

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS
MASSACHUSETTS GAMING COMMISSION
PUBLIC MEETING #237

CHAIRMAN

Stephen P. Crosby

COMMISSIONERS

- Lloyd Macdonald
- Gayle Cameron
- Bruce W. Stebbins
- Enrique Zuniga

March 1, 2018 10:02 a.m.

MASSACHUSETTS GAMING COMMISSION
101 Federal Street, 12th Floor
Boston, Massachusetts 02110

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

P R O C E E D I N G

CHAIRMAN CROSBY: We are calling to order public meeting No. 237 of the Massachusetts Gaming Commission Thursday, March 1st at our offices in Boston about 10 o'clock in the morning. And we have Commissioner Macdonald calling in from afar. Commissioner Macdonald, can you hear us okay?

COMMISSIONER MACDONALD: I can.

CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Okay. And we can hear you fine, too. So because we have one member remote, we will have our votes by role call. Are you prepared to -- oh, we're not doing minutes this yet -- this week. Since we had a meeting last week, we don't have our minutes prepared yet. We'll catch up at our next meeting in two weeks. And we will go first to Item No. 2, Administrative Update, Executive Director Bedrosian.

MR. BEDROSIAN: Good morning, Commissioners.

CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Good morning.

COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Good morning.

1 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Good morning.

2 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Good
3 morning.

4 MR. BEDROSIAN: My general update
5 will be, I guess, inclusive of Item B, which
6 is really MGM opening update, and I want to
7 describe to you what our preparations would
8 be. But I will tell you, at the next meeting,
9 which we anticipate will be in two weeks,
10 Mike Mathis and I anticipate coming before the
11 commission and giving you a dual update on
12 what's happening.

13 So as we prepare our preparations, I
14 look at our preparation in terms of four
15 distinct buckets. The first bucket is MGM's
16 requirement to satisfy all the conditions
17 necessary for a gaming operation certificate.
18 And in that preparations, what is happened is
19 they continue to submit their internal
20 controls, we continue, as you know, and I
21 don't know if we have -- well, we don't have
22 any today, but you've seen a lot of
23 regulations that we're updating. They have
24 made security and surveillance submissions,

1 their table and slot game submissions. We are
2 working on the time frame in which they would
3 submit their gaming beverage license.

4 As you know, and I think -- I don't
5 know if Commissioner Stebbins went, but we
6 had -- the gaming school was opened last week,
7 on February 26th. We had some of our gaming
8 agents there, MGM had some of their trainers
9 there, so we are also on top of that.

10 Our gaming technology is getting
11 ready. The floor as we understand, the gaming
12 floor at MGM is almost done, and they could
13 take delivery of slot machines as early as
14 April, so we're preparing for that. And,
15 obviously, a big one that the Commission
16 tackled last week was licensing, SER
17 exemptions. That will go a long way towards
18 letting us prepare for what that tsunami will
19 be or won't be, and the collateral
20 implications on the research side of still
21 trying to capture the people who no longer
22 register with us, but capture them for
23 research purposes. So we have a lot going on
24 there. So that's on --

1 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: You might explain
2 that again, just to make sure people
3 understand what you're referring to.

4 MR. BEDROSIAN: And I might not do
5 it as well. I suggest you'll fill in where I
6 miss. But, you know, one of the research
7 items we're doing is trying to find out who is
8 employed in the industry, and who came from
9 either being unemployed or underemployed. And
10 the only way we can do that, obviously, is to
11 have that direct connection, get that
12 information from the person. That's easier to
13 do, when they're going through their licensing
14 or registration process with us.

15 Since these -- the good news is,
16 these people will be exempt from that for the
17 reasons that we've talked about for a long
18 time. The more challenging news is we lose
19 that direct connection to the person. But we
20 will figure out a way. We're are working with
21 MGM, and they're being very helpful for us to
22 fill that gap.

23 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Great. Okay.
24 Good.

1 MR. BEDROSIAN: So that's the first
2 bucket, what I call the operation certificate.
3 Second bucket is, even if we give 'em an
4 operations certificate, we, as a gaming
5 commission, have to be ready to regulate them,
6 so that's our internal stuff. And that I then
7 break down to two different subcategories.
8 One is the public-facing aspect of that, which
9 is we have to hire gaming agents, and we have
10 to have our gaming enforcement unit, which
11 consists of the state police and the
12 Springfield police together, ready to regulate
13 and do what we need to do to facilitate.
14 That's the public-facing side.

15 Mr. Band, our HR folks have been
16 great. They've actually had a number of
17 public events, which people who are interested
18 be gaming agents came and learned about what
19 it was. We've gone through a lot of
20 interviews. We're starting to hire our gaming
21 agents in anticipation of getting them on
22 board sometime in May for training. We'll get
23 a mix of people who have never been in the
24 industry and a mix of people who have been in

1 the industry, but they'll still need to go
2 through a training program. And we're still
3 working -- I think we're very close to,
4 hopefully, getting our MOU done on the gaming
5 enforcement unit. And, in addition, those
6 troopers who had joined us and Springfield
7 police officers would go through the same type
8 of training just on, you know, what gaming's
9 all about, what games are all about so they
10 understand that lingo, also.

11 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Do you know the
12 GameSense time -- adviser time?

13 MR. BEDROSIAN: Yeah. So there's my
14 third -- on the public-facing aspect there's
15 the GameSense aspect, too. We're working with
16 the Mass council on that, in terms of what
17 their numbers are, how they're reimbursed.
18 That's not directly -- they're not our FTEs,
19 but they're certainly people we need to have
20 ready. And we're working with Marlene in -- I
21 think I heard, and I don't want to speak, but
22 their anticipation is hiring up in June or
23 July so...

24 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Okay.

1 MR. BEDROSIAN: So that's, sort of,
2 the public-facing aspect of us getting ready
3 at the MGC. The what I call our version of
4 back of house is here. At the Boston office
5 we need a little more support for what's
6 happening.

7 Derek is working on his revenue
8 folks and making sure he has the appropriate
9 revenue folks. A new person would be a
10 revenue person for table games. We haven't
11 had to deal, obviously, with table games yet,
12 because they're just not in our foray yet, so
13 we are doing that. Our HR requirements are
14 growing so we're helping Trupti get the next
15 HR staff in.

16 I've also started a conversation
17 with Commissioner Zuniga, which I'll continue
18 with the rest of the commissioners
19 individually on some of the other risks we're
20 seeing at the Commission, and maybe some IT
21 staff we might want to add. But I will
22 individually talk to you. I anticipate coming
23 back in front of the Commission with a
24 recommendation on that sometime this month.

1 And then, the sort of nonexciting
2 things but necessary things, is getting the
3 office open out in Springfield, at the
4 facility. We have, you know, plenty of space
5 but we need to get copiers and technology, and
6 all the things that require an office to be
7 run. So Janice is working diligently on that
8 with our gaming agents, who are Angela Smith,
9 who's going to be our lead gaming agent, who's
10 actually out there doing work on a daily
11 basis, so we're doing that. So that's the
12 second category.

13 The third category is a big one,
14 which I think you'll hear a lot more about
15 this month, is assuring that all the license,
16 host and surrounding community, and Section 61
17 commitments are being dealt with
18 appropriately. We're very fortunate
19 Ombudsman Ziemba and Construction Manager
20 Delaney have spent a lot of time working on
21 this. I think they -- I anticipate them
22 coming before the Commission and making
23 sure -- and part of that is diversity hiring,
24 hiring commitments, coming before the

1 Commission with a presentation on that later
2 this month. The final bucket -- so that's the
3 third bucket.

4 The final bucket is, we also
5 continue to work with the City of Springfield.
6 We have a couple of corollary interests. They
7 have commitments under their host community
8 agreement that we also enforce through our
9 license, so we want to make sure we're on the
10 same page about whether the commitments have
11 been met or not.

12 And then, secondly, just general
13 public safety. How we going to ensure -- you
14 know, we are, sort of, responsible for the
15 Gaming Enforcement Unit for the site itself,
16 but, obviously, this property is going to
17 affect the greater Springfield area in that
18 area, so how do we assure public safety and
19 start getting the right people in the room.
20 Springfield has ensured us they've absolutely
21 been thinking about that and working on that,
22 but it's now time to blend our efforts to make
23 sure we're all on the same page.

24 So those are the four big buckets.

1 Staff is working very hard at making sure
2 we're ready to go. And we'll come --
3 Mike Mathis and I will come later,
4 potentially, the 15th with a joint
5 presentation.

6 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Great. Thank you.

7 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Quick
8 question, Ed, and you touched on it. I had
9 the opportunity to sit in with -- on
10 Director Griffin's meeting the other day, out
11 in Springfield with the regional employment
12 board and the workforce development team.
13 And, obviously, we brought news of the
14 Commission's recent action on the SER change,
15 which brought a smile to a lot of the local
16 stakeholders and local organizations
17 represented around the table.

18 You know, kind of a quick next step,
19 because as we looked at their hiring schedule,
20 mass hiring in the June -- I believe it was
21 June time frame.

22 MR. BEDROSIAN: Correct.

23 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: So as much
24 as we can do to work with MGM and Elaine and

1 Jill, and begin to put the message out there
2 about folks that, again, weren't eligible, now
3 eligible for a number of those service jobs,
4 being able to hear that and begin to step up
5 to the plate.

6 MR. BEDROSIAN: The good news is our
7 licensing director's sitting right to the
8 right of me so -- so, yes, we had talked about
9 that with MGM, which is the educational
10 approach. What -- you know, and we also want
11 to be fair to those folks who still have to go
12 through the process so they understand what
13 that process still is?

14 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Yep. And
15 MGM was quick to point out you still have a
16 process with us that individuals will have to
17 go through.

18 MR. BEDROSIAN: Correct. Correct.

19 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Anything else
20 for -- as part of --

21 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: No. It's good
22 stuff.

23 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Thank you.

24 MR. BEDROSIAN: So the next item I'm

1 going to turn over to Mr. Stempeck and
2 Mr. Connolly. This is an item, I think the
3 Commission knows we've been working on, in
4 anticipation of a supreme court ruling that
5 could come as early as March, but we don't
6 know. But what we wanted to do was develop
7 guidance for the legislature in front of that
8 decision, so I think they've done it. And
9 I'll turn it over to Mr. Stempeck and
10 Mr. Connelly.

11 MR. STEMPECK: Good morning,
12 Commissioners.

13 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Good morning.

14 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Good morning.

15 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Good morning.

16 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Good
17 morning.

18 MR. STEMPECK: So per your
19 instruction on the white -- this is our
20 White Paper on sports betting that we're
21 presenting to you today. This was a outgrowth
22 of a variety of different things, stretching
23 back all the way to our White Paper discussion
24 on daily fantasy sports nearly 2-1/2 years ago

1 now. Paul and I worked hand in hand on this
2 doing our own independent research, as well as
3 reaching out to a number of individuals, who
4 we regard as experts in the field. That
5 includes Chris Grove, who's a managing
6 director at Eilers & Krejcik Gaming. That
7 includes Will Green, a senior director of
8 research with the AGA.

9 Paul and I spoke with
10 representatives from Major League Baseball and
11 the National Basketball Association. I
12 attended a conference back in November, in
13 Manhattan, on sports betting. Sort of a what
14 will happen next in advance of the supreme
15 court decision on the Christie matter. I know
16 Paul attended a class out at UNLV last spring
17 on sports betting. Not to mention our own,
18 sort of, independent research and just keeping
19 abreast of everything that's going on.

20 This paper really builds upon some
21 of the themes in the DFS paper, as well as a
22 lot of what was discussed in the joint
23 commission the legislature put together last
24 year on online gaming and daily fantasy

1 sports. But this really -- whereas those only
2 really touched on the issue of sports betting,
3 this really, sort of, dives into it and gets
4 into, sort of, more detail about it, but also
5 while remaining generally agnostic as to what
6 is the best approach, but really giving a menu
7 of a variety of approaches.

8 MR. CONNELLY: Yeah. As Justin
9 says, and as Executive Director Bedrosian
10 mentioned, this was really an opportunity to
11 provide some input and guidance, not
12 recommendations. Where these aren't our --
13 you know, what we try to do is not to answer
14 all the questions, but to point out the
15 questions that need to be answered, should the
16 legislature decide to pursue a potential, if
17 it's even an option, of legalizing sports
18 betting.

19 And so, we wanted to keep it very
20 high level without specific recommendations.
21 But, again, just as a guide to help someone
22 think through those questions that need to be
23 addressed. And, frankly, to keep it
24 accessible. There's a lot of information on

1 all these. And, frankly, this is the
2 beginning of a discussion. So we just wanted
3 to start the conversation, as opposed to be --
4 try to be definitive on it.

5 MR. STEMPECK: And just to give you,
6 sort of, a overview, we'll just, sort of, talk
7 about the main points we make in here and,
8 sort of what we address.

9 I mean, this paper, we start off by
10 discussing, sort of, the historical
11 perspective as it comes to sports betting. We
12 look at what does the data show us about
13 market size. What does it show as potential
14 national market size, potential statewide
15 market size? What does that market size mean
16 for Massachusetts, if you were to do an
17 analysis as to potential gross gaming revenue
18 versus what the handle is? There's a lot of
19 confusion with these numbers. And we try and
20 explain it in a way that a layperson, not just
21 someone from the gaming industry would
22 actually understand and be able to digest,
23 because there's a lot of misinformation out
24 there, I'd say, where people get confused and

1 you hear these numbers of hundreds of billions
2 of dollars. And it sounds fantastic, but
3 let's try and drill down and find out what's
4 the reality. What could this actually mean
5 for the state, if we were looking at line
6 items in a budget.

7 I also, as the legal component of
8 this paper, I looked at the Christie decision.
9 I looked at what the supreme court is looking
10 at. I didn't get too much into the weeds in
11 that, recognizing, again, that we have a --
12 probably, a largely layperson audience that
13 aren't legal experts.

14 There's a lot of things I'm
15 interested as a lawyer in the, sort of, legal
16 intricacies of the Christie decision.
17 However, I tried to keep that relatively high
18 level so we could just say, what's the main
19 question here? What is the supreme court
20 wrestling with? What are the possible
21 outcomes? What will those possible outcomes
22 mean for Massachusetts? How would
23 Massachusetts have to react? What are the
24 possibilities?

