
24 We certainly support that effort, and this

1 is a logical extension of that original
2 mandate.

3 So, I think, why don't I go ahead
4 and turn it over to Dr. Volberg to talk
5 about Mass-At-A-Glance.

6 MS. VOLBERG: So, I think this is
7 actually the second time we've done this
8 piece as well but new and improved. So we
9 started at the beginning of the project
10 five years ago, believe it or not, with the
11 commitment from both the Gaming Commission
12 and from our research team to try to share
13 as much data as possible in the most public
14 and transparent way. So the sort of the
15 theoretical framework that we established
16 for the project looks at data, secondary
17 data and primary data in lots and lots of
18 different areas.

19 The initial effort that we presented
20 to you probably about four years ago, three
21 years ago now, was basically looking at
22 each variable individually. So we focused
23 in terms of sharing data initially on
24 trying to drill down to the smallest

1 geography possible. So in this case, the
2 351 towns and cities in the Commonwealth
3 and then trying to sort of present a time
4 series of data in a lot of different areas
5 both in the social and health side and on
6 the economic side.

7 The sort of data sharing apps that
8 we developed were lots of fun for us, but I
9 think the usage patterns that we were
10 following made it clear that not everybody
11 was sort of willing to kind of dive down
12 into the data to the extent that we were
13 letting them.

14 And, so, this presentation that
15 Valerie is going to give is actually an
16 effort that we've had underway for about a
17 year now to try to sort of take a step up
18 and make the data much more user-friendly
19 so that people can kind of do that
20 exploration without kind of instantly
21 ending up in a flood of numbers.

22 So with that, I'm going to turn it
23 over to Valerie.

24 MS. EVANS: Thank you, Rachel.

1 Thank you, Director Vander Linden. Good
2 morning, Commissioners.

3 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Good morning.

4 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Good morning.

5 MS. EVANS: I'm very happy to be
6 here. I'm very excited to introduce this
7 new application that we have been working
8 on. I am going to walk through the
9 functionality of this application with you
10 this morning. I'm not going to talk about
11 any of the data. That will be for the
12 users to explore on their own. The link to
13 this new application will be published on
14 the SEIGMA website after my presentation.
15 So thank you, Elissa.

16 MS. VOLBERG: She's back in Amherst.

17 MS. EVANS: Yes, she's back in the
18 office.

19 MR. VANDER LINDEN: And if I just
20 may, we'll also explore ways in which we
21 can link it through our home page, through
22 the research agenda page on the
23 MassGaming.com site.

24 MS. EVANS: First I'd like to give

1 some acknowledgments. The research
2 assistants that we've had on the SEIGMA
3 project since the beginning, as Rachel
4 mentioned, started working with these web
5 applications and secondary data. I would
6 like to specifically call out Zhenning, who
7 has been the force behind this particular
8 application. She's actually graduating
9 tomorrow with her master's in
10 biostatistician.

11 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Oh,
12 congratulations.

13 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS:
14 Congratulations.

15 MS. EVANS: So we're sad to lose
16 her, but we are very grateful for the work
17 that she's done on this project. I'd also
18 like to thank the SEIGMA team. To call out
19 a few people, of course Rachel being the
20 principal investigator and Amanda and
21 Martha were the initial -- they started the
22 initial investigation into these web
23 applications, this secondary data, and we
24 built from their initial work to where we

1 are today.

2 So, as Rachel mentioned, in addition
3 to all the primary data, we've also been
4 collecting secondary data along the way.
5 And this is the data page from the SEIGMA
6 website, which the link to the application
7 that I'm going to talk about today will be
8 up after this presentation.

9 So prior to this, there were, as
10 Rachel mentioned, individual applications
11 for a bunch of different social, economic
12 and demographic variables and we've taken
13 this to compile this new application which
14 incorporates data from all of these
15 different areas in one user-friendly
16 platform, so that's what I'm going to be
17 walking you through today. And there is
18 the link to our data page from our website.

19 MS. VOLBERG: Don't go there yet.

20 MS. EVANS: Don't go there yet.

21 This is the landing page for the new
22 application. If you're familiar with the
23 original individual applications, which
24 I'll actually get to in a little bit, they

1 have quite a different layout. This will
2 be able to provide multiple data points on
3 one page. So what I'm first -- how I'm
4 going to walk you through this is we will
5 start on the left side bar, and I will walk
6 you through each of the elements on that
7 side one at a time, and then we'll move to
8 the middle where the individual plots are
9 located.

10 So the first thing you will come
11 across at the top of the page is this
12 button, which you can click, which says how
13 to use this application. Clicking on it
14 will provide you with an information box,
15 which will lead you through how you can use
16 this application. First you can choose a
17 municipality or multiple municipalities.
18 And then you can choose a comparison, and
19 then you can choose the data that you
20 choose to visualize. And I'm going to walk
21 you through each of these steps now.

22 So the first thing down the left
23 side bar, you can choose a municipality.
24 So by clicking on this drop down menu, you

1 will be able to either -- you can type
2 in -- start typing in a name or you can
3 choose from the drop down menu. And this
4 has all 351 municipalities in Massachusetts
5 listed, and you can add as many or as few
6 as you wish. Just you should note that the
7 more municipalities you add, the more lines
8 will be on the plot and, yes, you will see
9 the effect of that.

10 So the next thing you can do is you
11 can choose a comparison and we have options
12 for county level comparisons, Massachusetts
13 level or U.S. level, and all of these are
14 subject to availabilities. Some of the
15 data might not have the U.S. level or
16 Massachusetts level for some reason but
17 that becomes obvious as you go through the
18 data that if it's not available, it's not
19 available. But you can choose as many or
20 as few of these as you want as well, and
21 the plots will automatically populate with
22 your selection.

23 And then you are able to choose the
24 data that you wish to visualize. Right now

1 we have three different tabs, demographic,
2 social and economic. And then at the
3 bottom, well, further down, there are -- we
4 decided to have these pop-up windows for
5 the demographic data. So if you're
6 exploring the social or the economic data
7 and you are wondering, oh, I wonder what
8 the age distribution is in these economic
9 variables that I'm looking at, you click on
10 one of these and it will pull up a plot of
11 exactly the municipalities and the
12 selections that you've made and show you
13 that demographic data. So you don't need
14 to click back and forth back to the
15 demographic page. You can just pop it up.
16 And then if you click away, it will
17 disappear.

18 Continuing down the left sidebar,
19 you will come to a drop down menu called
20 "full individual apps." These are the
21 applications that Rachel was referring to
22 that have been built throughout the project
23 from the beginning, I think, starting in
24 2014. So each of these has their own

1 application, which has lots of other data
2 can be explored.

3 And, so, we have a link on this
4 application. So you can go directly to one
5 of those. If you're interested in a
6 particular data set, you can go directly to
7 that and explore that in much greater
8 detail. Later on I'm actually going to go
9 through one of the individual applications
10 so you can see what the difference is
11 between this application and the individual
12 ones.

13 We also have a drop down menu of all
14 the data sources that we've used. So when
15 you're going through the application and
16 you want to find out where we got this data
17 from, this is all publically available,
18 secondary data right now that's built into
19 this application. So you can feel free to
20 explore the original datasets that we've
21 used to create this.

22 And then at the bottom of the
23 left-hand side, we have a survey. We
24 appreciate comments and feedback, so please

1 feel free. And we also have all of the
2 coding behind this application available on
3 Get Hub, which is a publically available
4 repository for coding. So that's if any
5 other researchers wanted to utilize this
6 template for their own work, they can go
7 and see the code that we used to create it.

8 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Could they
9 copy it?

10 MS. EVANS: Yes, yes. They won't
11 have the datasets. They would have to
12 build their own datasets to put into it.
13 But, yes, they can copy the template. It's
14 all available. And then I wanted to give a
15 final --

16 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: I don't like
17 giving away things for free, but I know
18 that's part of the -- that's part of the
19 process here being on --

20 MS. EVANS: The code that was used
21 to create this was through R, which is a
22 publically available open source platform.
23 I also wanted to recognize, again,
24 Zhenning, she's the master coder behind all

1 of this, so thank you.

2 So now I'm going to take you down
3 through the individual plots that are
4 contained in this application. So the
5 first tab that we have is the demographic
6 tab. So we will start at the top of the
7 page, and you'll see there's a note. You
8 probably can't read it. It's quite small.
9 It indicates that there is population level
10 data all the way down the bottom of the
11 page.

12 If you scroll to the bottom of this
13 page, you can see population data. If
14 you're unfamiliar with some of the
15 municipalities, if you want to know what
16 the county level population is, this will
17 let you know. And you can see for this
18 example we've selected Plainville,
19 Springfield and Everett with a
20 Massachusetts comparison. So you can see
21 what the populations are over time with
22 this plot that's located at the bottom of
23 the demographic's page.

24 So this is the first plot on the

1 demographic tab. It's the age
2 distribution. What I want to walk you
3 through is from the top I'll walk you
4 through each of the different elements of
5 the plot that you will see.