1 There's nearly, probably, limitless
2 possibilities. I looked at the three main
3 possibilities that could happen after the
4 Christie decision. And as Mr. Bedrosian
5 noted, we're trying to stay ahead of the
6 supreme court. We don't know when they're
7 going to come out with a decision, and so a
8 little bit of this is prognostication. We're
9 guessing at what's going to happen, but we're
10 also providing, what does Massachusetts need
11 to be ready for, and what are the questions
12 that will need to be answered, if and when the
13 supreme court goes this way, or goes that way?

14 I also looked at, what are other
15 states doing? Almost every day you hear -- in
16 the news you hear a new state is looking at
17 sports betting. They're either proposing
18 legislation, they pass legislation, perhaps.
19 Perhaps, they're just talking about it. Some
20 states are considering it already as a future
21 item in their budget, counting on those
22 revenues. So I thought that's a good thing to
23 look at, what are other states doing? And
24 maybe that will inform what Massachusetts will

1 do, maybe it won't. But it at least gives us
2 an idea. Particularly, those states that
3 surround us in New England. What are those
4 states doing? How are they moving on this
5 issue, and how can we be smart, when and if we
6 want to move on this issue? I'll turn it --

7 MR. CONNELLY: Sure. And then, we
8 tried to transition into a framework for an
9 approach, or potential approach for the
10 legislature, should they consider this. And
11 we anticipated some of the clear policy
12 objectives that they might have to include
13 transitioning illegal activity into a legal
14 market, capturing those potential revenues.
15 Mitigating -- identifying and mitigating any
16 negative externalities, such as problem
17 gaming. And, also, and importantly, expanding
18 potentially economic opportunities to existing
19 licensees or new entrants into the market.

20 And so, with that there's a lot of
21 consideration with really the primary goal
22 being transitioning -- you know, illegal
23 activity into the legal marketplace, and what
24 are some of the issues you need to think

1 through when considering that. And those
2 include what kind of bets in what kind of
3 modalities that the providers would be able to
4 offer. You know, so, obviously, the
5 expectation is the more and the better, and
6 the more attractive the product, the more
7 likely you will be to dislodge people from the
8 illegal market. And with that, you know,
9 comes the opportunities to capture those
10 revenues, to provide those tools to bettors,
11 in terms of responsible gaming, et cetera.

12 And from a real big picture
13 perspective, we try to touch on, you know, the
14 basics, the who's, the what's, the when's, the
15 hows, in terms of who would -- legislators
16 would need to consider who would get these
17 licenses. You know, would it be existing
18 licensees? Would it be an open marketplace?
19 Those are questions that would need to be
20 answered.

21 The where, in terms of where betting
22 would be offered. Would it be strictly in a
23 brick and mortar environment, or would it be
24 in a more open, online and, potentially,

1 mobile environment. Huge implications on what
2 the landscape would look like, depending on
3 that decision. What types of bets. You know,
4 like we had identified in the DFS paper, the
5 emerging trends on some of these gaming
6 categories, just, they evolve so quickly. And
7 there are not only new types of sports that
8 could be wagered on, like virtual sports, you
9 know, virtual -- entirely virtual contests,
10 but also in-game betting where, you know, a
11 gaming contest already started and people can
12 place bets on the very next play. You know,
13 technology allows for it now.

14 Also, you know, how quickly would
15 such a scheme roll out. There's clearly a
16 first-mover advantage, not only for the
17 operators, but also for the states because, if
18 this does become a possibility, then there's
19 every expectation that our neighboring states
20 will jump on board and, you know, would want
21 to be aware of that.

22 And then, finally, the -- kind of,
23 the hows of it. So how would it be taxed?
24 How would it be regulated? Would there be a

1 very strong statute like 23K that contains a
2 lot of what would need to be done, or would
3 you have a more nimble statute that empowers
4 some regulatory body to actually anticipate
5 and make those decisions upfront?

6 So again -- and I hope that anyone
7 who reads this sees that we tried not to make
8 recommendations but, rather, to -- not to
9 answer the questions but, rather, to point out
10 the questions that need to be answered.
11 Finished.

12 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Thoughts?
13 Questions?

14 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Yeah. I had
15 a couple of -- couple of thoughts. First of
16 all, very well done. Easy to read. You hit
17 all the highlights. Of course, I would love
18 the who, what, when, where and how. I think
19 it's a great way to lay out the
20 considerations, so that was really well done.

21 Also, I was really interested in the
22 piece on minimizing the black market. I think
23 that's critical. Whatever the legislature
24 decides to do, if they do, in fact, think this

1 is something that should be legal here in the
2 Commonwealth, that, to me, would be a critical
3 piece, and you lay out ways in which we could
4 do that.

5 You know, in reading through, the
6 last couple of years there've been some
7 significant illegal gambling cases here in the
8 Commonwealth. The attorney generals gaming
9 unit, as well as the Massachusetts State
10 Police, and one of the common themes in
11 reading through those cases, which were of
12 interest to me, were not only that the
13 customers didn't have protections, but they
14 were actually taken advantage of in most of
15 those cases, between odds being changed and --
16 just a number of areas in which those
17 customers were not -- it wasn't what was
18 advertised. So that piece is really important
19 to me, and I'm glad you took some time to talk
20 about it in the paper and ways to minimize
21 that.

22 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Anybody else?

23 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Yeah. I mean,
24 I want to also mention that it reads really

1 well, and I've read it now a few times. The
2 first time, of course, with great interest,
3 almost like a great book that you can't wait
4 until the next paragraph because it really
5 flows well, the way that you formatted it. I
6 think you touch on all of the great points
7 that have to be made.

8 I'm only thinking of a couple of
9 tactical things, perhaps, going forward. And
10 I think, perhaps, in deference to -- to how we
11 make it available to the legislature. This is
12 really -- we could just put a cover page, a
13 letter from the chair, for example, to perhaps
14 get a little bit more -- give context that
15 you've made here, verbally, as to the why now.
16 Why is this now relevant, as a refresher to
17 people that, you know, don't look at these
18 things often. And, you know, offer people up
19 there at the legislature the ability to come
20 meet with them to either explain these -- the
21 high points in person or have, in addition to
22 these, just a one-pager, let's say.

23 It's such well-summarized, and it
24 doesn't take a position that an executive

1 summary doesn't fall well here, because you
2 really get right down to the nitty-gritty as
3 to the questions, the who, the what, et
4 cetera. But maybe, if this was a one-pager or
5 a short slide deck, or even just the
6 opportunity to -- you know, you Mr. Chairman,
7 or Ed, or Justin and Paul, to meet before the
8 committees that we report to, emerging
9 technologies, et cetera, or other interested
10 parties. I'd say that it would be really
11 deservedly well-taken. I think it really
12 stands for itself.

13 I think, you know, people are not
14 going to have trouble finding the good
15 references and all -- and appreciating all the
16 research that's behind this, which is really a
17 testament to the work that you've done,
18 because it's very hard to -- to throw in a lot
19 of data and complicated issues just out there.
20 And it's another thing to really summarize
21 them for the layperson, as you say.

22 So I found, also, just to touch on
23 some of the points that I found worthy of
24 mentioning --

1 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Could I just
2 interrupt there. I think that was -- it's a
3 really important point, and I, too, had
4 thought about, you know, should there be an
5 executive summary. But as I said to Paul and
6 Justin earlier, I think it's so well-written
7 that it -- even busy legislators will find the
8 time.

9 In the conveyance to the legislators
10 I'm going to actually say, I know you get
11 millions of these kind of reports all the
12 time, but this one is really worth reading.
13 The cover e-mail or letter, I still can make
14 some of your points but it's a quick, easy,
15 thoughtful read. And I'm going to go out of
16 my way to suggest that the committee chairs
17 and so forth actually read it themselves. And
18 I do think, you know, if you volunteer to meet
19 with staff, they'll probably love that. I'm
20 sure they will. You already have.

21 MR. CONNELLY: Absolutely.

22 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: So I hear your
23 point. But I think it just -- as you said, I
24 think it doesn't need an executive summary.

1 It really stands by itself, and we just need
2 to tell folks, it's worth taking the 20
3 minutes that it would take to read it in its
4 entirety.

5 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Right. And to
6 that end, I can only suspect that people find
7 different interests and go check some of the
8 references that are here. I, for example,
9 quickly went to how is this market size --
10 where does this data come from? Well, it's
11 from reputable sources and there's built-in
12 assumptions, and they're very solid. But by
13 necessity, because this is high level, they're
14 not all here. There's links, there's
15 explanations. It's very different to talk
16 about handle than to talk about GGR, or gross
17 gaming revenue. And those are some of the
18 things that, eventually, people, who are going
19 to be potentially looking at policy decision
20 in this matter ought to really understand.

21 But, at this point, the main
22 takeaway is that there's -- there's a great
23 summary here. There's great references, as
24 well. And the message that we should

1 emphasize is, and we're more than willing and
2 able, obviously, but hopeful that they will
3 take us up on explaining further, either the
4 amount of research that has gone into this.
5 And it's not all ours. You touched on all the
6 people that you talked to, and many of them
7 are really are recognized experts in these
8 fields. But the level of summary that, by
9 necessity has gone in here, and there's a lot
10 more that we can also make available.

11 MR. STEMPECK: Right. I think I can
12 speak for Paul, when I say that we'd be more
13 than happy to get into any level of detail.
14 This is a higher-level piece of work, and we
15 know the nitty-gritty details, Paul and I, and
16 would love to talk about them with anybody
17 that wants more detail.

18 I mean, this something that I know
19 I've been reading about and educating myself
20 about for years now, just following the sports
21 betting case, following the data that supports
22 everything that goes into this paper. So that
23 opportunity to really educate someone beyond
24 this, I mean, this is a -- the door's open, I

1 would say, to anybody who wants to come talk
2 and get anymore detail on any one of these
3 topics. Paul and I will be more than happy to
4 sit down and have a longer chat and more
5 detailed conversation.

6 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: I think we,
7 obviously -- we have good relationships with
8 the committee that oversees our work anyways,
9 so it's a good starting place.

10 I also thought this was extremely
11 well-written. You know, the overlaying a lot
12 of issues that you raised with, you know, the
13 addition of the Wire Act, which is, again,
14 another level to this whole policy
15 conversation.

16 MR. CONNELLY: We were told we
17 wouldn't talk about the Wire Act. I'm
18 kidding.

19 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: I did have a
20 question and it's probably more of a
21 clarification, and you touched on a little
22 bit. The suit that was brought against
23 Governor Christie was by the NCAA and the four
24 major sports leagues. Depending on how the

1 supreme court comes down, would this open it
2 up beyond the folks named in the suit to -- we
3 just got done with the olympics, are olympics
4 folded into that? Are other amateur sports --
5 you know, I can't see a lot of excitement
6 around betting on curling, but, you know, kind
7 of draw this out to different levels.

8 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Well, you
9 know --

10 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: You'd be
11 surprised.

12 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: They're
13 catching guys doping in curling, I guess.

14 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: You'd be
15 surprised.

16 MR. STEMPECK: So, I mean, PASPA's,
17 the Professional Amateur Sports Protection
18 Act. So those were -- the right of action to
19 sue under PASPA is granted to the NCAA and to
20 the four major sports leagues, as well as to
21 any amateur sports league. So the people who
22 brought suit had a right of action to bring
23 suit.

24 If PASPA is kicked out entirely by a

1 supreme court decision, it does open the
2 market to betting on amateur sports to --
3 potentially, to betting on the olympics. It's
4 all about -- then it would really likely go
5 to -- since we don't have a federal framework,
6 if PASPA's eliminated, then it would go to a
7 state-by-state determination of what sports
8 they would like to be legalized and which
9 would say no, we're going to draw the line
10 there.

11 I mean, you would be something
12 similar to what's done in Nevada, where you
13 have -- I mean, they drew a line at one point
14 and eliminated betting on collegiate sports,
15 and then they took that away and said, yes,
16 you actually can bet on collegiate sports. So
17 it would go to a state-by-state determination
18 if PASPA was fully revoked by the supreme
19 court.

20 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: You know, I
21 also wanted to make a point about that --
22 something that I found very helpful, which has
23 been mentioned, is this chart of what other
24 states have done or are doing. It's a bit of

1 different approaches, and that's very
2 illustrative in and of itself. And, notably,
3 I think it's well called out that very close
4 to us, Connecticut and Rhode Island, have
5 already taken, you know, important steps
6 towards what may be, depending on this
7 decision. And that's, yet, another one of the
8 many important points, when we make -- when we
9 present this paper to people in the
10 legislature to really emphasize.

11 MR. CONNELLY: Right. And it's not
12 just our approximate neighbors but the
13 northeast in general. A lot of the
14 projections and research indicate that the
15 northeast is probably the most likely -- and
16 if you think from mid-Atlantic all the way
17 through New England to be one of the most
18 densely-populated areas to offer. Just state
19 after state, it looks like there's really no
20 one that, at least as a lot of the experts
21 project, that would be shy to allowing sports
22 betting. And probably even aggressively
23 pursuing even to the online components of
24 sports betting.

1 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: And you had
2 South Carolina jumping into it, which,
3 currently, doesn't offer any type of betting.

4 MR. CONNELLY: Yeah.

5 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Just one
6 thing I thought of, you know,
7 Attorney Stempeck, along with his expertise in
8 online and sports betting, has also really
9 delved into racing, and has developed an
10 expertise, since we do regulate racing. And,
11 you know, our real source for good information
12 is Racing Commissioners International, which,
13 you know, I've attended conferences, Justin
14 has, as well, of course, Dr. Lightbown.

15 But at his suggestion this year,
16 they've added a panel on sports betting, which
17 he will be moderating, and he'll put it
18 together. And it's something they haven't
19 spent a lot of time with yet so they're very
20 grateful for the recommendation, and to share
21 some of our information with regulators from
22 around the country.

23 MR. STEMPECK: Right. Well, I saw
24 that -- I had suggested it, just simply

1 because I think there are some parallels to be
2 drawn with racing, and with the -- our
3 familiarity with racing and how we regulate
4 racing in the commonwealth. There's lessons
5 to be learned there.

6 Particularly, if we -- if -- there's
7 a lot of ifs here, but if sports betting is
8 allowed in the commonwealth and then we
9 determine who gets it, and if it were to go to
10 racing licensees, I think there's a -- it's
11 almost a natural marriage there with their --
12 they've been doing this type of thing for a
13 long time. They're familiar with advanced of
14 policy wagering, they're familiar with an
15 online component to their wagering system. So
16 they have some expertise already in this area,
17 which is worth pointing out, and it's worth
18 talking about.

19 So I thought, particularly at a
20 conference with racing commissioners from
21 across the country, and some from
22 jurisdictions outside the United States,
23 that's a conversation that should be --
24 particularly, when a lot of conversation is

1 about trying to reinvigorate racing and
2 keeping an active and vibrant community and
3 get in some young people and everything like
4 that, that if you can blend in sports betting
5 with that, take advantage of their -- already
6 their expertise on a type of sports betting on
7 horseracing, you can -- there's an opportunity
8 to make some hay there. No pun intended.

9 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: No, the
10 similarities to horse -- to racing is really
11 more than just incidental. The notion about
12 taxing the handle or takeouts from the handle,
13 the notion about taxing GGR and how they've
14 gone to the advanced depose -- deposit
15 wagering are really important -- really,
16 really important parallels.

17 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: I do want to pull
18 out one piece that you talked about that I
19 think the public and the press might be
20 particularly interested in. You make the
21 distinction, and you've talked now about the
22 difference between handle, which is the total
23 amount of money that people bet, and the
24 actual money, that percentage of that that's

1 retained by the people who manage the betting,
2 this so-called -- the rate, or the
3 commission --

4 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: The takeout.

5 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: That takeout,
6 which, typically, is around 5 percent. But
7 when we hear these numbers about the billions
8 that is gambled, or hundreds of millions
9 that's bet on the Super Bowl, I think people
10 can tend to get stars in their eyes about the
11 kind of revenue that's available.

12 And your thoughtful estimates, which
13 you are quick to say depend upon a million
14 different variables, but I think the public
15 might be interested in knowing that your
16 estimates are that the range of revenues, the
17 tax revenues that might come to the
18 commonwealth would be between 11 and
19 \$45 million a year. That's not chump change,
20 but you also pointed out that Plainridge Park
21 Casino, which is our smallest -- only at the
22 moment, but smallest casino facility generated
23 \$81 million in tax revenue, twice almost the
24 high-end projection.

1 So while it's significant and it is
2 something that people are very much involved
3 in, the actual revenue potential for the
4 commonwealth is pretty modest. And I think
5 that's an interesting point that you brought
6 out.

7 MR. CONNELLY: It's a
8 hugely-interesting important point, because
9 not only, you know, does it impact a rational
10 taxation schema, but, also, there's been a lot
11 of discussion about integrity fees, or
12 whatever you might want to call it, that
13 leagues may or have been asking certain state
14 legislatures to put into legislation, where
15 they would get a piece of the handle to
16 support not only increased monitoring but, you
17 know, increased investigations, et cetera.
18 And they've made the case that they view it,
19 to a certain extent, as a royalty, right,
20 because they're offering up a product that
21 people are then allowed to bet on, someone's
22 making money, you know, in an indirect way off
23 of their product. And the point we try and
24 make in the paper is, because sports betting,

1 unlike a lot of the other parts of casino
2 betting and traditional betting, it's not --
3 it's profitable, so anything you do that
4 reduces that profit has an impact, downstream
5 impact on the products that will be offered,
6 and, again, goes to impact that primary policy
7 goal of getting people away from the illegal
8 market, which, right now is pretty robust and
9 people are comfortable, and it's only getting
10 easier with, you know, this online environment
11 with paper head model. And, you know, anyone
12 could go on line right now and Google online
13 sports betting and probably place a wager
14 illegally very easily. So you'll have to
15 think things through to make sure that we're
16 maximizing the potential of getting people out
17 of the illegal market.

18 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Yeah. Anybody
19 else?

20 COMMISSIONER MACDONALD: Yeah.
21 Mr. Chairman.

22 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Yes.

23 COMMISSIONER MACDONALD: Yeah, it's
24 Commissioner Macdonald. I had a couple of

1 comments and a question, I think, primarily
2 for Paul.

3 First of all, I want to join in
4 others' praise on the quality of the paper. I
5 really think it's an excellent, analytical
6 piece that lays out in a very comprehensible
7 fashion the major considerations that we ought
8 to be taking into account. So it really is a
9 very valuable accomplishment. And thank you
10 both for doing it.

11 The other comment that I wanted to
12 make and leading to a question, is to share my
13 own understanding that -- I think it was the
14 chairman's phrase that it's pretty -- that the
15 potential returns to the state, in terms of
16 tax revenue, is pretty -- is pretty modest
17 here. And, Paul, you referenced, you know, a
18 first-mover advantage concept with regard to
19 the commonwealth's or the legislature's and,
20 ultimately, the governor's decisions with
21 regard to this. I must say, that my
22 inclination on the subject has been, that
23 given the relatively modest return to the
24 state, that this would be no -- in the event

1 that the supreme court does declare PASPA to
2 be unconstitutional, that there's no hurry to
3 get into this, or there ought to be no hurry
4 to get into this but -- and let other states,
5 you know, go first and the commonwealth, in
6 effect, learn their lessons from this bevy of
7 interest, which we're seeing reflected in, and
8 reflected specifically in the chart that you
9 all prepared.

10 Paul, do you think I'm off-based on
11 that; do you think that there really is an
12 important element here of first-mover
13 advantage, and that taking a wait-and-see
14 position would be detrimental to the long-term
15 interests of the commonwealth?

16 MR. CONNELLY: Well, my personal
17 opinion -- and, again, we put in that
18 comparison with the revenues that we're
19 getting from Plainridge Park to really put it
20 into context, that -- and the numbers that we
21 used to project, kind of, a limited -- a
22 limited environment, sort of, of land-based
23 only was about 11 million to an online and
24 open environment was about 45, came from the

1 Oxford study, which was the only study that we
2 found that really broke down an analysis at a
3 state level.

4 So I think it's -- a first-mover
5 advantage is always real. I think, in terms
6 of from the perspective of the operators.
7 They like to get in, attract customers, get a
8 name out and brand it. And I think, from the
9 commonwealth side, I don't know if -- from --
10 at the state level, I think I tend to agree to
11 an extent with you, Commissioner Macdonald.
12 That, you know, the advantages, I think, would
13 be seen to the operators as a first-mover more
14 so than to the state. Primarily, because I
15 think, if it was a true budget balancer in
16 terms of the revenues brought in, then, I
17 might say something different. And, again,
18 \$45 million is not insignificant at all. But
19 I don't think it's going to make, in a state
20 like Massachusetts, the difference between,
21 you know, being able to do everything and not
22 being able to do everything.

23 So I think the -- it really then
24 speaks to, when you look at it from those

1 other policy perspectives of trying to, you
2 know, get people right now, who are in the
3 illegal market, as Commissioner Cameron
4 pointed out not only without protection but
5 sometimes taken advantage of, the speed with
6 which you would want to provide those
7 protections to those people, I think, then the
8 burden kind of shifts in that regard to those
9 are some of the policy perspectives that
10 you're going to really advance first by being
11 a first-mover.

12 But, economically, the first-mover
13 advantages, I think, would clearly be to the
14 operators, who would be able to brand, market,
15 start to get mind space of the customers
16 quickly.

17 MR. BEDROSIAN: And Commissioner
18 Macdonald, it's Executive Director Bedrosian.
19 I had the fortune of tagging along with these
20 two gentlemen, they did the hard work. Some
21 of the things I heard on that were maybe a
22 little less tangible. Not necessarily tax
23 revenue, but our -- I would suspect, down the
24 line what we might hear from our

1 brick-and-mortar licensees is, if everyone
2 around you has a sports book, it almost
3 becomes a must have. And while they recognize
4 it's not a must-have on the revenue side, per
5 se, it's not a big revenue breaker for them,
6 but, certainly, an amenity that becomes very
7 important. And if you don't have it, what's
8 the effect of not having that.

9 The other thing I would note, in the
10 commonwealth we, obviously, have a very
11 prominent DFS operator, who's expressed
12 interest in it. And it's just one of those
13 issues I think the legislature or the governor
14 and our economic development people will think
15 about, in terms of trying to continue to have
16 Massachusetts be a technology innovator,
17 whether that is part of it or not.

18 So there are -- I think there are
19 intangible things that aren't necessarily
20 measured directly in tax revenue so -- I don't
21 know if that actually helps the answer or
22 clouds it up.

23 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Okay.

24 Commissioner Macdonald, anything else?

1 COMMISSIONER MACDONALD: Nope.

2 Thank you.

3 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Yep. Anybody
4 else? All right. Great. Thank you very
5 much, folks.

6 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Thank you.

7 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Really good
8 work. Thank you.

9 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Thanks for
10 the work.

11 MR. CONNELLY: As Justin said,
12 anything else we can help with on this, we're
13 happy to --

14 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Well, we should --
15 we ought to think about, you know, maybe --

16 MR. CONNELLY: How do we advance it?

17 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: -- just a cover --
18 I think it's really just an e-mail, but if you
19 might want to give me a draft of, sort of,
20 bullet points or draft an e-mail how you would
21 like to -- taking some of the points that
22 Commissioner Zuniga made, I would take a look
23 at that, and then I can sit down tonight or
24 tomorrow and send them out.

1 MR. CONNELLY: Sure.

2 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Great. Thanks
3 very much.

4 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Thanks.

5 MR. STEMPECK: Thank you.

6 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Congratulations.
7 great job. Director Driscoll, we going to
8 take a brief break here?

9 MS. DRISCOLL: Sure.

10 MR. BEDROSIAN: Yeah, why don't we
11 do that and we can allow the other folks to
12 set up, too.

13 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Yeah. Okay.

14

15 (A recess was taken)

16

17 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: We are reconvening
18 public meeting No. 237 on March 1st at about
19 five minutes of 11. Next item on the agenda
20 is Ombudsman Ziemba. Let me just make sure
21 that -- Commissioner Macdonald are you there,
22 and can you hear?

23 COMMISSIONER MACDONALD: I am here.

24 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Great. Thank you.

1 Ombudsman Ziemba.

2 MR. ZIEMBA: Mr. Chairman and
3 Commissioners, today we have the quarterly
4 report for Plainridge Park for the fourth
5 quarter ending December 31st. Presenting
6 today, as part of the Plainridge Park team,
7 are Ruben Warren, CFO; Kim Dixon, VP of HR,
8 and Michele Collins, VP of Marketing;
9 Lance George, General Manager; and
10 Lisa McKenney, compliance manager, are also
11 here today. Ruben.

12 MR. WARREN: Good morning.

13 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Good morning.

14 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Good morning.

15 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Good morning.

16 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Good
17 morning.

18 MR. WARREN: So, for us, we are
19 happy to report -- still finding our legs, but
20 we're happy with business. Things are going
21 well. And so, for the fourth quarter revenues
22 -- net slot revenues of \$39 million, that's
23 about 4.7 percent growth over 2016. And for
24 the state taxes, \$19 million to the state --

1 or total taxes 15.7 to the state, 3.5 to the
2 racing industry.

3 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: When you say 19 to
4 the state, are you talking about Racehorse
5 Development Fund and --

6 MR. WARREN: Yes.

7 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: The two together?
8 We're thinking it was both tax revenues.
9 Right. Okay.

10 MR. WARREN: Right. Correct. And
11 for the year, \$164.7 million total net slot
12 revenues. It's about 6.3 percent growth over
13 2016. And for the total year, total taxes of
14 just under \$81 million with 65.9 going to the
15 state and 14.8 going to racing -- to the
16 racing industry.

17 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Hold on just one
18 second. Lloyd, it seems like there's a noise
19 in the background, maybe, on the radio or
20 something on your speaker. Commissioner
21 Macdonald?

22 COMMISSIONER MACDONALD: You know
23 what, it may -- there's a lag between the
24 video and -- and real time. What I've done

1 is, I've muted the video.

2 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Okay. Great,
3 great. Yeah, I've had to wrestle with the
4 same -- same lag. All right. Thank you.
5 Sorry.

6 MR. WARREN: No, no problem.
7 Michele will get into a little bit about, you
8 know, some of the things that we're doing on
9 property to sustain the growth to get to know
10 our customer better. So, again, we're pleased
11 to report progress and growth year over year.

12 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Is that -- anybody
13 else, questions? Is that -- it's a 6 percent,
14 did you say, increase?

15 MR. WARREN: 6.3 percent year over
16 year.

17 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Is that what you
18 expected; is that good, bad or indifferent?
19 How does that --

20 MR. WARREN: It's about what we
21 expected. We are happy with the growth so
22 far. And, you know, again, our jobs here is
23 to continue to provide, you know, some
24 excitement, try different things on the

1 property. It's been a few years. We're
2 getting our legs about the community, our
3 customer base. You know, again, getting to
4 know the customer, we're happy with where we
5 are right now with the progress.

6 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: We've heard
7 in the past five years to really have the most
8 robust, where you feel like you're at the top
9 of your game. Do you think that's about
10 right?

11 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Go ahead.

12 MR. GEORGE: Yeah. So I think,
13 typically, that would be the case.

14 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: You probably ought
15 to come to mic, Lance. Yeah, if you can.

16 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Just change
17 seats.

18 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Just change seats,
19 if you would. We don't want to miss any of
20 your golden words.

21 MR. GEORGE: I think, traditionally,
22 that would be the case. However for us, and
23 it was alluded to earlier by Paul and Justin,
24 changing landscape. You know, we've got MGM

1 opening, we'll have Wynn the year after that,
2 and then we have Tiverton opening, as well,
3 which is about 40 minutes from us. So whereas
4 that used to be the case, I think, with a
5 changing landscape, a bit more challenging to
6 look into the future.

7 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Right.

8 Thanks.

9 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Yeah, good point.

10 MR. WARREN: So the next slide,
11 lottery still continues to be a great story
12 for us. 822,000 in sales in the fourth
13 quarter. It's about just under 10 percent
14 growth over prior year. And for the year,
15 just over \$3.3 million in total sales through
16 our instant ticket and online terminals.
17 That's about a 12-percent growth.

18 And so, in talking to the lottery,
19 they are managing the type of games that
20 they're put into our property specifically.
21 That's different than what they do with the
22 other lottery outlets that's around the city.
23 And so, I think, with this, the growth we have
24 seen, our cash business -- lottery's a cash

1 business, and I think it's a convenience
2 factor that, you know, people can come to the
3 casino, as they leave with a little money,
4 they're going to go and, you know, get their
5 weekly lottery ticket. And so, I think it's a
6 great partnership for both.