6 First of all at the top, you can
7 select one or multiple categories to
8 present on this plot, and each box that you
9 check will create another set of lines for
10 that particular category. The plot will
11 show all of your selections. It will show
12 the municipalities you selected earlier.
13 It will show the comparisons and any of
14 these check boxes, and that will carry you
15 through the entire application. So if you
16 want to go back and you want to add another
17 municipality, you can go back to that
18 initial -- the sidebar and choose another
19 municipality, and it will repopulate all
20 the plots in the application.

21 This plot, in particular, presents a
22 percentage of the population. Because we
23 have other economic and social data, there
24 might be absolute counts. There might be

1 dollar values. There might be other rates,
2 and that will be indicated on the plot.

3 One key point that I wanted to make
4 was that the why axis on these plots are
5 very dynamic. They accommodate the data
6 that is inputted into them. So they adjust
7 to best visualize the data. So you will
8 see this is showing a range of about 40 to
9 60 percent of the population. If you were
10 to look at it from a zero to 100 range,
11 you'd see a bunch of lines right in the
12 middle and that wouldn't be very
13 informative.

14 So be very aware that when you're
15 looking at the data, it might look like a
16 very large change. But if you actually
17 look at the why access, you'll see it's
18 actually visualizing the data in a more, I
19 guess, presentable way that the why access
20 is dynamic.

21 This demographic data is taken from
22 the census bureau for the American
23 Community Survey, and they provide the data
24 in a mid -- a five year average. So they

1 release the data in five year chunks. So
2 you will see that's why we've chosen a
3 midyear of a five year range as the year
4 indication on this plot.

5 So, for example, 2008 will represent
6 the data -- the average data from 2006 to
7 2010. Some of the datasets are presented
8 in that way and others are annual, and it
9 will be indicated at the bottom of the plot
10 how this is being presented.

11 Another functionality of this is that
12 you can choose an individual point on the
13 plot and below the graph it will tell you
14 what the data -- the actual data number is
15 for that particular point on the plot.
16 Then at the bottom underneath the plot,
17 there are two buttons that you can click.
18 One in this case is called, what is the age
19 variable?

20 And if you click on it, it will
21 provide you with an information box which
22 gives you the details of what data is
23 included, if any manipulation has been done
24 to collapsed categories or show it in a

1 particular way. And it also gives you the
2 source of the data so you can go back to
3 that original drop down menu sidebar and go
4 to the American Community Survey if you
5 want to see where this original dataset
6 came from.

7 The second button is the ability to
8 download the plot. So if you click on
9 this, you will be taken to a download of
10 the plot you were just looking at. And
11 both of these, the information box and the
12 download, are available for each of the
13 plots that are contained within the
14 application.

15 So this, as I mentioned, we're
16 looking at the demographic tab. And if you
17 scroll down to the bottom of this page, you
18 will see a link that says more information
19 about demographics, and this is where you
20 can go to the full application. You can
21 either go to the full application through
22 the drop down menu on the left-hand side or
23 underneath each of the individual plots.
24 You can go to the individual application if

1 you want to investigate that particular
2 dataset further.

3 So by clicking on that, it will take
4 you to the full application. So this is
5 the demographic's application that was
6 created a number of years ago. It's
7 difficult to see, but there is an about
8 page, which lists where all the data came
9 from and some particular notes about using
10 the data.

11 There is a summary which provides a
12 table of all the data. There is a way, you
13 know, visualization, selections. In this
14 case, it's a plot. And on the left-hand
15 side, you can make your selections of the
16 different kinds of data to explore.

17 The full applications also have a
18 map, which you can choose a geographic --
19 you can make a geographic selection in this
20 way by clicking on a particular
21 municipality in this case. And then it
22 gives a more information about basically
23 the info box for the plots on the
24 Mass-At-A-Glance application have

1 summarized the data that's contained on
2 this page.

3 So the current demographic data that
4 we have available through the
5 Mass-At-A-Glance application but also full
6 applications are age, race, gender,
7 ethnicity and population. We also have the
8 social tab on the Mass-At-A-Glance
9 application. These are the current social
10 data that we have available. And as I
11 mentioned, each of these has a full
12 application that you can also explore to
13 take you more deeply into investigating
14 these particular datasets. And then the
15 economic data, this is the current economic
16 data that we have available.

17 And this is back to the SEIGMA data
18 web page. All of the individual apps are
19 also available through the data page. On
20 the left-hand side, you can see the three
21 labels, demographic, economic and social.
22 By clicking on those, you can get to the
23 full applications. We will have the link
24 available to the Mass-At-A-Glance to this

1 location after this presentation.

2 So I want to thank you for letting
3 me present this today, and I'll ask for any
4 questions or comments.

5 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Questions?

6 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: I think this
7 is a great tool. Just, you know, one
8 suggestion, and Mark and I talked about
9 this a little bit as we look ahead of the
10 opening of MGM and Springfield another
11 dataset we should begin to think about
12 looking at are hotel/motel taxes and meal's
13 taxes. MGM is going to have a hotel. MGM
14 is going to have restaurants. Looking at
15 what the impact would be to the neighboring
16 communities that collect that, and that is
17 a local tax revenue source, I think, is
18 something that we should keep an eye on.

19 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Absolutely.

20 MS. EVANS: Thank you for the
21 suggestion. The nice think about all of
22 these applications is we're constantly
23 building them, and we're constantly taking
24 suggestions and looking into new data

1 sources, so we will look into that. Thank
2 you.

3 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Do you
4 anticipate a lot of additional research
5 because you've made this tool available and
6 it's much easier to conduct the research?

7 MS. EVANS: I think that the
8 presentation of the Mass-At-A-Glance data
9 is different than the full applications,
10 and I think it will provide users for a
11 much easier way of looking at lots of
12 datasets at once and lots of variables at
13 once.

14 MS. VOLBERG: I think the challenge
15 that we had sort of with the first set of
16 applications was they were very much
17 oriented toward people who wanted to
18 research a single variable, and the
19 discussions that we had with Mark and with
20 Chairman Crosby and with Commissioner
21 Zuniga were more around, you know, what if
22 I am just like a resident of Amherst or
23 Northampton where I live and I want to know
24 something about Northampton relative to

1 Springfield.

2 This is sort of designed to let you
3 look at a number of different variables
4 together and then also look at the
5 demographics and how, for example,
6 Northampton and Springfield differ in their
7 demographics than in these other variables
8 at the same time.

9 MR. VANDER LINDEN: This is a much
10 improved version of the first version of
11 the shiny application that we started
12 working with a couple of years ago now.
13 And just to emphasize what Rachel said that
14 Chairman Crosby has been a strong advocate
15 for seeing this evolve and evolve to the
16 point where it's a very easy to use for
17 most persons and making sure that we have
18 data that's accessible, and that we're
19 leveraging our research to the maximum
20 extent possible.

21 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Right. I was
22 going to make that point. It's only a
23 little pity that Chairman Crosby is not
24 here to hear the presentation, but I'm sure

1 he will review the site when it's
2 available.

3 There is something that I thought
4 about with this setup now another time, and
5 that is that I see there is at least two
6 audiences, there's probably more, that will
7 come to a site like this and those are
8 people wanting to do research that
9 understand standard deviation and things
10 like that and maybe can download the code
11 or what have you and that's great.

12 We really hope, to your earlier
13 question, Commissioner, that more -- the
14 hope is that more can come through that
15 effort through the survey tool that you
16 have put in here or even people will likely
17 pick up the phone and contact you, I hope,
18 to think about variables or datasets or
19 additional research.

20 The balance it occurs to me of
21 people who might come in and see some of
22 this as data is the general public of
23 course, and that is very much in the
24 mission we have and embedded in the

1 statute. The one little thing that I worry
2 about is the attribution error or the
3 attribution bias.

4 If somebody like me looks at, you
5 know, some of those graphs and see that
6 there is something going on in Plainville
7 but does not really understand that there
8 may be a standard deviation, those graphs
9 you were presenting relative to the
10 population under 30, might not really --
11 might come away with the feeling that there
12 is something going on in Plainville and
13 maybe it's just an effect on the
14 variability on that dataset or that graph.

15 I don't think there is any sort of
16 solution for that minor concern that I
17 bring. I think the benefit greatly
18 outweighs it being open and for people to
19 make their own research, conclusion or
20 combining of the variables. But I look
21 forward to the process of getting feedback
22 from both sets, either researchers or the
23 general public, and see how we can continue
24 to either improve or address whatever

1 concerns or impressions are out there.

2 MS. VOLBERG: Yes. We walk that
3 fine line all the time between, you know,
4 someone who, you know, is just interested
5 in the issues or interested in the
6 variables or interested in the information
7 but doesn't want to have to learn or deal
8 with the science and then, you know,
9 ourselves always feeling like, well, you'd
10 have to hedge it around with some
11 explanation. You have to understand the
12 context. How are these numbers collected?