7 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Yeah. I was
8 going to ask. That's a really significant
9 growth. But you're thinking two factors. One
10 is they're managing the products well. And,
11 secondly, your patrons understand, or maybe
12 every year they understand that this -- more
13 so, that they can take advantage of the
14 product right there. Is that --

15 MR. WARREN: Yes. And so, in our
16 partnership with the lottery, we have dialogue
17 in between that discuss what our patrons like,
18 and they do a good job of creating new
19 product. And so, instead of going to the
20 machine and seeing the same product, they do a
21 great job of changing that out frequently.
22 And so, there's new things there every time a
23 customer comes up.

24 Also, it's a convenience factor. As

1 they come in, entertain in the facility,
2 there's a lottery -- machines there available
3 for them. And so, I think the state is a
4 lottery state, and so people will play the
5 games, but it's a convenience factor, as well.

6 MR. GEORGE: Yeah. Oftentimes, and
7 you guys have seen it in years past or
8 quarters past, these numbers can be inflated
9 because of marketing initiatives. But largely
10 speaking, this 12-percent growth is organic,
11 so sizeable.

12 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: It's not bulk buys
13 by you; it's just retail sales?

14 MR. GEORGE: That's correct.

15 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Largely.

16 MR. GEORGE: That's correct.

17 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: It's really -- do
18 you have any experience, Lance, or anybody,
19 about lottery sales at other facilities around
20 the country; is this good, bad or indifferent
21 compared to others?

22 MR. GEORGE: This is an anomaly.

23 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Yeah. Really.

24 MR. GEORGE: Typically, it's flat.

1 It may be a nominal increase. But a
2 12-percent year-over-year increase is an
3 anomaly.

4 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Yeah. And it's a
5 credit to you guys and to the lottery because,
6 as you know, everybody knows, the law mandated
7 that we try to make a working relationship so
8 that we wouldn't cannibalize the lottery. And
9 there's a second dimension to this, which is,
10 what has happened to lottery sales in the
11 surrounding communities in Plainville.

12 But, previously, in the one year
13 study we've done, I think there's another
14 coming up pretty soon --

15 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Yes.

16 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: -- there was very
17 little -- there was growth in the Plainridge
18 -- Plainville and the surrounding communities,
19 maybe not quite as much growth as statewide.
20 But it looks like, taken together, that it's
21 going to -- you know, that the lottery is
22 enhancing sales -- I'm sorry, that the casino
23 is enhancing lottery sales, rather than the
24 opposite the legislature was concerned about.

1 MR. GEORGE: Sure. I think there
2 were some concerns about cannibalization, at
3 least, in the surrounding communities but that
4 -- that hasn't turned out to be the case.

5 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Yep.

6 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: And what you
7 mentioned, I think, is also really good, in
8 terms of they, themselves, are figuring out
9 the customer that comes to the casino and can
10 play the lottery, as well. And sounds like
11 they're being really proactive, in terms of
12 keeping all that -- those games fresh. If
13 they're limiting certain games to the casino
14 and other places, maybe they can, themselves,
15 sort out, you know, what's the most
16 competitive approach.

17 MR. GEORGE: Great point. I think
18 they're figuring out the casino customer, as
19 well.

20 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Just for the
21 record, Lance, as you well know, your facility
22 has been a demo site for Massachusetts on a
23 lot of things, including our learning our
24 business, nevermind, you know, the research

1 and the problem gambling, and the lottery
2 relationship and everything else. And, you
3 know, as you've heard me say, if there are
4 problems we'll address the problems and we
5 will talk about them, no questions about it.

6 But from the very beginning, when
7 your CEO agreed to participate in the
8 PlayMyWay project, you guys have been willing
9 to work with us and collaborate. I mean, you
10 could argue that this money isn't going to
11 slot machines. That could go into lottery,
12 you know. But notwithstanding that, you guys
13 have really, in good faith, I think, worked
14 with us to try to accomplish the goals that
15 the legislature saw here, and it should not go
16 unremarked.

17 I know that it's not always easy
18 with you guys. And it's put stress and strain
19 on your organization, of different kinds of
20 pressures that not everybody who runs a casino
21 has to deal with. So I just want to say, for
22 the record, that, that's noted and
23 appreciated.

24 MR. GEORGE: And we appreciate that.

1 Thank you.

2 MR. WARREN: All right. We'll move
3 on to state spend. And so, for qualified
4 spend for the fourth quarter, just under
5 \$2 million was spent, with 73 percent, or just
6 under 1.5 million staying in the state of
7 Massachusetts. For the annual number,
8 6.7 million we're spending 75 percent state
9 and -- in the state of Mass. So I think that
10 trend holds for us that, you know, 70 to
11 75 percent will spend inside the state. The
12 next slide --

13 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: This is your spend
14 that you've used on vendors?

15 MR. WARREN: Correct.

16 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: And that
17 number's gone up, kind of, year to year, year
18 up? I don't think you have it but...

19 MR. WARREN: That I don't have.

20 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Okay.

21 MR. WARREN: Yeah. Don't have the
22 total year-over-year spend. But I can say, on
23 average, we keep about 70 to 75 percent. We
24 spend that money in the state of

1 Massachusetts.

2 The next slide is our hosting
3 community and surrounding community spend.
4 Just under 200,000 was spent in the fourth
5 quarter. That's about 9 percent of our total
6 overall spend. And for the year, \$470,000,
7 and it's about 70,000, was spent in our host
8 communities.

9 You can see that Plainville, we
10 spent \$141,000 on the fourth quarter. And
11 that's mainly, largely due to an LED lighting
12 project. We procured a local electrician for
13 that project. And so, our approach to any
14 procurement is we look at our host
15 communities, we then look at if there's anyone
16 that's qualified. We then move on to
17 diversity, is there anyone in that pool. And
18 if there is, we stop there. If not, we'll
19 cast a wider net and we'll do the same thing.
20 And we will not exhaust the efforts until we
21 move on to our diversity spend.

22 And so, the next slide, getting into
23 diversity, for the total spend, 1.9 million in
24 2017. And 50 percent of that stayed in the

1 state of Massachusetts, of the diversity
2 partners. 1.3 million for the women-owned
3 category, just under 400,000 for the minority,
4 and a little over 200,000 in the veteran
5 category.

6 And our next slide, kind of, shows
7 the quarters, how we spend our funds in each
8 quarter. Fourth quarter, of course, was the
9 highest spend for us, due to the projects, the
10 LED lighting specifically. And so, really not
11 much here. The 200,000 was LED lighting, and
12 in the women category, mainly, marketing
13 promotions and food and beverage services made
14 up the bulk of the 400,000 there.

15 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: So do I read this
16 right, that your total spend in '17 was close
17 to 7 million, of which, virtually, two were
18 diverse vendors?

19 MR. GEORGE: Correct. That is
20 correct.

21 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: So 2/7ths of your
22 total, which is pretty good.

23 MR. GEORGE: Total qualified spend.

24 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Total qualified.

1 Right.

2 MR. WARREN: Right. Good point.
3 And so, for the fourth quarter, overall we hit
4 our diversity goal. Our goal is 21 percent.
5 We spent -- we accomplished 39 percent. And
6 the women category, the goal is 12 percent,
7 and we were at 25 percent. And the minority
8 category, the goal is 6 percent. We
9 accomplished 12 percent of that goal. And for
10 the veteran category, 3 percent was the goal.
11 We were a little short. We were at 2 percent.
12 And so, with that being said, we have done a
13 lot of ground-roots, back-to-the-basics work
14 to get out to the community to certain events
15 and figure out who's out there in the veteran
16 category, specifically, so that we are shore
17 up that area.

18 We have a project that's coming up
19 late first quarter, this month into April, and
20 we have sourced veteran construction companies
21 that we will be going out to -- again, to give
22 that -- those companies an opportunity to bid
23 on these projects. And so, we feel like
24 that's going to be shored up for -- on an

1 annual basis we accomplished the goals across
2 the board. So 28 percent on an annual basis
3 for the overall spend, 19 percent for the
4 women-owned category above the 12 percent
5 goal. We were right at the 6 percent goal for
6 the minority, and right at the 3 percent goal
7 for the veteran category. So on an annual
8 basis, we're meeting the goals. We just fell
9 short in the fourth quarter.

10 The next slide, just an update on
11 compliance. And so, we had about -- we
12 checked just under 24,000 patrons in the
13 fourth quarter. That's about 4 percent of the
14 total patrons that walk through the door.
15 Mainly, it falls on your Friday, Saturdays,
16 your busiest times.

17 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: What percent did
18 you say?

19 MR. WARREN: 4 percent.

20 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: 4 percent?

21 MR. WARREN: 4 percent. And so, 500
22 were prevented, of the 24,000 from entering
23 the building. Mainly, that -- 78 percent
24 makes up expired or no ID, so if we can't

1 identify 'em we send them away. And we had 90
2 that were under age that we turned away, 17
3 that were minors that we turned away.

4 We did have, in December, three
5 under age that made it onto the gaming floor,
6 did not game, they did not consume alcohol.
7 We quickly found out that we made a mistake
8 and we got them off the floor.

9 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: This is something
10 that I've noticed from these reports, and also
11 from our IEB reports, there's virtually never
12 an underage person that's gotten to the
13 gambling machines, or to drinking. That seems
14 amazing to me, that you would -- I'm not sure
15 that I've ever seen one. Maybe there's been
16 one or two over the course of the two last
17 years, but I don't remember actually seeing
18 any. Is that unusual, or is that -- that
19 seems, to me, to be pretty amazing.

20 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Yeah, those
21 numbers are really strong. You know, I
22 remember looking at those when we were doing
23 our licensing with -- you know, in, you know,
24 some properties around the country certainly

1 had higher numbers there, so I do think you're
2 doing a very good job at identifying and --
3 yeah, I was going to ask about that. You kept
4 them -- they might have gotten through but not
5 for long. You got them before they --

6 MR. WARREN: No, not at all. In my
7 experience in other jurisdictions, we're doing
8 a great job compared to some of the stories
9 that you read. And so, we take it very
10 seriously. There is some very good training.
11 We have a security director that we brought in
12 from a different jurisdiction that's very
13 aware, very experienced.

14 And so, again, I think our property
15 does a good job of making sure that we're
16 monitoring who's coming to the door. And
17 kudos to the team.

18 MR. BEDROSIAN: Do you guys know the
19 approximate number of patrons that came
20 through the doors, in 2017?

21 MR. WARREN: We average about
22 200,000 in our offpeak, about 225,000 a month
23 or higher May through July.

24 MR. BEDROSIAN: And just out of

1 curiosity, to put it in perspective,
2 Plainridge itself, the population of
3 Plainridge itself is 8,000?

4 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Yes, 8,000.

5 MR. WARREN: Yeah. A little over
6 202 million, 2-1/2 million.

7 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Yeah, that's
8 remarkable. One of the things that I think is
9 at play here, is that you have a very
10 favorable layout for entry. There's,
11 essentially, just three entrances that are
12 monitored. Every time I've been there they're
13 constantly monitored. That might not
14 necessarily be the case in the property that's
15 upcoming, and we will see how those things pan
16 out.

17 MR. WARREN: Okay. I'm going to
18 turn it over to Kim Dixon for an employment
19 update.

20 MS. DIXON: Good morning.

21 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Good morning.

22 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Good morning.

23 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Good morning.

24 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Good

1 morning.

2 MS. DIXON: Good morning. As of the
3 end of Q4, our total employees were 465. 308
4 of them are full time, while 157 are part
5 time. We remain, essentially, the same with
6 62.2 percent as full time, and 33.8 percent at
7 part time. Our diversity number remains
8 largely consistent at 23 percent on a
9 10 percent goal. We had a modest uptick with
10 veterans at 5 percent, so it was up one
11 percentage point over last quarter. Our
12 overall male and female percentages remain the
13 same.

14 We had a lot going on in Q4 for
15 recruitment. We continue to focus on our
16 in-state and local hiring. A few highlights
17 of what we did in Q4 were we attended the BCC
18 job fair, the recruit military job fair, we
19 had an on-site job fair, we placed several ads
20 in the Sun Chronicle. We also have a link to
21 the United Regional Chamber of Commerce's
22 website, where you can directly link to our
23 site to apply for jobs. We also use their
24 site to highlight some specific jobs we're

1 looking for. We've built new relationships
2 with Dean College, as well as MTTI.

3 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: I'm
4 impressed with some of the initiatives that
5 you're taking. You know, the Massachusetts
6 figure is one that has, kind of, stuck out. I
7 went back and looked at where you were fourth
8 quarter the end of 2016, it was 70 percent
9 Massachusetts. So everything else has stayed
10 pretty flat, but that Massachusetts number,
11 you know, has dropped a little bit. So, you
12 know, whatever we can do, or whatever some of
13 the partners or stakeholder agencies that we
14 work with can do to kind of help keep that
15 number up, I know Director Griffin'd be happy
16 to help you.

17 MS. DIXON: Yes, thank you. And she
18 has.

19 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: You know, I
20 had a question, maybe -- to the extent that
21 you can speak to these, or this in general,
22 have you seen your turnover decrease a little
23 bit over time; how is that number?

24 MS. DIXON: Yes. So our number

1 continues to get better over 2016 over '15, as
2 well as 2017 over '16, so we're seeing that
3 number drop.

4 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Which is good
5 news, as far as we're concerned. And then,
6 perhaps, limits your ability to change a lot
7 of these numbers for obvious reasons.

8 MS. DIXON: Exactly. Thank you.
9 Next, I'd like to talk about, as Michele
10 mentioned at the last commission meeting,
11 Women Leading at Penn, as an initiative drive
12 from the book, Lean In, by Sheryl Sandberg,
13 the COO of Facebook and former CEO of Google.

14 The goals of our program, where
15 Michele and I are both cochairs of the program
16 for Plainridge Park, are to encourage women to
17 pursue leadership roles, have visible female
18 executives, and leadership championing growth
19 and development for women at their property,
20 and to increase the number of women in
21 leadership, specifically, at the manager level
22 on an annual basis.

23 So for all industries, women
24 represent about 39 percent of management,

1 while men represent 61 percent. Plainridge
2 Park, we currently have about 36 percent
3 women, with 64 percent men. We are in line
4 slightly below the industry, but we certainly
5 do want to be better. Michele's going to walk
6 us through the plans for Q1.