13 And we actually are struggling with
14 that to an even greater degree right now,
15 because we're preparing our first sort of
16 summary overall impact report and figuring
17 out how to sort of, you know, couch the
18 report in a way that's accessible to both
19 of those audiences and make sense has been
20 a real challenge.

21 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: But it's
22 worthwhile. The effort is very important.
23 I think it goes with the mission, and it's
24 great to see it in its new iteration, which

1 is I know has been a lot of work.

2 MS. VOLBERG: Yeah. We're really
3 hoping people will come visit us remotely.

4 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: On that note,
5 is there a way to track, not like big
6 brother approaches, but can you track
7 visitors, downloads, et cetera?

8 MS. EVANS: Absolutely.

9 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: We'll find
10 out, great.

11 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Well, thank
12 you. Very informative, and it looks like
13 an excellent tool. It always amazes me how
14 much easier it is, and you've made it so
15 much easier to look at data and really
16 compare. So, thanks, really appreciate you
17 coming in and letting us know.

18 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA:
19 Congratulations.

20 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Are we good,
21 move on or need a break?

22 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: It's up to
23 you.

24 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Let's move

1 on. I see Director Connelly is here, and
2 he's up next with licensing.

3 MR. CONNELLY: I have to check my
4 watch to make sure it's still morning.
5 Good morning, Madam Chairwoman and
6 Commissioners.

7 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Good morning.

8 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Good
9 morning.

10 MR. CONNELLY: So I'm here today
11 with Kim Dixon, who is the vice president
12 of human resources from Plainridge Park
13 Casino to put forward a number of positions
14 for exemption with the recommendation of
15 the commission staff that these positions
16 be exempted.

17 As you may recall, we went through
18 this process initially with MGM. The law
19 was changed to allow for exemptions. We
20 gathered feedback from the Commission in
21 terms of those criteria that you were
22 interested in seeing about positions and
23 really did a very thorough scrub through
24 all the positions at MGM, looked at them to

1 see which ones might be eligible for
2 exemption.

3 This process Plainridge befitted
4 greatly from that in that they took
5 guidance from that and presented us with a
6 list of positions that they thought based
7 on what they had seen would be also
8 eligible for exemption. We reviewed those
9 and, frankly, agreed with all the
10 submissions that they provided.

11 So there is a list of 51 positions
12 that would impact 157 total employees. So
13 still, you know, a decent sized chunk. The
14 vast majority of which, I believe, almost
15 90 plus percent are in the food and
16 beverage, which I think makes sense,
17 particularly when you think of the profile
18 at Plainridge. But some, you know, some
19 retail, valet, one in finance. So it's not
20 as broad a range as we have seen before,
21 but clearly a good group of candidates for
22 exemption.

23 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: I think
24 different than MGM, we've actually had a

1 couple of years of working with and
2 assessing our risk, and I take it that
3 you've looked at that and certainly you
4 already said that you agree with the list,
5 so there's no issue at all from your
6 standpoint of the categories or...

7 MR. CONNELLY: That's correct. We
8 did take that into account. And as you
9 said, we have a lot of experience now with
10 Plainridge. I mean, it feels like a lot.
11 I know for other jurisdictions it's a drop
12 in the bucket. But for us, you know, we
13 have been working very closely not only in
14 licensing but also in all the compliance
15 areas for a while, and that experience was
16 certainly brought to bare when we did this
17 analysis.

18 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Would it be
19 fair to say that perhaps this will provide
20 some opportunity to people who didn't in
21 the past, perhaps a better emphasis on
22 local hiring as result of this,
23 Massachusetts residents. I'm just
24 speculating broadly.

1 MS. DIXON: Yes, I think absolutely.
2 The LMS process can take some time, and
3 sometimes people can get frustrated with
4 the process and will stop the process
5 because they get lost in the computer and
6 trying to fill out the application. So I
7 certainly think this will help us attract
8 more people and provide more opportunity
9 and get them to work faster.

10 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: To just kind
11 of tag on to that question, you've had the
12 experience being open now three years.
13 There are positions that obviously have
14 higher turnover than some other positions.
15 Do some of these job categories fall into
16 those kind of higher turnover spots and do
17 you think this could help kind of alleviate
18 that even though you're into a three-year
19 maturity period?

20 MS. DIXON: Yes, I do.

21 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: That's great.

22 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Yeah, always
23 appreciate you working collaboratively.
24 That's very helpful to us in making a

1 decision, so I thank you for that. Want to
2 vote on this?

3 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Yes. I'd be
4 happy to move, Madam Chair, that the
5 Commission approve the Plainridge Park
6 Casino service employee exemptions as
7 presented here in the packet.

8 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Second.

9 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Any
10 discussion? Those in agreement? Aye.

11 COMMISSIONER O'BRIEN: Aye.

12 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Aye.

13 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Aye.

14 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: 4/0. Thank
15 you very much. We appreciate it.

16 MR. CONNELLY: Thank you very much.

17 MS. DIXON: Thank you.

18 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Thank you.

19 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Next up is
20 legal, General Counsel Blue.

21 MS. BLUE: So we have amendments to
22 two existing regulations for you this
23 morning. The first one is 205 CMR 146.
24 And as you probably recall, this is our

1 regulation on gaming equipment. We decided
2 that the best way to handle gaming
3 equipment and rules of the game was to post
4 the rules of the game on our website so we
5 could add games more quickly, and we could
6 make changes more quickly but have a
7 separate regulation that dealt with
8 equipment.

9 What we found out when we did that
10 was that we had oftentimes made references
11 from the reg. to certain sections of the
12 rules, and those rules have changed, and
13 they've actually even changed since you
14 first approved them to meet the needs of
15 our licensees and to meet changing needs in
16 the industry.

17 So the amendments that you have to
18 146 are basically technical in nature.
19 They take out section numbers. They clean
20 up a few words here and there. There are
21 no real substantive changes, but we thought
22 it was important to get this done before
23 MGM opens so that we could continue to make
24 changes in the rules as needed without

1 having to go back and change the reg.

2 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Any
3 questions?

4 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: I'm sorry if I
5 missed this when you were introducing this.
6 Are these to start the formal promulgation
7 process?

8 MS. BLUE: Yes. This is the first
9 time you're seeing these amendments. So
10 we'll start the process. We will tee up
11 the hearing. We will get comments, and
12 then we will just move them through.

13 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: I had the
14 similar question. I see that they are
15 technical in nature, so we are ready to
16 move this.

17 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Sure. I'd be
18 happy to move that the Commission approve
19 the Small Business Impact Statement for the
20 amendments to 205 CMR 146, the Gaming
21 Equipment Regulations, as included in the
22 packet.

23 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Second.

24 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Discussion?

1 All those in favor? Aye.

2 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Aye.

3 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Aye.

4 COMMISSIONER O'BRIEN: Aye.

5 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: 4/0.

6 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: I further
7 move, Madam Chair, that the Commission
8 approve the version of the amendments to
9 205 CMR 146, the Gaming Equipment
10 regulations as included in the packet and
11 authorize staff to take all steps necessary
12 to begin the regulation promulgation
13 process.

14 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Second.

15 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Discussion?

16 All those in favor? Aye.

17 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Aye.

18 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Aye.

19 COMMISSIONER O'BRIEN: Aye.

20 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: 4/0. Thank
21 you.

22 MS. BLUE: The second regulation in
23 your packet are the second amendment to
24 134.03. As you will remember from PPC, we

1 know that the licensees oftentimes have
2 folks come from their other properties to
3 help with the opening of a new casino. So
4 we let, in our regulations, those folks
5 come and we let them stay for a certain
6 amount of time without having to go through
7 the licensing process.

8 This amendment gives the IEB some
9 discretion to let those folks stay a little
10 bit longer. And, I think, that makes sense
11 particularly when you're looking at a
12 Category 1 casino. There may need to be
13 folks from other properties there for a
14 little longer time. So that's what this
15 amendment is designed to do. And we have
16 folks from the IEB that if you have
17 questions on this amendment, they will be
18 happy to address them.

19 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Questions?

20 COMMISSIONER O'BRIEN: I did. When
21 I first looked at this, the only hesitation
22 I have is there is no end date to it like
23 there is for the other provisions. And I
24 would feel more comfortable if after

1 consultation with the companies, there is
2 an end date, 6 months, 9 months, 12 months
3 out from the date of the issuance of the
4 operations certificate.

5 MR. BAND: The reason I recommended
6 that not be put in is I didn't really want
7 to tip our hand if we were having problems
8 that, hey, there is problems and everybody
9 across the country comes and tries to
10 capitalize on it. That was my hesitation
11 to put an end date in that.

12 COMMISSIONER O'BRIEN: I still have
13 concerns with I would want to know about
14 it. And so that not anyone else the
15 concern of the Commission might not know
16 about it, and then also the obligation to
17 have to comply with other employment issues
18 and stats, I would want that to come before
19 the board. So if there can be a discussion
20 about what is a reasonable time, 6, 9, 12
21 months out, if there are still bigger
22 problems at that point, I think we have a
23 bigger topic.

24 MR. BAND: I don't disagree with

1 that.

2 MR. BEDROSIAN: We can also do
3 something maybe with maybe a generous, you
4 know, not that that would be our default
5 but have a more generous provision whether
6 it's 6 or 9 months and say, don't take that
7 as our standard. Take that as our outside.

8 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: I have two
9 points on that. But to that end, it is at
10 least conceivable with whatever time frame,
11 set time frame that the operator can
12 actually just rotate a new set of
13 employees, correct, to come from just a
14 different property?

15 MR. BEDROSIAN: What we're not going
16 to do is where they come back for a day and
17 then come for another night.

18 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: No, no, not
19 that. The involvement is on a person, and
20 the idea is to provide just temporary
21 relief while there is some learning -- the
22 learning curve that could very well be in
23 the form of just simply another whatever
24 person may be.

1 I actually thought of this just
2 recently. We've also had the notion of
3 delegating a lot of these judgment calls on
4 an exception basis to the executive
5 director. Is that something that we could
6 embed in this regulation?

7 MR. BEDROSIAN: We could. I think
8 to Commissioner O'Brien's, I'd be
9 comfortable with that as long as I, and I
10 would, but you never know. I would just
11 say you should do it based on the position,
12 not the personality, right, that there be a
13 subsequent reporting requirement back to
14 the Commission, right.

15 So if the executive director
16 exercises his or her authority, then there
17 would be a subsequent reporting requirement
18 back to the Commission. So in other words,
19 if you said the executive director has the
20 authority to extend on an emergency basis
21 for two or three months or something like
22 that, that would be fine. I don't know if
23 you have to write it in the regulation, but
24 I certainly inherently I would report that

1 if I exercise -- usually if I exercise any
2 authority that's delegated to me, I'm going
3 to report that back to the Commission.

4 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: That's part of
5 why I'm thinking about it. It was simply
6 substituted the bureau with the executive
7 director it would accomplish what
8 Commissioner O'Brien was saying in addition
9 to whether we put a time limit or not.

10 COMMISSIONER O'BRIEN: Without an
11 explicit reporting requirement, it doesn't
12 truly address the concern that I had in a
13 longer term in there being an issue. It's
14 not that I don't think IEB would have the
15 ability to make that judgment call
16 internally. It's just that there be an
17 outside window to it. So if there is
18 something endemic and indicative of a
19 problem, that comes back before the full
20 Commission. That's my concern.

21 MS. LILLIOS: And certainly if this
22 is put into place, the intention is for
23 that short period of time to have the
24 ability to use some experienced people from

1 other jurisdiction to get Springfield off
2 the ground. MGM is not incentivized to
3 extend that period. It's very expensive
4 for them. They're taking people away from
5 their full-time jobs. And on personal
6 reasons, it's a burden for people to be
7 here, you know, away from their homes for
8 any extended period of time.

9 So there is every expectation that
10 this will not extend for a lengthy period.
11 But, you know, the purpose is if -- and IEB
12 may be the one who identifies it, you know,
13 a certain area just needs a little more
14 time, little more expertise to be embedded
15 in there. Definitely if this gets, you
16 know, goes into the multiple months long
17 period, it would be emblematic of something
18 more problematic. And the way it's drafted
19 now, there is a requirement if it gets
20 extended beyond the 30 days that there be
21 training plans that have to be submitted
22 that are, you know, addressing this more
23 long-term issue.

24 So I get it, you know, definitely an

1 end date is an option. But I just wanted
2 to emphasize that, I think, all parties are
3 very geared towards streamlining that
4 period to be as efficient as possible and
5 ensuring readiness as quickly as possible.

6 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Just to
7 explain what happened at Plainridge,
8 Commissioner, there were some concerns in
9 the opening about certain staff members who
10 were not quite ready in a couple of areas.
11 And, so, as part of allowing them to open
12 on time, we made conditions that said you
13 must keep experienced staff on for we gave
14 them a time period, a month, 60 days, I
15 believe, I remember. So that was
16 something -- this alleviates that going
17 into an opening condition, correct?

18 MR. BAND: Right.

19 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Yeah, but I
20 don't think -- I share your concern
21 actually. The concern is not addressed.
22 It's gratifying to learn that everybody has
23 the best intentions and these are
24 professional people, but it doesn't address

1 the open-ended nature, which is the
2 fundamental concern. I would be fine
3 putting a comfortable date, six months. I
4 would imagine if it's six months, we have
5 something else in our hands. Simply saying
6 six months and have all the discretion
7 that's already embedded in the current
8 language to work things out so...

9 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Is that
10 comfortable?

11 MR. BAND: Yes. My main concern is
12 just not doing that announcement
13 publically. If it's notifying the
14 Commission and stuff, I'm fine with that.
15 It's the public.

16 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: The way this
17 reads it if we simply embedded a six-month
18 period, not to exceed six months, we would
19 probably accomplish a lot of what's being
20 discussed here.

21 COMMISSIONER O'BRIEN: That would
22 satisfy my concerns.

23 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: I should
24 mention, you know, I think six months is

1 more than comfortable. We are in a very
2 different position from when we opened
3 Plainridge. We have a central monitoring
4 system that our people are using very
5 comfortably and have been reconciling for a
6 couple of years now. There is a new
7 process granted with table games, and
8 that's an area to think about. But, I
9 think, that the universe of potential
10 topics to think about is greatly reduced
11 compared to Plainridge.

12 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: You know, I
13 appreciate the flexibility. I certainly
14 appreciate Commissioner O'Brien's point
15 about having an end date, but we're moving
16 into a different phase that is somewhat
17 different from Plainridge. We have one
18 licensee who has many more properties to
19 draw from, will draw in, several hundred as
20 we were hearing the other day. That
21 licensee also has a lot of local hiring
22 commitments that they need to keep.

23 You know, as it exists now, the
24 Boston licensee has fewer properties to

1 draw people from. So finding something
2 that gives us some balance give us some
3 flexibility but has some end dates in mind
4 knowing that each licensee comes at this at
5 a different approach. And, again our next
6 licensee has a bigger facility, more
7 operations, different types of operations
8 than Plainridge Park.

9 I'd like the idea of giving us some
10 flexibility to reopen it if we have to or
11 extending time based on some of the various
12 occupations. But looking out, the scenario
13 is going to be different with these next
14 two licensees as to what they're going to
15 need and how we are going to be able to
16 accomplish what some of their licensing
17 conditions are, so balancing flexibility
18 with some end dates but with the
19 opportunity to maybe extend those end dates
20 for extenuating circumstances.

21 COMMISSIONER O'BRIEN: Well, the end
22 date is keyed off the date of the
23 operation's certificate. Is that closing
24 time to when they would open to the clock

1 or the next licensee runs closer to when
2 they're opening?

3 MR. BEDROSIAN: Probably within a
4 week.

5 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: It sounds
6 like we're comfortable with six months.
7 Everyone thinks that's --

8 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: I'm fine with
9 the six months, inserting six month at
10 sunset provision here in this regulation.

11 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Subject to a
12 renewal for extenuating circumstances but
13 setting a target helps.

14 MS. BLUE: So we can do one of two
15 things. We can redraft it and bring it
16 back so you can see it, which might make
17 sense or you can approve it subject to the
18 addition of a six-month end date.

19 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: I think we
20 can approve. It's up to you. What do you
21 think?

22 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: I'm okay
23 with approving it.

24 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Subject to

1 that change.

2 COMMISSIONER O'BRIEN: To the
3 language for a period not to exceed six
4 months from the date of the operation's
5 certificate.

6 MS. LILLIOS: In fact, we're asking
7 for it to be approved by emergency today
8 just because we are starting to get real
9 close. And for planning purposes, I think
10 MGM would like to know that this is in
11 place.

12 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Do we have
13 that motion here?

14 MS. BLUE: So we have the motion.
15 The motion is not set up for an emergency
16 approval. But if you just add that in
17 there, I think that will be fine.

18 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: I will happy
19 to move, Chair, the Commission approve job
20 associate --

21 MS. BLUE: It has a small business
22 impact statement too with it, yes.

23 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: That the
24 Commission approve by emergency the Small

1 Business Impact Statement for the
2 amendments to 205 CMR1 134.03, the Gaming
3 Service Employee -- no.

4 MS. LILLIOS: That's correct.

5 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: 134.03, the
6 Gaming Service Employees as included in the
7 packet.

8 COMMISSIONER O'BRIEN: Second.

9 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Discussion?
10 Those in agreement? Aye.

11 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Aye.

12 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Aye.

13 COMMISSIONER O'BRIEN: Aye.

14 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: 4/0.

15 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Then I further
16 move that the Commission approve by
17 emergency the version of the amendments to
18 205 CMR 134.03 and to include a provision
19 that states at sunset provision of six
20 months from the date of the operating
21 certificates as discussed in the hearing
22 today and authorize the staff to take all
23 steps necessary to begin the regulation
24 promulgation process.

1 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Second.

2 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Discussion?