7 MS. COLLINS: So what we're going to
8 be doing is a timeline. And across all the
9 Penn enterprise, each property will be doing
10 the same initiative. So we're going to
11 identify 15 participants. And these are women
12 who are interested in pursuing management
13 roles, they want to grow their career. We're
14 going to look at hourly, salary,
15 nonmanagement, frontline employees, back of
16 house, and help them develop.

17 So the first thing we'll do, after
18 we identify those participants, and we'll
19 have, kind of, a focus group where we'll
20 distribute this Lean In book, allow everyone
21 to read it that's part of this group, and then
22 we'll discuss it. And the book really
23 highlights what the difference is between
24 genders, and it gives women insight on how to

1 succeed in the work industry.

2 So I think, really, the main focus
3 of the book, a quote that I took from the book
4 that kind of says what it's all about is, it's
5 time to cheer on girls and women who want to
6 sit at the table. So it's, kind of, the
7 underlying tone of what the book is about and
8 how we'll develop these individuals.

9 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: How are
10 you -- what if you have more than 15 women
11 that are interested in taking part in this
12 course to be the next future leaders?

13 MS. COLLINS: Yeah. So this is
14 going to be a program through December, and
15 then we'll do it again each year. So it
16 allows opportunity across the board. We also
17 want to identify those that aren't in a
18 management role and be able to follow them
19 through the process to see how well it's
20 working and how they're developing.

21 And as I mentioned, we're doing this
22 at all the properties within Penn, as well, so
23 it allows for opportunity that maybe somebody
24 who isn't in a management role at Plainridge

1 Park could transfer over to another role
2 within the Penn enterprise.

3 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: So you'll
4 encourage and you're going to be tracking the
5 entire year.

6 MS. COLLINS: Correct.

7 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: So I think
8 the front-end part is really important so they
9 can visualize themselves in a higher-level
10 position.

11 MS. COLLINS: Exactly.

12 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: What is the follow
13 up? You know, is there a way -- how do you
14 stay in touch, keep track, enforce?

15 MS. COLLINS: So we're going to be
16 meeting on a monthly basis, and there's a very
17 detailed program, throughout December, of all
18 the initiatives we'll be doing. So, really,
19 March is the kickoff, and we'll start to
20 develop and give the goals of the group and
21 then kind of have a baseline. And then, from
22 there we'll offer different things that allows
23 them to build their skill sets, and to
24 encourage them to grow within the industry.

1 MS. DIXON: And some months, we can
2 address to a larger population, as well, to
3 invite all women, who may be interested in
4 that particular topic that month.

5 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Great.

6 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Well, I can
7 think of one commissioner who might qualify to
8 be a guest speaker in one of these --

9 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Yeah, no kidding.

10 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: -- sessions,
11 if she were available.

12 MS. COLLINS: We will be talking to
13 you.

14 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Right.

15 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: No, I -- this
16 is encouraging, the program because you would
17 -- obviously, I know you're thinking about
18 getting your numbers so where they're more
19 equitable with -- with women in leadership
20 positions.

21 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: And
22 Commissioner Cameron has, A, had a lot of
23 experience in leading such initiatives, and
24 as -- is often called on to speak about this

1 and to help mentor women, but also to help
2 implement these kinds of strategies, so I'm
3 sure she'd be willing to respond, if you want.

4 MS. DIXON: That would be great.

5 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Okay.

6 MS. COLLINS: For local community,
7 we attended the Taste of the Region, which is
8 probably a hundred or so restaurants in the
9 local community that participate. The Mega
10 Business Expo, our purchasing department
11 attended this event to look for veteran-owned
12 and minority-owned businesses. For Toys for
13 Tots around the holiday season, we partnered
14 with the lottery and the Massachusetts Council
15 on Compulsive Gambling and we did a toy drive.
16 So as you can see in that picture, we had over
17 500 toys that we were able to distribute,
18 which was nice.

19 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: How did you
20 distribute them?

21 MS. COLLINS: We collected
22 everything and then they delivered it to Toys
23 for Tots.

24 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: To Toys for Tots.

1 Okay, yeah.

2 MS. COLLINS: We partnered with the
3 Claddagh Fund and did a holiday charity event.
4 For those of you, who aren't familiar with
5 Claddagh Fund, they are associated with
6 Dropkick Murphys so we had our first
7 Dropkick Murphys concert at The Loft, so that
8 was exciting. And then, we also participated
9 in Be a Santa to a Senior. So this is based
10 out of Attleboro. And we had about a hundred
11 gifts that we provided to the seniors. And
12 it's really cute to see the tags, because it's
13 just little things, like scarves and puzzles.
14 So things that are very simple for us to get
15 for them. And it was the employees that
16 participated in that.

17 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Nice.

18 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: That's great.

19 MS. COLLINS: For Q4 partnerships,
20 most of this you see on this on a quarterly
21 basis. So, again, we continue with our
22 Patriot Place partnership with the hotel Stay
23 and Play packages. We've also started to
24 utilize Holiday Inn in Plainville, as well,

1 for a similar program. Wrentham Village
2 Premium Outlets, we're working with valet.
3 And as you can see in the picture here, it's
4 the Call to Action that we put in the car with
5 a bottle of water, and it has an offer on it
6 for them to come back to Plainridge Park
7 Casino.

8 We continue with NESN, Bruins,
9 Celtics, and the Patriots. And we're really
10 looking forward to moving on the Gaming
11 Economic Development Fund opportunity. So
12 we'll be incorporating the GBCVB, as you
13 mentioned, and we're looking forward to that
14 opportunity. I know we had mentioned, maybe,
15 \$50,000 of the fund to help us develop, so
16 we're working with Paige on that now.

17 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Great.

18 MS. COLLINS: Q4 highlights. We did
19 a veterans' day meal, where we served over 200
20 meals, free meals to veterans, local veterans,
21 we had a New Year's Eve Mardi Gras theme. And
22 in conjunction with the holiday event we did
23 with Dropkick Murphys, we also hosted another
24 boxing event.

1 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Are you going to
2 continue doing boxing events; are they working
3 for you?

4 MS. COLLINS: Yes. We're going to
5 look at one for, possibly, May.

6 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Great.

7 MS. COLLINS: And then, for Q1
8 highlights, as you know, we've been really
9 focusing on The Loft, the entertainment. So
10 we continue to do comedy shows, we recently
11 did Mark -- Mike Girard's swing band, which
12 was different, but, again, nice turnout. A
13 lot of last-minute sales for that one. And
14 then, Bob Marley and Frank Santos, Jr. come on
15 a quarterly basis now.

16 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Great.

17 MS. COLLINS: And that's it.

18 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Great. That it?
19 Questions? Comments?

20 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Thanks. A
21 lot of progress, a lot of initiatives that are
22 interesting, and thank you for the good work.

23 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Just a note,
24 there's a big seafood show happening up at the

1 Boston Convention Center, so send Eli or F & B
2 people to see what else they can buy from
3 Massachusetts vendors.

4 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Great.

5 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Thank you.

6 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Thank you
7 everybody. Take a quick break, while Mark
8 sets up.

9

10 (A recess was taken)

11

12 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: You are going to
13 go to Item No. 4. Mark, you're going to start
14 with Christopher, rather than the framework?

15 MR. VANDER LINDEN: That's correct.
16 Just a little switch in the order of my items.
17 I thought we'd have Christopher go first with
18 the crime report, followed by the framework
19 and National Problem Gambling Awareness Month,
20 which both of those, kind of, couple together
21 very well.

22 So good after -- good morning,
23 Commissioners. I am joined here with
24 Christopher Bruce, crime analyst, working on

1 behalf of the Massachusetts Gaming Commission
2 as part of our research agenda.

3 Commissioners, as you know very well, there's
4 been a number of studies produced over -- over
5 time that take a look at the effects of
6 gambling on serious crime rates. But hardly
7 any of these studies have attempted to analyze
8 more specific and minute changes in public
9 safety activity following the opening of
10 casinos.

11 And by this, I mean evaluating it as
12 closely as by hour, by month, by season,
13 changes in patterns and hotspots, changes in
14 noncrime activities, such as collisions and
15 calls for service. But these are exactly the
16 types of questions that, when the
17 Massachusetts Gaming Commission contemplated
18 this project, these are the ones that we
19 wanted to have answered.

20 And why is that? It's because for
21 the very reason we want this data to be
22 useful. We want to provide a level of detail
23 that would directly help the local police
24 agencies anticipate problems as they -- before

1 they become bigger problems and respond to
2 emerging and changing issues.

3 Today, Christopher Bruce is going to
4 present to you the two-year report. That is
5 two years following the opening of Plainridge
6 Park casino. Preceding this, we had publicly
7 released reports at three months, at six
8 months, at one year. We provided data to
9 local police agencies at 18 months, all with
10 this attempt. We want to anticipate and we
11 want to respond, should there be issues that
12 arise.

13 This report we're excited to offer
14 to you to publicly release. It's the most
15 comprehensive report yet. By comprehensive, I
16 know that Christopher is going to do an
17 excellent job of reviewing the finer details
18 of this report and any issues that the
19 commission, as well as our local agencies,
20 should be aware of. So with that, I will turn
21 it over to you, Mr. Bruce.

22 MR. BRUCE: Thank you,
23 Commissioners. It's good to be here again.
24 We just heard from the Plainridge Park itself,

1 that they're receiving about 7,000 visitors
2 per day, which effectively doubles the
3 population of Plainville during the time that
4 those visitors there at the casino, so I think
5 my summary goes along really well with that,
6 because the types of activity that we saw
7 increase from a police perspective in the
8 Plainville area is very much the type of
9 activity that you would expect to increase
10 with a large influx of additional people on a
11 daily basis.

12 People, who, on their way in or out
13 stop at gas stations, stop at stores and lose
14 their telephones, lose their driver's
15 licenses, need directions, lock themselves out
16 of their cars, and then cause some additional
17 traffic issues along the routes in and out of
18 the community. And that's mostly what we saw
19 increase, among the six communities that
20 participated in this project.

21 Overall crime dropped in the six
22 communities, and property crime, especially,
23 was down. I'll talk a little bit about that.
24 Violent crime was up a little bit, but not in

1 a way that we could trace in any way to a
2 Plainridge Park influence. Most of what did
3 increase were calls for service, noncriminal
4 calls for service, lost property, general
5 service, reports from the community of --
6 complaining about traffic issues, complaining
7 about suspicious vehicles or other types of
8 suspicious activity. If they had truly been
9 anything criminal with that activity, they
10 would have resulted in more crime, so it was
11 more of just community concerns that we saw
12 there. And a couple of criminal issues that
13 we took a look at, including credit card
14 fraud. But, generally speaking, most of the
15 increases were in the area of traffic and
16 general calls for service.

17 During the period, some of the
18 agencies that we were working with hired new
19 people, hired a couple crime analysts. I got
20 new people in charge of coding their data,
21 which created some difficulties analyzing it
22 because they actually improved the way they
23 were reporting certain crimes, especially, in
24 North Attleboro. But that, they did so in a

1 way that made their current data inconsistent
2 with their past data, and so we had to
3 overcome that a little bit. But -- so that's
4 the general summary of what happened.

5 So these are the six communities,
6 you can see on the screen. Plainridge Park
7 annotated there as the dot. And all six of
8 these communities contributed instant level
9 calls for service and crime data to our study.
10 Not just statistics, but specific information
11 about each and every event that they have
12 responded to for the five years before
13 Plainridge Park opened, and the two years
14 after Plainridge Park opened. Dates, times,
15 demographics of the people involved, types of
16 property stolen, types of vehicles involved.
17 This allowed for, as Mark indicated, a much
18 greater depth of analysis of what had changed
19 than we could have done, if we had simply
20 gotten raw statistics, which is what most
21 previous studies have done.

22 So I took the data out of their
23 different, individual records management
24 systems and computer-aided dispatch systems,

1 merged them into a common database and
2 compared what happened in the various periods
3 after Plainridge Park opened to the years
4 before. Anything that significantly
5 increased, I took a careful look at with all
6 of the available data, plus some of the data
7 they didn't provide initially, but allowed me
8 to access on scene, such as police officers'
9 narratives, and more personal-identifying
10 information.

11 And so, in the report itself, which
12 you have in front of you, everything that was
13 above a certain threshold, I offer an
14 explanation for why I think that that category
15 increased or -- during the period. Most of
16 the time, it was untraceable to Plainridge
17 Park, but you can see the two cases in which
18 it was.

19 My report was reviewed by your own
20 research advisory committee. That was
21 extremely helpful. And they had some very
22 good comments that I incorporated into the
23 final one, and as well as the local police
24 chiefs. We had our usual meeting of those

1 chiefs, give them an opportunity to comment,
2 to object, to offer any additional context.
3 And those comments were also included in the
4 final report. And I'll say here, that there
5 has been really no controversy at all, I
6 think, in working with the local chiefs.
7 They've been in agreement with just about all
8 of the conclusions that I've come to.
9 They've -- you know, they've provided some
10 very helpful context, but we've had no real
11 disagreements, where I've said that something
12 was related and they didn't think so or vice
13 versa. And so, that's been a very positive
14 experience working with them.

15 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Can I just
16 interject there?

17 MR. BRUCE: Sure.

18 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: I think, a
19 lot of that, Christopher, is due to your --
20 the work that you've done with these chiefs
21 and their staff to make your work valuable to
22 them, I think has been tremendous.

23 MR. BRUCE: I hope so.

24 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Yeah. And I

1 think it's led to some of those communities,
2 sometimes with surrounding community monies,
3 hiring crime analysts. This has brought great
4 value. And I think they enjoy the dialogue.
5 You know, what do you think? What do you
6 think? That's my favorite part of the whole
7 project. But I think you've brought that
8 added value to them, they see -- they see
9 that, and that's made this very successful.

10 MR. BRUCE: Well, thank you. I,
11 certainly, hope so. So with many of the
12 crimes that we're dealing with, and especially
13 in terms of the calls for service that don't
14 rise to the level of criminal activity, we
15 don't often know who the perpetrator is.
16 We're talking about -- and I'm not saying
17 Plainridge -- the Plainville area has a unique
18 issue with this. Nationally, crimes like
19 burglary, thefts from vehicles, robbery, et
20 cetera, have detection rates in the, you know,
21 in the low double digits. So, you know,
22 between 10 and 20 percent of the time that
23 we -- do we solve it? Do we actually know who
24 committed the crime?