3 Those in agreement? Aye.

4 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Aye.

5 COMMISSIONER O'BRIEN: Aye.

6 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Aye.

7 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: 4/0, okay.

8 MS. BLUE: Thank you.

9 MR. BEDROSIAN: So I have good news,
10 and I don't know if it's bad news but I
11 have news, I guess. The agenda went a
12 little quicker than we anticipated.
13 Director Griffin is on her way back from a
14 morning event. And based on what we
15 thought was the timing, we told her and the
16 folks with her to be here at 1:00.

17 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: The good news
18 is we have one hour for lunch.

19 MR. BEDROSIAN: There you go. Thank
20 you. The glass is half full. We have one
21 hour for lunch, and we can either do
22 Commissioner updates at the end of the --

23 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: We have
24 racing next.

1 MR. BEDROSIAN: Here's the thing is
2 I actually went to get Alex to be here, and
3 I totally forgot about that. So we can do
4 that, and then you will know where we
5 stand.

6 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: That's fine.

7 MS. LIGHTBOWN: Good afternoon,
8 Commissioners.

9 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Good morning,
10 Doctor.

11 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Good
12 afternoon.

13 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Good
14 afternoon.

15 MS. LIGHTBOWN: Today on the agenda
16 we have the annual payments. It's by
17 statute 128A, Section 5H4, that \$65,000
18 annually is paid to an organization that is
19 determined to represent the majority of
20 jockeys. So this is something that we have
21 been doing routinely, and the Jockey Guild
22 is the organization that the money has gone
23 to. Every year I doublecheck the license
24 jockeys at Suffolk Downs against the

1 membership at the Jockey Guild to make sure
2 that is the group, and it is.

3 What they have done is with the
4 decreasing days of racing at Suffolk some
5 of their original requirements have
6 changed. So what they did last year was
7 they came forward with some changes for the
8 active rider qualifications, and Catherine
9 Blue and I looked at them and thought they
10 were reasonable and approved it. And then
11 this year they came back with some changes
12 to the retired jockeys.

13 And we just thought it probably
14 should be brought in front of the
15 Commission as an update and to see if there
16 were any concerns with it. Again, it looks
17 reasonable. It reflects the changes,
18 again, at Suffolk. I did get some delayed
19 information from them on the program. They
20 do give the total amount of the money out
21 every year. It's split between the jockeys
22 that apply for it.

23 The majority of those are active
24 jockeys and there's also a few retired ones

1 and a few permanently disabled jockeys.
2 And just some numbers from 2012, there were
3 27 active jockeys, two retired jockeys and
4 two permanently disabled that were given
5 the money for a total of 31. Up to 2016,
6 there were 17 active jockeys, three retired
7 and four permanently disabled for a total
8 of 24. So each year the total number of
9 jockeys has gone down a little bit, which I
10 think reflects the decreased racing of the
11 thoroughbreds.

12 So the amount per jockey, it's split
13 evenly among these jockeys and the amounts
14 vary from a little over 2,000 in 2012 to
15 around 2,700 in 2016. And what they do is
16 these are to be used for health care costs,
17 and they have the jockeys provide the
18 information to them that they have spent it
19 on these costs. Do you have any questions?

20 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: And, Director,
21 remind us, the amounts are set in statute;
22 is that correct?

23 MS. LIGHTBOWN: Yes.

24 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: In 128A,

1 Section 5H4 as you state here as included
2 here?

3 MS. LIGHTBOWN: Yes.

4 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: So the
5 variabilities and the number of people that
6 qualify from year to year or has there been
7 variability in these numbers by statute?
8 I'm just curios.

9 MS. LIGHTBOWN: It varies by who's
10 eligible.

11 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: So this
12 language was changed by the Jockey Guild.

13 MS. LIGHTBOWN: Right. They are the
14 ones who came up with the eligibility
15 requirements.

16 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: It's their
17 language. And it more accurately reflects
18 the racing environment right now in
19 Massachusetts.

20 MS. LIGHTBOWN: Right.

21 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: The language
22 is not to the statute. It's to their --

23 MS. LIGHTBOWN: The statute is very
24 general. It just says to give the money to

1 the group. These aren't part of our regs.
2 at all. It's what the Guild has come up
3 with what reflects -- they do these
4 programs all over the country, and they get
5 money from other sources obviously, too.
6 And, so, this is what works in their mind
7 for their jobs.

8 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: So this is
9 more of an FYI that the language has
10 changed. You're informing us of that.

11 MS. LIGHTBOWN: Right.

12 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: So it's
13 really on them if by changing their
14 eligibility, it increases the number or
15 decreases the number and change the payment
16 structure and everything else. We just
17 have a set amount that we hand them every
18 year to make their payments.

19 MS. LIGHTBOWN: Right.

20 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: All right.

21 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: I think there
22 is no vote needed. We appreciate the
23 information, and thank you for staying on
24 top of this issue.

1 MS. LIGHTBOWN: Thank you.

2 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Thank you.

3 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Thanks,
4 Alex.

5 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Why don't we
6 take a lunch break and be back at 1:00.
7 Very good.

8 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Sounds good.

9
10 (A recess was taken)

11
12 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Good
13 afternoon. We're going to resume our
14 public meeting and workforce development,
15 and I'm going to turn it over to Director
16 Jill Griffin.

17 MS. GRIFFIN: Good afternoon,
18 Commissioners.

19 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Good
20 afternoon.

21 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Good
22 afternoon.

23 MS. GRIFFIN: As you remember at
24 your last meeting in Springfield, we had

1 two grantees present to you from western
2 Massachusetts, the Hampden County Sheriff
3 and the Quaboag Valley CDC, and we have two
4 representatives -- two organizations here
5 today who received the grants to expand
6 economic access in the Commonwealth's new
7 casino industry. So I wanted to briefly
8 introduce them and have them briefly
9 describe their work, their organization and
10 how they intend to help residents connect
11 to opportunities at the casinos.

12 So first I have Lisa Wong, who is
13 Deputy Director of the Asian American Civic
14 Association and to her right is Ivy Mah,
15 who is the employment center coordinator
16 also with Asian American Civic Association.

17 MS. WONG: Well, thank you for
18 having us here today. We are so pleased to
19 be part of the expanded economic access
20 project. So what we're going to tell you a
21 little bit about Asian American Civic
22 Association our particular model and
23 approach, and then talk specifically about
24 what we are proposing to do in the next few

1 months.

2 So the Asian American Civic
3 Association has actually been around for
4 over 50 years. We're the oldest social
5 service agency in Chinatown. But since
6 then, we have grown innovative pretty
7 dramatically, especially in the workforce
8 and employment centers.

9 We're one of the first to offer
10 robust education services specifically for
11 Asian Americans, and we've expanded to
12 serve immigrants and we now serve
13 immigrants from over 125 different
14 countries. And we also have recently
15 worked with economically disadvantaged
16 individuals and families from the greater
17 Boston area. So our services are seeing a
18 lot of greater demand.

19 So we have developed a continuum of
20 care model where essentially somebody comes
21 in at any point of the economic spectrum,
22 and we have services and referral
23 assistance to help them out. So what's
24 really great about our model is that we

1 have many long time staff who have been in
2 the community for a number of years. So we
3 have built up a lot of trust. So we see
4 that individuals will come to us for one
5 particular reason or the other, and we
6 provide robust social services.

7 We have long been led by a lot of
8 social workers who really have that
9 wraparound approach everything from food
10 and housing to any kind of social or health
11 services that they need, we will help to
12 provide or to refer them.

13 But we also have really robust
14 education workforce development programs.
15 So individuals that are coming in, our hope
16 is not just to help them with what they
17 need at the moment but to help them achieve
18 economic self-sufficiency. Sort of really
19 work with them over a number of years to
20 get better living conditions for them and
21 their family and a better social economic
22 standing.

23 So along those lines, we actually
24 have a very well-recognized education

1 program that not only teaches elementary
2 English but also teaches English up to the
3 point where we are sending people to
4 colleges and careers. And of the 86
5 community-based organizations funded by the
6 Department of Elementary and Secondary
7 Education, we have ranked number one in the
8 past four years for sending students to
9 college. So, again, through a very long
10 reputation.

11 We also have expanded and developed
12 about a dozen other programs that I'm not
13 going to get into, but a number of these
14 programs we have integrated into our grant
15 application and we will utilize these
16 programs to help bring these economic
17 possibilities that the casino will provide
18 to immigrants, women, Asian-American
19 community and economically disadvantaged
20 individuals and families in the greater
21 Boston area.

22 So our approach specifically in this
23 grant objective is to help connect a lot of
24 people in this area to the economic

1 opportunities that are available at the
2 casino. Again, targeting low income,
3 targeting immigrants, women, minorities and
4 so on. We have a number of different ways
5 that we do this, and our employment
6 specialist will talk about that.

7 But what's really great is that we
8 can help people at any level of readiness
9 to achieve economic success when it comes
10 to area jobs, including casinos. So if
11 they need help improving their English, we
12 can provide that. If they need specific
13 job training skills, we can do that as
14 well. If they need temporary or permanent
15 housing or other ways to stabilize their
16 life situation, we can help them with that.

17 We have a very robust outreach
18 program, and we have a number of
19 community-based partners. So we have a lot
20 of folks that we can access because of our
21 longstanding in the community and because
22 of the trust and relationships we built.

23 So we will do a lot of robust
24 outreach to communities that might not

1 normally know about the opportunities of
2 the casino. And then once we bring them
3 in, there is a whole myriad of services
4 that we have, including job fairs, job
5 readiness programs, placing them into
6 short-term and long-term training programs
7 and so on.

8 What also makes us very unique is
9 that we have some very specialized
10 programs. So, for example, we have a
11 program called the Moulan Society that
12 focuses on immigrant women, and we really
13 help them with everything from English, job
14 training, immigration services, and we help
15 them achieve great careers. So this is one
16 of the programs that we have where we will
17 help these women access jobs at the
18 casinos.

19 We also have a very unique program,
20 and we don't know if anybody else offers
21 this because we haven't found it, where we
22 target highly educated immigrants. So
23 imagine you're a heart surgeon who is
24 driving an Uber. We have a program

1 specifically designed for highly educated
2 immigrants who have some sort of barrier to
3 employment here, and they are vastly
4 underemployed. It could be credentialing.
5 It could be a little bit of a language
6 barrier. It could be confidence. It could
7 be some other stabilizing that they need in
8 terms of needing a quick job to get a wage,
9 but we have a specific program we run for
10 three years designed to work with this --
11 to find and work with this community.

12 And we believe that these are
13 individuals -- we've seen them placed in
14 hospitals, IT, human resources. So we
15 think about the myriad of jobs available at
16 the casinos. We could definitely connect a
17 lot of highly professional individuals who
18 want to get out of a low-wage job and into
19 a meaningful career.

20 So with that, I'm going to turn it
21 over to Ivy Mah, who is our employment
22 specialist.

23 MS. MAH: Hi, everyone. This is
24 Ivy, and I'm an employment standard

1 coordinator at AACCA. So on October 20,
2 2016, the first time AACCA partnered with
3 Encore Boston Harbor to host an information
4 section. In two hours, we have more than
5 200 people attend that information section,
6 which was a great success.

7 And since then, AACCA employment
8 center has continued to work with the
9 interested candidates per screening resume
10 and their qualifications or we refer them
11 to different English training program,
12 computer school training program, also the
13 service of benefit program for those people
14 in need.

15 So I'm so glad we got this grant.
16 And by using this work grant, we are
17 focused on three different things. First,
18 will be the hours. We targeting Everett
19 and the surrounding area or the surrounding
20 community for promoting and increase the
21 awareness of job opportunities. AACCA has a
22 big connection with community-based
23 organization around the greater Boston area
24 such as ABCD Bridge Over Trouble Water,

1 greater modern Asian American Community
2 Coalition, Greater Boston YMCA. They do
3 all have different kind of job training
4 programs for those like talented candidate
5 who is ready for the casino job.

6 And we will also use our social
7 media ways. We'll share all the job
8 information through our own newspaper, as
9 well other community-based social media.
10 We will also share all the information
11 through our e-mail list in our database.

12 So the second thing is we will
13 organize and also hosting workshop and job
14 fair at our agency and partner with the
15 casinos. We are going to make the
16 workshops, for example, for application and
17 resume support workshop. And we will have
18 a mock interview workshop, which we will
19 probably invite those specialists in
20 different field from, for example, casino
21 or different field in different industry,
22 and they will come over to our agency and
23 to do some formal or professional more
24 interview. And, also, we will make some

1 workshop for specific different job areas.
2 For example, customer service field,
3 facility IT, finance and hospitality, which
4 relay to all different area in the casino.

5 We are going to make information --
6 career information section at the agency as
7 well, which is for our internal student for
8 people for difference community-based
9 organization, and also for the walking
10 crimes. The surfing we will recommend
11 demographic information by using our data
12 system and for the defining the success
13 through the crime checking system as well.
14 So this is what we are trying to do for the
15 upcoming two months. Thank you.

16 MS. GRIFFIN: Any questions,
17 Commissioners?

18 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Did I hear
19 you say that you have a piece of your
20 training on confidence building; is that
21 right? That's interesting. I hadn't heard
22 that before. So you just train people how
23 to go in and interview and be more
24 confident about being able to do the job?

1 MS. MAH: Yes.

2 MS. WONG: We do it through
3 classroom assistance, but we also -- Ivy
4 mentioned mock interviews. We will
5 actually bring our students into our
6 partner agencies where they have to
7 practice dressing up and actually going
8 through mock interviews. But what's great
9 is they get feedback afterwards, so
10 practice makes perfect.

11 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Great.

12 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: It occurs to
13 me that, if they haven't already, the
14 licensee in Everett, the Encore, would be
15 very interested in some of the population
16 that you service not just with Asian or
17 language different -- a diversity of
18 language backgrounds but also the other
19 problem that you have relative to high
20 skill.

21 Given their approach or their model,
22 they are expecting a number of -- they are
23 expecting to attract a number of
24 international players, some of them Asian,

1 and that's a big focus of their business
2 model. And I know that these would be of
3 great interest to them, to those
4 populations that you mentioned. So, I
5 think, it's very exciting to hear about the
6 work that you do.

7 MS. GRIFFIN: Any other questions?

8 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: No, thank
9 you. Keep up the good work.

10 MS. GRIFFIN: Thank you so much.
11 We've spoken informally about the potential
12 of the Gaming Commission participating in
13 these mock interviews, so I will keep you
14 posted.

15 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Can we take
16 those?

17 MS. WONG: Thank you so much.

18 MS. GRIFFIN: And I also have
19 invited Gladys Vega who is here from the
20 Chelsea Collaborative. I'm going to invite
21 her up to the mic. The Chelsea
22 Collaborative has partnered with another
23 organization in Everett called La
24 Comunidad, so Gladys is representing both

1 organizations today. Unfortunately,
2 Antonio Amaya, something has come up and he
3 wasn't able to make it here.

4 MS. VEGA: Gracias. Buenas tardes.
5 My name is Gladys Vega. I am the executive
6 director of the Chelsea Collaboration. I
7 am delighted to be here, and I am delighted
8 to see the role that you have played in
9 this process that is so new to people in
10 this Commonwealth.

11 I just want to add that in the role
12 that we would be playing in terms of
13 Everett and Chelsea it would be pretty much
14 to diversify our workforce. We have an
15 organization at Chelsea. So, first, we
16 created La Comunidad in Everett. We were
17 that incubator model that created La
18 Comunidad, because there was not a Latino
19 led organization in the City of Everett.
20 And many of our families were moving to
21 Lynn, to east Boston or Everett.

22 So when that opportunity came about,
23 we gave them a little bit of funding and
24 created a board of directors so they would

1 have their own organization, and that's how
2 La Comunidad was created by our
3 organization.

4 The Chelsea Collaborative has a
5 history of creating new programs. One of
6 the programs that we created was a year
7 round employment program amongst youth, and
8 it was basically youth from the age of 14
9 to when they were champion youth to the age
10 of 23, and 23 champion youth would be
11 children that society may not give them a
12 chance because they were youth with
13 disability, and we gave an opportunity and
14 we had to sort of like focus on hard skills
15 and subskills.

16 So what we are been thinking about
17 doing and what we have been doing in the
18 past three years more is focusing on
19 adults. Our youth have been able to find
20 jobs. We have eleven young people that are
21 in the police department, and seven of them
22 in the fire department. We have youth that
23 are in the aquarium, but we employ
24 approximately 250 young people.

1 When they turn 18, our hope is to
2 track down that whole database system that
3 we have on them and do these fairs and
4 inviting people back to the city. If they
5 still live in Chelsea, invite them to join
6 and to create their portfolios. I mean,
7 many of these young people are now adults.
8 Many of them have other jobs, and many of
9 them can be like that the most amazing
10 candidates for, you know, a job at the
11 casino.

12 We are working in terms of the
13 workforce type of training that we are
14 doing, we are doing ESL. We are making
15 sure that those people that have the
16 potential to be legal residents, we are
17 doing all of their immigration
18 documentation work. We have that system in
19 the Chelsea Collaborative. We also are
20 providing computer classes and very
21 detailed computer classes allow them to be
22 able to sort of like do the whole smart
23 skills program that the casinos is having,
24 because we know they have to go through the

1 whole process.

2 But in addition to that, we're
3 incorporating a lot of the faces that we're
4 using -- that we would use for the youth,
5 like create a resume, how to interview for
6 success, how to dress for success.

7 Everything that we use for those young
8 folks, we're using it for adults. Because
9 at times many of our folks come from
10 countries where they had a profession.
11 They don't have it over here. And once
12 they are able to speak English and be able
13 to sort of like apply for these jobs, we
14 want them to be ready to do so.