1 Because of that, you know, we don't
2 have a lot of direct evidence for this
3 offender had any kind of casino or gambling
4 motivation, or was in the area to use the
5 casino. So in order to compensate for that, I
6 had to develop a number of, sort of, indirect
7 methods to try to determine that it might --
8 there might be a casino relationship in play.
9 I, sort of, developed a rubric that you can
10 see on the screen and is explained in further
11 in the report, of different ways that we could
12 look at the circumstantial evidence and still
13 determine that there might be a relationship
14 to Plainridge Park, or, indeed, any casino in
15 the future by using this rubric.

16 And I won't go through all of these,
17 but you can see the various categories here.
18 So, obviously, if -- the crime has to have a
19 logical connection to the casino. There's
20 certain crimes that you just -- even if a
21 person was gambling motivated, you wouldn't
22 expect them to commit that particular type of
23 crime. If we saw more offenders or victims
24 coming from outside the area, that's a good

1 sign. Even if they don't explicitly say or we
2 don't know that they were in there -- in the
3 area to use Plainridge Park.

4 If we see the same category
5 increasing across multiple agencies, that's a
6 better sign than if only one agency reports an
7 increase. If we see similar crimes increasing
8 together, is a better sign than if only one
9 increases out of pack of a bunch of offenses
10 that are very much the same.

11 We look for spatial relationships.
12 Although, that's not as important in
13 Plainridge Park, where it's right off the
14 highway and there's no local public
15 transportation or foot traffic to the casino.
16 That's going to be a lot more important in the
17 MGM project, I think.

18 And then, I looked at statistics
19 statewide, as well as in the Plainridge area,
20 I can only do that for crime, unfortunately,
21 not calls for service. But still, if, you
22 know, things increased from the Plainville
23 area, but not anywhere else, or not in the
24 control communities. That's, obviously,

1 better evidence that there's a casino
2 relationship. The comparison communities are
3 listed there. I looked for groups of
4 communities of a similar composition, similar
5 population, similar crime rate off highways
6 with some retail presence, in addition to its
7 residential population.

8 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: What's the IBR
9 total?

10 MR. BRUCE: I'm sorry. IBR -- IBR
11 stands for incident base reporting. That's
12 their crime total for 2014, when I -- that was
13 the year that I had the statistics for, when I
14 established the comparison areas to begin
15 with. So, yeah, that's the sum of their
16 serious crimes. Comparison Area 1 got a
17 Cabela's Sporting Goods during this period, so
18 that threw off their numbers a little bit.
19 But overall, the comparison areas provided a
20 good way to look at what happened in
21 Plainville versus similar-sized communities?

22 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: And you say,
23 this is apparent, that they're right in line.
24 There's not a --

1 MR. BRUCE: Yeah.

2 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: They're right
3 there with other communities, similar-sized
4 communities, as far as their crime rates?

5 MR. BRUCE: Yes, exactly. Yeah. So
6 just quick notes on previous research. As
7 we've emphasized several times, almost all
8 previous research in this area has been done
9 based on aggregate statistics, just totals,
10 generally, based on Part 1 crimes, as reported
11 to the FBI every year. And its just -- it's
12 very limited data. It doesn't get into the
13 specific of -- you get all larcenies, for
14 instance, without being able to separate out
15 steps from vehicles, shoplifting, thefts from
16 buildings, pocket picking and so forth, and
17 without having any more specific data to work
18 with, other than the total.

19 So I can tell you, through the UCR
20 data, that robbery went up 20 percent
21 somewhere. But I can't tell you what types of
22 offenders are involved, what types of victims
23 are involved, where, physically, they
24 happened, and so forth. And that's the

1 different with this study, because we're
2 getting that data, we're getting that detail
3 from these agencies.

4 Studies in previous research have
5 been extraordinarily mixed, when it comes to
6 the impact of casinos on crime in the
7 surrounding communities. Some find that it
8 increases, some find that it doesn't, some --
9 even the ones that find that it increases find
10 the different crimes increase. And they might
11 increase initially and then drop off, or they
12 might not increase at all and then increase in
13 third, fourth year down the road. They're
14 very different. But I think it all has to do
15 with the variances in the casinos themselves,
16 and in the geography in which they're located.

17 And so, here we're going to have a
18 chance to study three very different types of
19 casinos, in fact, three very different
20 geographies. And it's going to be
21 interesting, to see how the studies compare,
22 after we've had a chance to look at MGM and
23 whatever Wynn ends up being called.

24 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Christopher, I was

1 going to save this for later, but since you
2 just brought this up, this seems, to me, to
3 be -- and it always has struck me as this is a
4 really labor-intensive project. Are you
5 staffed up, or how do you do -- how are you
6 going to do this?

7 MR. BRUCE: Mark keeps asking me
8 that. I understand that's a concern. No.
9 I -- I mean, yeah, by between 2021, you know,
10 you're going to be my full-time employer,
11 practically. But I have the bandwidth to
12 accommodate you.

13 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: You do?

14 MR. BRUCE: Yeah.

15 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Okay.

16 MR. BRUCE: As things are ramping up
17 with the different casinos opening in
18 Massachusetts, some of my other contracts are
19 dropping off, so I'm definitely prioritizing
20 this work. And if I need to, I'll get
21 assistance to help me.

22 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Right.

23 MR. VANDER LINDEN: Thank you for
24 asking that question, as well.

1 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: And, also, I think
2 you and Commissioner Cameron have been working
3 with -- I don't know about Everett yet, but,
4 certainly, with Springfield and the
5 surrounding communities. How is that going to
6 prepare those relationships?

7 MR. BRUCE: It's going very well.
8 They're on board and already contributing data
9 for the baseline study. So I've already
10 collected data from eight of the 12
11 participating communities, and the others are
12 just a matter of scheduling, so I haven't had
13 any serious concerns about participation from
14 any of them so far.

15 MR. VANDER LINDEN: And this is a
16 deliverable that we expect to have before the
17 commission by the end of the fiscal year, so
18 by June 30th we'll have that out and done.

19 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: "That," meaning
20 the baseline?

21 MR. VANDER LINDEN: Baseline for
22 Springfield and the surrounding communities.

23 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Right.

24 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: The kickoff

1 meeting up there, all of the surrounding
2 communities, host community, they all
3 participated. The room was full. Most of
4 them had already checked with the communities
5 down in the Plainville area, because that's
6 what cops will do and -- just to see what it's
7 like, is this something I should participate
8 in?

9 So we had a really good group
10 willing to participate. And, certainly,
11 Christopher's reputations precedes him. And
12 you know, the value-add to these, especially,
13 some of the smaller surrounding communities
14 that may not have the money to have their own
15 crime analyst. Certainly, Springfield has a
16 number of them and, you know, they're a large,
17 large agency. But all of them are willing.
18 And if there's one or two, we'll work on it.
19 But, yeah, I think -- I think that's well
20 underway, right, the base -- baseline --

21 MR. BRUCE: Yes.

22 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: And you're
23 not having issues so far?

24 MR. BRUCE: No. I'll let you know

1 if I do, but it's been -- it's been very
2 smooth so far. And that is a huge difference.
3 Springfield itself, the police department, has
4 a very large crime analysis unit. They're
5 very-well resourced, well-trained, and they're
6 going to be able to participate in this
7 project in the way that, you know, Plainville,
8 being as small as it is, just can't identify
9 that -- that type of position.

10 So the major findings are that -- as
11 I said earlier, violent crime was up in the
12 area of property, and total crimes were down.
13 And I'll talk about violent crime. I don't
14 think it's related to Plainridge Park at all,
15 and neither do the chiefs in the area.

16 The casino itself had a number of
17 incidents, of course. And the statistics are
18 offered in the report, in terms of thefts and,
19 you know, incidents of drunk patrons and so
20 forth. But overall, that led to a 10 percent
21 increase in property crime, and a 12 percent
22 increase in total crime in Plainville itself.
23 Again, that's exactly at the casino, right,
24 not considering anything that's happening in

1 the surrounding community. A zero percent
2 increase in violent crime, though. There's
3 virtually none at Plainridge Park, in terms of
4 assaults and robberies and so forth. It's all
5 property crime and, you know, disorderly and
6 so forth.

7 Throughout the region, total arrests
8 have been really significantly down. And that
9 has partly to do with some changes in the way
10 local agencies are applying a protective
11 custody statute to, effectively, arrest people
12 if they're intoxicated until they're no longer
13 a danger. But even if you control for that,
14 arrests in the area are pretty significantly
15 down.

16 The things that I thought were
17 likely related to presence of Plainridge Park
18 included a increase in credit card fraud
19 during the first year, although, it did not
20 persist into the second year, traffic
21 collisions on the feeder routes to the casino,
22 and then a bunch of calls for service in
23 Plainville itself that are related to just a
24 lot of extra people in town, as I said early.

1 Lots of property, suspicious activity, traffic
2 and parking complaints.

3 We saw a general increase in
4 activity at the types of places that you would
5 expect people to stop at or stay at in the
6 area, so the crime increased at hotels,
7 convenience stores and gas stations. Although
8 you when you -- it only tripped a threshold
9 when you consider crime in totality. If you
10 start looking at individual crimes, none of
11 them individually tripped any threshold but --
12 so there's just, you know, obviously more
13 activity at these types of places. Probably,
14 more people staying in the area, more people
15 stopping for gas and so forth. But it
16 doesn't -- it didn't manifest itself in
17 particular crimes, just, sort of, a total
18 increase in activity at those types of
19 locations.

20 This chart shows just total violent
21 crime and total property crime. You can see
22 that property crime plummet there.
23 Burglaries, auto thefts, thefts from vehicles.
24 And I don't think it's -- somebody asked me at

1 one of the chiefs' meetings, is this related
2 to, you know, the extra police presence in the
3 area, because we have more state police and so
4 forth, more local police in Plainville itself.
5 But that seems to mirror Massachusetts as a
6 whole. The state had a really good 2016 and
7 2017, when it came to property crime. And
8 Plainville benefited for that, as well as
9 everybody else.

10 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: I think, two
11 concerns that the chiefs opined about. One
12 was the violent crime, they really thought
13 that is opioid related.

14 MR. BRUCE: They did, yeah.

15 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: That was many
16 of them. And they had specific examples of
17 that.

18 MR. BRUCE: Right. As I'm going to
19 talk about, it seems to be domestic violence
20 that's increasing in the area, and there's a
21 drug concern with that. There's, you know,
22 economic -- overall economy concerns the
23 chiefs have voiced. It's really tough to tie
24 that type of increase to a specific cause, but

1 I did an exhaustive search of narratives of --
2 for anything like the words gambling,
3 Plainridge, casino, anything like that, and
4 that's just -- that's not showing up in any of
5 the reports. Let me cover that a little bit,
6 more in a second. Okay?

7 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Sure. Just
8 the other issue that at least one chief opined
9 about was the traffic.

10 MR. BRUCE: Yeah.

11 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: And what the
12 chief thought there was the traffic apps, like
13 Waze, have really been taken people off 495 or
14 pushing them to Route 1, or other back roads,
15 which has increased the -- so that was a very
16 interesting observation and something I hadn't
17 thought of.

18 MR. BRUCE: It was, yes. And I
19 won't be able to be sure on traffic collisions
20 until I look at some statewide data with
21 comparison areas for the same period. Again,
22 I'll talk about that in just a second.

23 Just some -- these are just some
24 example of the numbers that you'll find in the

1 report. There's tables and tables and tables
2 in the report for each agency, for the sum of
3 the total agency, so I'll leave you to peruse
4 that. But some of the -- the important things
5 to gather from this are the types of crimes
6 that people really are concerned might
7 increase in the area following the opening of
8 a casino, like burglary and thefts from
9 vehicles and robberies did not increase at
10 all. In fact, went down, in some cases, in
11 the area. And what did increase, at least as
12 you can see on this charge, simple assault,
13 credit card fraud and overall traffic
14 collisions.

15 You might remember my previous
16 lessons on this, but anything between negative
17 one and positive one would be totally normal.
18 Lower than negative one, higher than positive
19 one you start to get into this, this is
20 slightly unusual, but not anything to be
21 alarmed at area. And once it trips negative
22 two or increases above positive two for the
23 Z-Score, that's when things are really
24 unusual, things have changed a lot compared to

1 what their normal fluctuations are. And so, I
2 kind of use that -- I use -1.75 or positive
3 +1.75 as my threshold for when I start to
4 analyze a crime in much more detail. But not
5 very much trip that threshold in the positive,
6 direction, when it comes to traditional types
7 of crimes that people are worried about.

8 Compared to the rest of the state, I
9 just -- there are only three things that
10 flagged, really. So Plainville kind of
11 followed statewide trends. And this is just
12 for the 18-month period after it, because the
13 2017 wasn't available yet from the state. But
14 domestic-related crimes, as I said, went up in
15 the area, and that manifesting in the
16 kidnapping and simple assault increase. Those
17 kidnappings is very low numbers, but the
18 increase was all domestic related, confining
19 situations, where a victim was confined as
20 part of a fight and they charged with
21 kidnapping was part of that. The only one
22 that wasn't domestic related that
23 significantly was different in the Plainville
24 year versus the rest of the state was -- I'm

1 sorry, versus the control communities, was
2 credit card fraud, which I'll talk about in
3 just a second.

4 As far as Plainridge Park itself --
5 and this is something I'm, sort of, doing on
6 the side in these reports. I was contracted
7 mostly to analyze what happens in the
8 surrounding community, but the state -- the
9 Gaming Enforcement Unit has been providing me
10 the statistics for the casino itself, so I was
11 happy to include it in the report. And you
12 can see some of the different trends that
13 we've see there. When I say at least --

14 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: What's the period
15 of time?

16 MR. BRUCE: This is for the two
17 years.

18 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Oh, this is the
19 two years?

20 MR. BRUCE: Yep. The numbers
21 themselves have actually been higher. What
22 happens is, they give me statistics and then
23 they write a little narrative, when something
24 is uniquely notable or when an arrest is made.

1 So, you know, by reading those, I get a sense
2 of what some of the trends are. But for the
3 ones I didn't write any narrative on, don't
4 know exactly what happened. So when I say "at
5 least," it means there were that many
6 narratives that supported that particular
7 trend, but they could easily be doubled that
8 total number, you know, if I have a report on
9 every single crime.