15 The Chelsea Collaborative is the
16 Latino -- the only Latino lead organization
17 in the City of Chelsea. We have been doing
18 youth employment for the past 20 years.
19 It's our time now to move into workforce
20 development in a very sophisticated way.
21 Because the way we see it is that our
22 families come through our door, we identify
23 their need and we provide wraparound
24 services, including like if you are ready

1 to go back to work after being a mom for,
2 you know, a couple of years at home, now
3 what do you need to do in terms of day
4 care. Where do you place your kids in day
5 care that is reliable so that you can have
6 a job where you are not missing work.

7 So we begin -- we have, for the
8 youth, we have a portfolio of 195 pages
9 that they have to go through by the end of
10 the eight week program. For the adult,
11 that's pretty similar to what we're
12 planning to do. We are using signally for
13 success for curriculum so that they are
14 able to basically -- when they go through
15 our program, that they are able to complete
16 a program and be able to apply for a job
17 without being shy about it, without being
18 como se conscious about their skills, that
19 they are very, very secure when they are
20 doing this type of interviews.

21 I think that one of the things we
22 want to be able to see is that when we walk
23 into the casino we want to see the faces of
24 the community where the casino is. Like we

1 want to make sure that the workforce is not
2 blocked from so much outside, because
3 there's a world of skills in Massachusetts,
4 and our people should be getting those
5 jobs. So that's what we're aiming.

6 We have done a lot of fairs in the
7 construction phase of the casino. My
8 organization has been involved in the past
9 five years with the unions to make sure
10 that a lot of people got those jobs back
11 then, but now we are like very involved and
12 want to continue to be involved in making
13 sure that Everett as a community that's so
14 impacted by the casino that those folks get
15 their jobs, they get the skills that they
16 need. And we have pretty much I say like
17 nine months to prep our groups and stuff to
18 make sure they are completely ready and
19 rapidly available for success.

20 So that's our hope. Our hope is
21 that between the two communities we
22 continue to work together to make sure that
23 our folks are ready to go and they are
24 hireable and their jobs are right in their

1 neighborhoods rather than traveling to
2 Boston and spending money on gas, parking
3 and all that that they can literally walk
4 to the casino and have a job that pays
5 well, that gives them opportunity and also
6 to be promoted. There is not many places
7 where you work that you can see yourself in
8 another position. The casino offers that,
9 and that's why we're delighted of this
10 opportunity.

11 So muchas gracias, thank you for
12 funding our project. Thank you for having
13 me. If you have any questions, feel free
14 to ask me.

15 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Thank you for
16 those remarks. Could you speak a little
17 bit to some of the successes that you've
18 had in the construction phase? You
19 mentioned them briefly.

20 MS. VEGA: So in the construction
21 phase, it was very hard for the carpenters
22 to think about in the casino -- when the
23 casino came on board, right, we worked very
24 closely with the carpenter's union. We

1 created a Latino group for the carpenter's
2 union, because we felt that a lot of people
3 at that time were not really employed.
4 There were a lot of people that were --
5 five years ago we didn't have that much
6 development going on as much as now.

7 So we wanted to make sure that the
8 people that were in the apprentice programs
9 that we got from Chelsea, Everett and
10 Boston, because we also did Boston, they
11 would immediately be going through the
12 training with the carpenter's union so they
13 would hire. So the carpenter's union hired
14 newer -- new carpenters that immediately
15 were in the apprentice program. They
16 graduated, they hired them and they placed
17 them at the casino.

18 The only thing that happened was
19 that not many people came from Everett and
20 Chelsea, and that was our big criticism.
21 That we helped them recruit large Latinos
22 but not all the Latinos that got to the --
23 which is okay, because it was still a very
24 diverse force. So I was extremely

1 satisfied because if people of color were
2 getting jobs and they were getting the
3 skills needed to do their jobs.

4 So on that one I would say that if
5 there is any lesson learned from that one,
6 that is why I am here from the -- because
7 we didn't get to hire as many people as we
8 wanted from Everett and Chelsea in the
9 carpenter's union, in particular.

10 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Well, I know
11 that's also a focus of this Commission and
12 the licensees importantly. They have this
13 very strict goals relative to local hiring,
14 and these are important commitments. So
15 we're all watching. And by all means,
16 we're watching the efforts in upstream, as
17 they say, not just in the results. So
18 thank you for that.

19 MS. VEGA: And once again, we're
20 grateful that you're keeping full oversight
21 over it, and we're delighted that we have a
22 company that is providing jobs in
23 Massachusetts because many other companies
24 are leaving. So it's very important that

1 these jobs remain for Chelsea and for
2 Everett and for the six communities
3 impacted by the casino, so muchas gracias.

4 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: I think it's
5 exciting that both you and the AACA have
6 focused in on this interview preparation.
7 We hear constantly from our licensees. It
8 somewhat does not matter the skills and the
9 work experience that you're bringing with
10 you. They are looking for somebody who is
11 in front of them that makes eye contact,
12 smiles. It's the hospitality business.
13 It's their presentation. So I applaud both
14 of you for thinking about that and being
15 proactive and trying to make sure that your
16 residents are best prepared for the crucial
17 interview when it happens.

18 MS. VEGA: Thank you.

19 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: We just
20 talked about confidence. Is that with the
21 interview prep, is that part of what you do
22 so people can visualize themselves in one
23 of these jobs?

24 MS. VEGA: Yes. So, for example,

1 when we do the summer youth employment
2 program, imagine hiring a 14 year-old. So
3 in Chelsea those jobs were basically, with
4 all due respect, at times used to go for
5 the politicians' sons. There was not a
6 process. There was not a lottery. We do a
7 lottery. We begin -- kids apply, 700 of
8 them. We put all the 14 year-olds that
9 have never worked before in the lottery,
10 and we pull as many of those.

11 We still have the chief of the
12 police interviewing them, the
13 superintendent of the school and one of my
14 staff. And the only reason we do that is
15 because they have to think that this is
16 their first experience, and that is where
17 they get the best skills in terms of their
18 good characteristic of a good skills and
19 good habits beginning your first job.

20 If you don't show up on time to a
21 job and stuff, you're creating habits that
22 may not help in the future. So although
23 they are only 14 years old, we give them
24 one break and then there's consequences and

1 they need to learn that. So the whole idea
2 of us is doing the same with our adults.

3 They are going to be sort of like
4 interviews, and they are going to be able
5 to sort of like pretend that they are in a
6 setting. And if they want this job and
7 they really need it, they have to go
8 through the process. It's part of that
9 hoping they have to feel very secure about
10 interviewing for success. If they want to
11 aim for that, we've got to teach them and
12 we are in the business of doing that.

13 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Thank you.

14 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Thank you.

15 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Thank you
16 very much.

17 MS. GRIFFIN: Just to summarize, we
18 were able to give six grants totaling in
19 just under \$7,500, and these are modest
20 grants to be used for the end of this
21 fiscal year. But you can see the impact
22 that this program will have, and we do plan
23 pending availability of funds to reissue an
24 RFP for next fiscal year.

1 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Have we --
2 when will the guidelines for the Community
3 Mitigation Fund come before us again?

4 MS. BLUE: So the guidelines for the
5 next year?

6 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: For the next
7 year.

8 MS. BLUE: They will come in the
9 fall. The idea is generally we get you to
10 approve them before December of the end of
11 the year. So around the time we finish
12 giving out all the awards, we start
13 drafting the guidelines again and we bring
14 them before you a couple of times.

15 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Right.
16 Because I think we -- the approach we have
17 done before in terms of funding certain
18 workforce development grants out of the
19 mitigation fund worked great. They were in
20 the notion of a pilot program. They were,
21 you know, greater than this but small in
22 terms of the number of recipients. One of
23 the things that we ought to consider is,
24 you know, expanding that effort towards

1 more of these smaller but wide arranging
2 efforts that could also have a very
3 important impact.

4 MS. GRIFFIN: As you know, the
5 Community Mitigation fund applicant needs
6 to be a government entity. But, I think,
7 there is a way to perhaps encourage
8 collaboration with the government entity
9 and some of these more grassroot
10 organizations.

11 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Yes. I
12 think we've seen that this year. There was
13 a lot of collaboration and partnership to
14 kind of leverage assistance and resources.

15 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Very good.
16 Great story.

17 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Thank you,
18 Director, for bringing forth some of the
19 grant recipients and love their passion and
20 dedication.

21 MS. GRIFFIN: Thank you.

22 MR. BEDROSIAN: Madam Chair, before
23 you go to Commissioner updates, if I could
24 just circle back to my administrative

1 general update. There's an anticipated
2 item I have, which is we didn't anticipate
3 the senate coming out with their budget and
4 then scheduling their process quickly, in
5 fact, before we have the next public
6 meeting.

7 In the past, the Commission has
8 delegated, I think, unofficially to the
9 chair, Chairman Crosby, the responsibility
10 of communicating with the legislation, and
11 there are a number of items in the senate's
12 ways and means budget about horseracing
13 that we probably will want to have some
14 communication with the legislature on.