10 So those are some of the trends that
11 we're seeing specifically at the casino, that
12 are being responded to by the Gaming
13 Enforcement Unit, as well as casino security
14 and the Plainville Police Department.

15 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Would you
16 agree, that those numbers are not high for a
17 two-year period?

18 MR. BRUCE: No. I'd say, they're
19 about commensurate with a similarly -- any
20 facility that draws 7,000 people a day, you
21 know, Walmart or a -- what am I thinking?
22 Movie theater.

23 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Right.

24 MR. BRUCE: Couldn't think of the

1 right term.

2 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Yeah, a
3 similar size.

4 MR. BRUCE: You'd see very similar,
5 you know, statistics. The trends are,
6 obviously, a little different. Casinos are
7 the only places you can steal TITO tickets and
8 so forth. But generally speaking, we'd see
9 similar property crime and violent --
10 probably, higher violent crime numbers at a
11 place -- at any facility that draws thousands
12 of people a day.

13 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Probably, the
14 only place you can damage a machine by
15 spilling a drink.

16 MR. BRUCE: Yeah, exactly.

17 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Christopher,
18 you have one of the notes here, the high
19 solvability rate, especially in the TITO, is
20 that generally true for some of the other
21 categories?

22 MR. BRUCE: Is it for --

23 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: The high
24 solvability.

1 MR. BRUCE: The high solvability
2 rate is largely just because of the
3 surveillance they have at the facility. So
4 whenever anybody reports they've had something
5 stolen, they can always -- they can go back to
6 the cameras, they can identify who did it,
7 they can trace that person out to the garage,
8 they can follow their car. I mean, they know
9 everything about the person, you know, within
10 45 minutes.

11 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: I don't know
12 that all other facilities have the ability to
13 do the legwork that we've done. Meaning, they
14 see the camera, they see the individual, they
15 see them in the garage, they get the license
16 plate, they follow it up by actually going to
17 a residence.

18 MR. BRUCE: Right.

19 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: I mean,
20 they've done that level of work, where I'm
21 just not sure that --

22 MR. BRUCE: No. Department --

23 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Atlantic City
24 did not have that kind of staff that they

1 could follow up to that extent.

2 MR. BRUCE: No. Yeah, if any
3 criminals are watching -- you know, listening
4 to this, committing a crime at a casino is
5 really, really dumb. Don't do it because of
6 that very reason.

7 Okay. So on Plainville itself, if
8 the physical facility, that exact address
9 hadn't been there, they'd be looking at, you
10 know, 10 percent fewer property crimes and
11 12 percent fewer total crimes for the year.
12 But here's your comparison to some of the
13 other top call-for-service locations in the
14 area. And you can see, you know, they vary,
15 depending on the nature of the location and
16 the types of customers you can get and what
17 you can do there.

18 But, generally speaking, Plainridge
19 Park is now the -- you know, the number one
20 call for service location for the Plainville
21 Police Department, but it's about the same as
22 the number one call for service locations for
23 other communities in the area. In fact, for
24 Wrentham, the village outlets pretty much

1 dominate everything that they get there. And
2 it's about the same as what they were doing at
3 Plainville Commons, which was their number two
4 locations, it's the shopping center close to
5 Plainridge Park, before Plainridge Park
6 opened.

7 So it's -- you know, they got a
8 36 percent increase in sworn officers at the
9 Plainville Police Department, in anticipation
10 of the casino opening, and they had a 12
11 percent increase in total crime, so I think
12 the ratio worked out fairly well for them in
13 that regard.

14 On credit card fraud specifically, I
15 reported last year that it had increased.
16 And, indeed, it did for the first year. It
17 was up almost immediately after Plainridge
18 Park opened. It persisted being high for the
19 year, and then it dropped in the second year.
20 So it's a trend that did not continue. I
21 still think that there was, probably, a
22 relationship there. That doesn't mean -- you
23 can have temporal trends that don't continue,
24 but my conviction comes from the types of

1 locations that the stolen credit cards were
2 being used and the types of things that were
3 being bought, and the fact that the other
4 areas of the state and the comparison
5 communities didn't have the same increase.

6 So there's a lot of circumstantial
7 evidence there. And I think what was
8 happening was people were coming up to use the
9 new casino and, you know, bringing stolen
10 credit cards with them. I'm not talking about
11 the a lot of people. The total number is like
12 a few dozen over a two-year period. So it's
13 enough to trip the thresholds, but not like
14 the cities are being ravaged by this epidemic
15 or something like that. But during that
16 period, we saw a lot of use of stolen credit
17 cards to purchase food, liquor, gift cards,
18 cigarettes. You know, things like that that
19 for short-term use.

20 And so, my hypothesis was people
21 were coming from out of town, bringing the
22 cards with them as part of their -- you know,
23 their weekend stay, using them to purchase
24 things like food and liquor, and saving their

1 money for use at the facility itself. Whether
2 I'm right or wrong, it didn't continue. And
3 so, we'll keep monitoring that. But it was a
4 short-term trend, even if it was related
5 specifically to Plainridge Park.

6 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Pleased it
7 didn't continue.

8 MR. BRUCE: No. Right.

9 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Do I remember
10 correctly, though, that the chiefs disagreed
11 with you on that?

12 MR. BRUCE: They didn't disagree so
13 much as I think they just --

14 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: They had no
15 evidence.

16 MR. BRUCE: Like I -- yeah, as in my
17 case, I couldn't identify a specific offender
18 that was clearly, you know, there for casino
19 reasons.

20 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Right.

21 MR. BRUCE: But, again, we're
22 talking about a crime that we only know about
23 5 percent of the -- who the offenders are. So
24 it's a tough one to ever attribute motive to a

1 specific offender.

2 Each individual agency would have
3 only seen an increase of, maybe, a dozen
4 incidents per year, so one a month. I mean,
5 that's not something that's going to be --
6 that's going to trip any radars at each police
7 station. It only comes into focus when you're
8 looking at the data across multiple
9 communities, across a multiyear period.

10 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Chris,
11 really quickly on the slide, and maybe it was
12 just me. I didn't quite understand the
13 labeling of it. It's illegal credit card
14 use --

15 MR. BRUCE: Yes.

16 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: -- just
17 those types of purchases out of overall --

18 MR. BRUCE: This one is just for
19 those types of purchases.

20 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Okay. Out
21 of overall illegal credit card use?

22 MR. BRUCE: Out of overall illegal
23 credit card use, yeah.

24 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Okay. Thank

1 you.

2 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: In the -- okay, in
3 the six communities. Right.

4 MR. BRUCE: Now, when it comes to
5 traffic collisions, we saw a modest increase,
6 pretty much, almost every month throughout the
7 two-year period in the area, as well as on the
8 state roads leading into the area. You can
9 see by the chart here, that the increase
10 actually started before Plainridge Park
11 opened, in January and February of 2015. But
12 you also might remember that that was that
13 year we had that awful winter, and that
14 increase is, basically, just like two days
15 that had know snow in the middle of day and
16 just caused widespread collisions. So if I'd
17 controlled for those, it wouldn't have been
18 such an increase earlier in the year.

19 Anyway, this is an area where,
20 unless you're from North Attleboro or certain
21 places in Attleboro, Google Maps is going to
22 route you up 95 to 495 and then right off the
23 exit to the casino. So it doesn't surprise me
24 that we didn't see a much bigger increase in

1 traffic collisions in the area, because local
2 roads, generally, aren't, I don't think, being
3 taken to the casino, although, we only know
4 that from a traffic study. So it makes sense
5 to me that it was just a modest, a slight
6 increase for most months as the year went by.

7 And here you see it by hour of the
8 day. And this, kind of, makes sense to me,
9 too. It follows, sort of, not just -- not so
10 much patterns of when the casino was open, but
11 patterns of when extra traffic coming to the
12 casino might conflict with commuting traffic
13 in the area on a daily base anyway. You see
14 the biggest spike there, in the 5:00 p.m. to
15 7:00 p.m. hour, when people are trying to, you
16 know, get home and then other people are
17 coming into the community to make use of the
18 casino. Again, this is all hypothesis at this
19 point. But it logically makes sense to me,
20 that you would see this particular pattern,
21 given the extra traffic coming to the area.

22 And the state police reported --
23 they didn't -- I don't have past data from
24 them to establish a good baseline, but just

1 compared to the previous couple of years,
2 there was enough of an increase on state
3 roads. I think, you know, it makes sense that
4 an extra 7,000 cars a day, some of them are
5 going to occasionally get involved in
6 accidents or disrupt traffic patterns enough
7 that you're going to see that.

8 However, I'm currently, right now,
9 in the process of collecting data from the
10 state department of transportation for the
11 period ending 2016. They don't close their
12 data sets for awhile after the year ends. But
13 with that data, I'll be able to look at
14 comparison areas to see if the increase is
15 unique to Plainville, or if it's something --
16 the local chiefs have repeatedly said it's
17 probably just related to extra driving in
18 general, or, perhaps, the Waze phenomenon that
19 Commissioner Cameron talked about.

20 So I'll be able to reach stronger
21 conclusions about traffic collisions with that
22 study, which will be completed this year. And
23 there's -- I'm sorry, there's the state police
24 statistics you can see again. 2017 was quite

1 a bit higher than the previous years.

2 Now, some things that didn't -- I
3 don't think were Plainridge Park related, but
4 we reported to the communities about so we
5 could help them intercede, regardless of
6 whether they had anything to do with the
7 casino, includes increases in fraud in
8 general. I'm talking about con games. There
9 was especially an increase in
10 telephone-related fraud, people calling up
11 pretending to be from the IRS, from your
12 credit card company, representing family
13 members in trouble, things like that. And
14 there just -- there isn't any logical reason
15 that that would increase in these surrounding
16 communities specifically, even if it was
17 casino related. But the fact is, that
18 category's been increasing all over the state
19 and in comparison areas, as well.

20 And the same with identity theft and
21 identity fraud, those categories are fast
22 increasing across the nation, really. And so
23 I don't -- even though the increase in the
24 Plainville area was quite significant, it

1 didn't outpace the control communities, and I
2 don't think that there was a relationship to
3 Plainridge Park.

4 Domestic assault and what we call
5 family offenses, which includes things like
6 violations of restraining orders or child
7 neglect increased in the six communities. And
8 they did increase in the six communities in a
9 way that was higher than in the control
10 communities and in the state as a whole. And
11 we're very sensitive to the idea, that problem
12 gambling could cause things like domestic
13 violence and increase in domestic disputes and
14 so forth. But we just don't see any evidence
15 of it in any of the cases.

16 And unlike other types of crime that
17 I talked about, this is a type of crime where
18 we generally have detailed information about
19 all the participants, and we know what their
20 specific motivations were, what prompted a
21 specific fight, or what types of issues the
22 the family is having, these show up in the
23 narratives.

24 And I searched them all -- three of

1 the communities, I searched, literally, every
2 single report they had of domestic violence
3 for the two years. The other three, I took a
4 sample and I searched them. And not in a
5 single one could I find anything that had
6 anything to do with gambling, casinos, that
7 type of relationship. And we'd expect that
8 evidence, that flag to show up in at least a
9 couple, if there was any kind of relationship
10 between gambling and the increase in domestic
11 violence. So I don't think it's Plainridge
12 Park related. The chiefs believe that it was
13 more of just a general economic trend --
14 there's a strong correlation generally,
15 between domestic violence and the way that an
16 economy is progressing. And the opioid
17 problem, as well, came up as an explanation.

18 I hesitate to offer those as
19 alternatives without stronger evidence, but
20 what I can say is that there's no evidence of
21 a gambling relationship in that.

22 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: But this is
23 the added value that I spoke about earlier.
24 It doesn't have anything to do with the

1 casino, but the chiefs get to sit around and
2 say, okay, what do we think? What are we
3 seeing? And, also, the miscoding. You know,
4 it gives an opportunity to clean up some of
5 the coding.

6 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Yeah, that's been
7 a problem.

8 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Which is
9 just -- it helps everyone understand the
10 issues better.

11 MR. BRUCE: And, also, Wrentham had
12 a big increase in activity at the premium
13 outlets, including additional incidents of
14 shoplifting, theft and fraud. But that seemed
15 to be related to reporting practices at the
16 outlets themselves and not tied to the casino.

17 And I think -- oh, just a chart
18 showing how assault has been increasing. So
19 the fact that it's been increasing so much as
20 residences, rather than nonresidences,
21 suggests more of a domestic relationship.

22 So upcoming, obviously, we're
23 working on MGM right now and collecting the
24 data for the baseline report. We'll be

1 presenting a 30-month report to the police
2 chiefs after April of this year, just to keep
3 them updated on any new trends that might have
4 cropped up in the past six months. I'm going
5 to be providing some training to the agencies
6 that are participating in this project, sort
7 of, as a way to thank them and reward them.
8 But the connection that I use to get the data
9 out of their systems can also be used by them
10 to get their own data, and ask any number of
11 questions of it that might be casino-related
12 or noncasino-related, and so I'm going to
13 train them on those techniques in a class
14 coming up in May. We'll have the MGM baseline
15 study in June, as well as the traffic study
16 for Plainridge Park.

17 And then, throughout the year, we'll
18 have to, obviously, do the kickoff meeting for
19 the Everett casino. We'll have the three-year
20 report for Plainridge Park at the end of the
21 year, and then the 90-day report for MGM about
22 a year from now. Any other questions for me?

23 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Questions?

24 Comments?

1 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: No. Just
2 really well done, and I think we're lucky to
3 have you on our team.

4 MR. BRUCE: Well, thank you very
5 much. It's been a pleasure.

6 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Thank you very
7 much.

8 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Thank you.

9 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Thank you.
10 Good stuff.

11 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Thank you, Mark.
12 We'll have a quick break while you get set up.

13
14 (A recess was taken)

15
16 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: All right. We are
17 reconvening public meeting 237, I think it is,
18 at about 12:05, and we are back to
19 Director Vander Linden. Excuse me,
20 commissioner Macdonald, I neglected to ask if
21 you had any follow-up questions for
22 Christopher Bruce. I assume you would have
23 spoken up, if you did.

24 COMMISSIONER MACDONALD: Well, I

1 actually did, but it was too late.

2 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: I'm sorry. My
3 apologies. I'm sorry. That was my fault.
4 But yell out, if you need to get our
5 attention. Okay, Director Vander Linden.