15 So I'm just going to suggest in his
16 absence, I don't think this will be a big
17 surprise, that Chairman Crosby, and I think
18 we are all sort of on the same page about
19 the Racehorse Development Fund,
20 communicate, if necessary, with the
21 legislature in the next couple of weeks
22 because that would happen, as I said,
23 before our next public meeting.

24 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: So you're

1 asking that Chairman Crosby have the
2 authority to go and --

3 MR. BEDROSIAN: Yes, and continue as
4 we have in the past. I'm not going to ask
5 for a formal vote. We didn't put this in
6 the agenda. It was an unanticipated item.
7 I think we sort of operated that way in the
8 past. So, I guess, if there is no major
9 objection, I would just suggest to him he
10 operate in that fashion.

11 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: I agree. I
12 mean, I am operating under the notion that
13 we have already done that and anything that
14 came up he would be the go-to person --

15 MR. BEDROSIAN: I think we have.
16 It's just now we had the macro level. Now
17 we have the micro of particular amendments,
18 which may not pass, by the way. They may
19 or may not. But I suspect they will say,
20 Gaming Commission, how do you feel about
21 this racing amendment?

22 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: I agree.
23 That's totally appropriate and probably
24 necessary within the next couple of weeks.

1 MR. BEDROSIAN: Thank you. I am
2 done.

3 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Thank you.
4 Do we have any Commissioner updates?

5 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Yes, I have
6 two. Ed, our executive director,
7 referenced of those already. We did have
8 the opportunity on Tuesday to go out to
9 Springfield and see the first of many Mass.
10 hiring events that MGM hosting. It's an
11 interesting process, as we've been talking
12 about interviewing and kind of getting
13 through the process of a job candidate.
14 But they were giving interview blocks every
15 hour. Sometimes the applicant would have
16 the opportunity to pick what time slot they
17 wanted so it could fit with their work
18 schedule.

19 They start off with a very upbeat
20 welcome, show the ad you've probably seen
21 on TV with the thundering drums, and then
22 you were taken out with your counterparts
23 interviewing for the various job groupings
24 via be it cage, be it security, be it food

1 and beverage.

2 They go through interviews. If they
3 complete that step, they go to meet with
4 some members of the executive team. If
5 they get past that step, they go upstairs.
6 They fill out some paperwork. They get a
7 job offer. They get drug testing, and then
8 they go into what's called a celebration
9 room, which has a DJ. Ed did a little
10 dancing, candy, sign a banner, take a
11 picture to get your employment news out to
12 your friends via social media.

13 So they were hoping, I think, at the
14 end, correct me if I'm wrong, at the end of
15 Tuesday hopefully walk away with three to
16 four hundred job offers being made for any
17 number of positions. 40 percent of the
18 folks that were coming that day were all
19 Springfield residents. If for some reason
20 you missed your time slot or missed your
21 appointment, you were getting a follow-up
22 call from MGM, especially to Springfield
23 residents because of the priority placed on
24 local hiring to say, hey, we missed you.

1 Where were you? Make sure you get into
2 another time slot.

3 And, obviously, MGM, for people that
4 didn't make it all the way through the
5 process, they are encouraged to go back and
6 look at the job's compendium and think
7 about other job positions they might be
8 interested in. Some might need a little
9 bit of training to get them over that next
10 hurdle.

11 But all in all, it was a good day.
12 It was an interesting process. We saw some
13 of the food and beverage talent having to
14 go through slicing up an onion. I realized
15 I have been doing it wrong all these years.
16 It was interesting to see a job interview
17 location with a big 50-pound of onions
18 waiting to get sliced and diced.

19 But, overall, I think the MGM team
20 was happy with kind of how the first Mass.
21 hiring event went. They have others
22 scheduled over the next couple of months.
23 July will be a big, big one. But, overall,
24 I think it went well.

1 MR. BEDROSIAN: And, I think, this
2 was, relatively speaking, this was a
3 moderate sized one. So they're really
4 gearing up for the ones where they have
5 thousands of people coming through in, you
6 know, three or four days.

7 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: How long does
8 it take for somebody to make it through the
9 process? It occurs to me that it's an
10 assembly style. They get different groups
11 through the different --

12 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: It's about
13 two hours to complete the whole cycle if
14 you're going all the way through to the
15 end.

16 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Does that
17 included your time in the celebration room?

18 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: You know, it
19 could be extended if you want to hang out
20 there a little bit longer. It's great to
21 see MGM team members kind of located
22 throughout. As we came up the escalator,
23 they were told to cheer who came up the
24 escalator. Had they known it was us, they

1 might have had a different approach.

2 MR. BEDROSIAN: I thought I heard a
3 slight hiss, but I think that was me not
4 you.

5 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: But it was
6 great. One other note, we also had an
7 access and opportunity committee meeting
8 out in Springfield as construction work
9 comes to an end in Springfield. But there
10 was an interesting number that got thrown
11 out during MGM's presentation, and that was
12 the number 400.

13 They have had over 400 apprentices
14 in the building trades working on the MGM
15 project, which to me was mind blowing.
16 And, you know, certainly shows both MGM and
17 their contractor's commitment to engage
18 diversity and engage people that might be
19 new to the construction career, but it's
20 also a shout-out to the building trades to
21 making sure that their apprentices was part
22 of the profit. So it was another one good
23 news story.

24 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Is there a way

1 to find out eventually how many of those
2 apprentices associated with MGM, MGM
3 construction end up being journey people,
4 journeymen or journeywomen or whatever?

5 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: I think it's
6 certainly data we could drill into and see
7 what -- as MGM always reminds us, we're
8 running a little bit out of leverage in
9 terms of what we ask as the project winds
10 down. I think there's a way to go back and
11 try to get that maybe building trade by
12 building trade. I think that would be, to
13 your point, another good success story.

14 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Absolutely.

15 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Thanks.
16 Great report. Anything else?

17 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: I'll just say
18 real briefly that Mark and I, Director
19 Vander Linden met the mitigation from Japan
20 in the last conference that we attended who
21 is now interested in coming to see
22 Massachusetts. These people are the ones
23 at the forefront of responsible gaming
24 equivalent to council on problem gaming

1 equivalent in Japan and are very much
2 interested in learning -- they have learned
3 quite a bit about PlayMyWay, GameSense and
4 the responsible gaming framework that we
5 were just talking about here today.

6 I think there they are following --
7 we correspond with them over e-mail, and
8 we've noticed similarities in our approach
9 in terms of learning as much as they can
10 prior to the actual licensing or
11 construction of the integrated resorts over
12 there about practices elsewhere.

13 And the good news in my view is that
14 we are recognized -- we continue to be
15 recognized as in the United States
16 pushing -- those pushing the envelope a
17 little bit in the area of responsible
18 gaming in terms of the initiatives that we
19 have like PlayMyWay, which continues to get
20 a lot of traction and interest from other
21 jurisdictions. So they will be coming
22 here, and we might be able to actually --
23 some of you might be able to meet them.

24 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: That's great.

1 Look forward to that. Conferences that
2 I've attended both internationally and in
3 the United States that's always a topic
4 that people want to talk to me about as
5 well, so we do have that reputation as
6 being in the forefront. And that's always
7 nice to be able to talk about our programs.

8 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Well, we had
9 either consultants or the Japanese
10 government to come here to learn about our
11 licensing process. That's stepping up the
12 statute and giving local control. So we,
13 to Commissioner Zuniga's point, have been a
14 role model in more than one piece of our
15 work.

16 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Anything
17 else? Do we have a motion?

18 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Second.

19 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: We are
20 officially adjourned. Thank you.

21
22 (Meeting adjourned at 1:40 p.m.)
23
24

MASSACHUSETTS GAMING COMMISSION STAFF:

Catherine Blue, General Counsel

Edward Bedrosian, Executive Director

Michael Sangalang, Digital Communications

Coordinator

Jill Griffin, Director of Workforce, Supplier and

Diversity Development

Alexandria Lightbown, Director of Chief

Veterinarian

Bruce Band

Loretta Lillios, Staff Attorney

Paul Connelly, Director of Licensing

Mark Vander Linden, Director of Research and

Responsible Gaming

UNIVERSITY OF MASSACHUSETTS SEIGMA TEAM:

Rachel Volberg, SEIGMA Co-Principal Investigator

Mark W. Nichols, SEIGMA Researcher

Valerie Evans, Biostatistician, SEIGMA Project

Zhenning Kang, SEIGMA

1 APPEARANCES (Continued):

2
3 GUEST SPEAKERS:

4 Lisa Wong, Asian American Civic Association

5 Ivy Mah, Asian American Civic Association

6 Gladys Vega, Chelsea Collaborative

7 Kimberly Dixon, Plainridge Park Casino

8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS

I, KRISTEN M. EDWARDS, COURT REPORTER,
do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true and
accurate transcription of my stenographic notes,
to the best of my knowledge and ability.

WITNESS MY HAND, this 18th day of May,
2018.

Kristen M. Edwards