6 MR. VANDER LINDEN: Okay. Great. I
7 am joined with Teresa Fiore, who's our program
8 manager for Research and Responsible Gaming,
9 and Marlene Warner, the executive director of
10 the Mass Council on Compulsive Gambling.

11 We have two agenda items for you
12 that I think kind of go together very well,
13 the responsible gaming framework, followed by
14 March 1st is the kickoff of National Problem
15 Gambling Awareness Month.

16 So first, the framework. The four
17 commissioners here are very well aware of the
18 journey that we've been on to explore this
19 area of responsible gaming, and to ultimately
20 build the original responsible gaming
21 framework. It kicked off in 2013, when we
22 hosted a responsible gaming forum, brought in
23 a number of academic policy and advocacy
24 experts. That followed by an extensive search

1 of relevant research that could inform a
2 framework. We employed the expertise of
3 Dr. Jeff Marotta of Problem Gambling
4 Solutions. We certainly, as we always do with
5 any item of importance, we seek out the
6 feedback of the public, we seek out the
7 feedback of -- well, at that time, were our
8 applicants not licensees -- licensees yet.

9 The responsible gaming framework,
10 the original, was adopted in 2014. I don't
11 think I understood the value of that
12 framework, in 2014. And it's only been over
13 the course of the past four years that I think
14 I truly appreciate that.

15 What the framework has done, is it's
16 set a rock solid foundation for our
17 orientation of how we value responsible
18 gaming. No just responsible gaming in this,
19 sort of, very, sort of, one-plane approach of
20 responsible gaming is up to the individual,
21 but this very multidimensional understanding
22 of responsible gaming that is our
23 responsibility, it's our licensees'
24 responsibility, it's the individual who

1 chooses to gamble, their responsibility. That
2 sort of orientation that is outlined in the
3 framework, I think, is incredibly powerful.
4 It makes it incredibly clear, as well, to our
5 licensees, that we see this as a partnership,
6 not as putting the responsibility squarely on
7 one individual or entity.

8 The responsible gaming framework
9 also led to, I think, a number of powerful and
10 very important programs that have spawned out
11 of that. The GameSense program that is run by
12 the Mass Council on Compulsive Gambling is a
13 key partner with us. PlayMyWay is a budgeting
14 tool that is the first of its kind in the
15 nation, and our voluntary self-exclusion
16 program. And while voluntary self-exclusion
17 isn't necessarily unique, our approach to how
18 we value that and how we approach it, I
19 believe, is incredibly unique.

20 All of these strategies, all of
21 these tactics are open for debate that were in
22 the -- that first version of the responsible
23 gaming framework. They're intended to -- the
24 framework was intended to be flexible, as we

1 -- we as a commission learn, as additional
2 evidence becomes available, as we seek out and
3 value additional feedback along the way. And
4 so, it was in December of 2016 we said, let's
5 reopen this. Let's take a look at the work
6 that has been done, let's engage this process
7 once again to begin building a version two of
8 this framework.

9 We did some, I think, really
10 important stuff in this. We sought out -- for
11 example, we sought out the feedback of
12 additional groups. I believe it was at the
13 suggestion of Marlene, who said, why don't you
14 he we seek out the advice of the recovery
15 community? Individuals that have been
16 profoundly impacted by problem gambling, ask
17 them what they think about this framework, and
18 get their thoughts about what could have been
19 different for them. What could have been in
20 place that made a difference for them. I
21 think that that was one of the more incredible
22 and powerful meetings that we had leading up
23 to this -- this version two.

24 We went back and opened up our

1 examination of the additional research that is
2 out there. We went to our licensees, who were
3 applicants, now licensees, and we sought their
4 feedback. We took it to the Public Health
5 Trust Fund Executive Committee, who, in 2013
6 and '14 weren't -- was not assembled at that
7 point. At this point, they're a powerful
8 voice, in terms of a public health approach to
9 responsible gaming, and set the priorities of
10 Public Health Trust Fund that's under the
11 gaming commission -- or under the Expanded
12 Gaming Act. I'm sorry. That's the overview.

13 We continue to work with
14 Dr. Jeff Marotta. We had a very fantastic
15 steering committee that included Marlene and
16 Teresa, and Commissioner Zuniga, and, again,
17 Dr. Jeff Marotta. I wasn't sure what would
18 come from it, back in December 2016,
19 whether -- I like the framework a lot, and I
20 continue to find it very useful. But I guess
21 that's the point where you should probably --
22 it's still a good time to crack it open. We
23 found a lot. We made a number of revisions.
24 And I present to you a memo with all of the

1 revisions. I won't go through every single
2 one. But, if I may, just provide for you the
3 highlights of the changes that we made.

4 We introduced the concept of
5 positive play, and we integrated that
6 throughout the framework. Where we talk about
7 responsible gaming, responsible gaming is
8 really how services -- the provision of gaming
9 services, and doing it in a way that values
10 responsible gaming. Positive play is more of
11 focus on the player and what attributes that
12 that player has that would lead them to a path
13 where they do not experience harm. And so,
14 what does that look like?

15 It goes hand in hand with this
16 concept of low-risk gambling guidelines, which
17 our SEIGMA, or Magic team are taking a close
18 look at. And I'm excited to integrate
19 positive play into the framework. I'm also
20 very interested, you know, learnings that we
21 will receive from the cohort study that will
22 lead us down this path of understanding what
23 low-risk gambling guidelines look like. We
24 introduce the concept of the step-to-care

1 approach as a guiding principle through the
2 framework. That goes hand in hand with the
3 informed decision-making model that we used
4 and rely on heavily in version one.

5 And, finally, it's this idea of how
6 are we encouraging innovation. Not just from
7 us, but from our licensees. And I think that
8 was clearly on display, when was that? Last
9 month, when the commission said, we're going
10 to move forward with PlayMyWay, but we want to
11 do that in partnership with our licensees.
12 Not handed down as a regulation but a
13 partnership.

14 And part of that is -- I think it
15 will create some challenges. But I think one
16 of the powerful pieces of that direction is
17 that it will allow a more -- or, hopefully,
18 foster a more innovative approach to doing so.
19 And we carry that through and forward in the
20 responsible gaming framework.

21 There are a number of other changes.
22 Not least of which is the pretty amazing look
23 of the new framework, by which I want to call
24 out our Mike Sangalang, who, I think his

1 skills in this area are in fine display,
2 through the way that it's been reformatted.
3 So thank you -- thank you, Mike.

4 I guess, at this point, rather than
5 kind of taking it step by step or strategy by
6 strategy, I thought I would open it up for
7 feedback and suggestions. But if you would
8 like me to, kind of, walk through strategy by
9 strategy, I can certainly do that, as well.

10 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Well, it
11 might be helpful just to point out
12 improvements from the first version.

13 MR. VANDER LINDEN: Yeah.

14 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Could I just --
15 before you do the point by point, I had two,
16 kind of, overview questions that I wanted to
17 -- or issues that I wanted to put out there to
18 hear from you, and we can do that,
19 Commissioner.

20 One is, there's a lot of discussion
21 and, at some times, criticism of the model --
22 of informed consent model or, sort of,
23 paradigm because it suggests that the
24 responsibility lies with the consumer, with

1 the player, not with the licensee, or with the
2 operators, and that it's, sort of, a copout
3 on -- you know, give them a lot of
4 information, but then it's up to them. You
5 cut them loose and there's no real burden on
6 the operators. You know, how do you speak to
7 that and rationalize where you've come down
8 and how you walk that line?

9 MR. VANDER LINDEN: I would say --

10 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Marlene, too, if
11 you're interested.

12 MR. VANDER LINDEN: Not all
13 information is presented equally. You can put
14 a brochure out at a cage that talks about the
15 probability and odds, and you could, in
16 essence, be accomplishing that informed
17 consent. But is that useful, and are you
18 truly providing that information in a way that
19 people will use and digest and inform their
20 gambling decisions?

21 We took the approach of, let's think
22 about this in a number of different ways to
23 create this informed consent to provide
24 information in a way that people digest and

1 they use, as they walk on to the gaming floor
2 and make that gaming -- that decision. So
3 that it -- the buck stops with the individual
4 that sits down at a machine, or sits down at a
5 table. But I think we all have a shared
6 responsibility of making sure that it's
7 available in locations that make sense. Make
8 sure that the content of what's being
9 presented is in a way that rings true with the
10 individual that's reading it. Making sure
11 that you do it in a way that offers it in many
12 different formats and whether that's a -- it
13 could still be a brochure, but it could
14 also be a discussion with a GameSense adviser
15 or engagement with a very interactive tool
16 like PlayMyWay.

17 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: It's
18 essentially the step-care principles that you
19 described earlier, that flows through many
20 areas. That's just one of them. The
21 information dissemination, if you will.

22 MR. VANDER LINDEN: Right.

23 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: But that's --
24 that flows through the document.

1 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Did you want to
2 add to that, Marlene?

3 MS. WARREN: I would just say, that
4 I think that the important piece about this is
5 that, instead of it being reactive, it's
6 really proactive. It's more from a public
7 health approach and a prevention model, that
8 we're allowing peopling to have the
9 information they need to be able to empower
10 them, and to make an informed decision moving
11 forward. And that decision could be to walk
12 out of that casino. So it's not as if we're
13 only offering it in the casino environment.
14 It's a multifaceted approach. And I think
15 that's what's really the essence and the
16 strength of this document.

17 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: And it takes -- it
18 takes informed consent to a level, as you
19 implement it, that I don't think comes to
20 people's minds. When you think about informed
21 consent, you're thinking about having a lot of
22 brochures, or when you go to the doctor's
23 office and they give you eight pages of paper
24 and you sign it and say, yeah, it's okay to

1 cut my leg off.

2 But, you know, you put something
3 like PlayMyWay, which is a very
4 interventionist means of communicating
5 information. And, you know, part of your
6 interpretation of informed consent is that the
7 operator must provide a tool by which you can
8 be informed of your losses, as you go along
9 and make -- so that's part of it, I think,
10 too. It can be used as a copout. It can be
11 used as, hey, we got brochures all over the
12 place. You know, just -- all they got to do
13 is just read the brochures and we're fine.
14 But you take it to a much more intense level.
15 And it does imply -- it does more than imply.
16 It compels participation on the part of the
17 operators, as well.

18 MS. WARREN: I would just add to
19 that, that the framework, I think, has a nice
20 blend of regulatory pieces, and then
21 collaborative approaches, as Mark addressed
22 earlier. And so, it does just what you're
23 saying. I think it allows for strict
24 guidelines, but also, some creative

1 approaches, and has been informed by a number
2 of different parties and stakeholders. So
3 that speaks to -- it's not just people writing
4 things in brochures that they think have to go
5 out per regulation. It's really a more
6 blended approach and an engaged approach.

7 So, I mean, I think this framework
8 continues to be so incredibly strong because
9 it is lived out day to day by people whose
10 whole job is to meet the players where they're
11 at. And so, those GameSense advisers, so
12 essential to the making up the vast majority
13 of this framework really come to life every
14 day.

15 MR. VANDER LINDEN: Yeah, that's
16 good. Right.

17 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: The other question
18 I was going to ask is -- relates to some of
19 your work, Commissioner Zuniga. You laid out
20 a bunch of things that the operators must do.
21 You know, they have to have a executive
22 committee, a responsible gaming executive
23 committee and have some programs and so forth.
24 Do we audit -- at the moment we only have one

1 facility, but do we audit the facility, to be
2 sure they're doing the things that are in our
3 plan?

4 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Yeah. Well --
5 do you want to answer that or let me --

6 MR. VANDER LINDEN: Yeah. I mean,
7 I -- let me take a quick stab at this. There
8 are certain things, if it's a regulation, that
9 we can -- this is intended to provide the
10 orientation and guidelines, and in many
11 different tactics, not all of which are
12 regulations. Where there's regulations, where
13 there's responsible gaming plan that our
14 licensees present to us and we approve, we can
15 do -- we can audit that.

16 I think, if I were to think about
17 where we're going with this Responsible Gaming
18 Framework, once it's adopted and thinking down
19 the line, I think something more like -- not
20 an audit, but a review and some feedback that
21 would encourage cooperation, encourage
22 innovation on behalf of our licensees so that
23 we can work together, again, to the end that
24 we're creating a culture that is -- fosters

1 responsible gaming, positive play.

2 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Let me just
3 supplement that with there's -- we have, in
4 the works, the idea that of -- in this
5 compliance group that I'm part of, to have a
6 midterm review of the license of
7 Plainridge Park, of which the responsible
8 gaming plan, the one that they submitted to us
9 and we approve, could be an essential
10 component. There's others. And that's -- you
11 know, that's one of the things that, again, as
12 Mark suggests, the word "audit" carries all
13 kinds of connotations. We do a lot of audit,
14 by the way, on many instances. And that's
15 kept a lot of people busy quite a bit.
16 Namely, on the monies and the internal
17 controls and what have you. But the intention
18 is to do a midterm review that will include
19 the responsible gaming implementation.

20 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Yeah, good. Okay.
21 Great. So go ahead now, if anybody wanted
22 to -- have other --

23 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: No. I
24 thought it just might be helpful to just point

1 out some of the changes in the two documents,
2 the version one and version two.

3 MR. VANDER LINDEN: Sure. A couple
4 of things. Right off the -- right from the
5 start, I think that you'll see that we
6 integrated our research, our research and
7 evaluation. Upfront, we integrate data from
8 the SEIGMA study, as well as Magic, on page
9 eight, so I guess, really, pages five through
10 eight. That's been really important. We have
11 some preliminary data, preliminary evaluation
12 that, I think, support some of the initiatives
13 that we have underway. We want to highlight
14 some of that -- that data, as well.

15 We revised the key terms to be
16 consistent with the other -- other -- those
17 that are used in the with the Mass Gaming
18 Commission. So in version one we talked about
19 a responsible gaming information center. It
20 was before we even conceptualized what -- we
21 had the concept, but we didn't have the
22 GameSense to match that up. So we're starting
23 go call out, by name, GameSense and PlayMyWay.

24 We went into the area of talking

1 about responsible gaming, as it relates to
2 digital gaming applications. And this is
3 something we -- we stuck it, pretty much,
4 right to the brick and mortar casino
5 operations in version one. We're recognize
6 that the nature of gaming continues to evolve,
7 and responsible gaming needs to evolve with
8 that.

9 The American Gaming Association
10 updated their code of conduct. And as it
11 relates to marketing, we made sure that we
12 updated our code, as well, or our tactics, as
13 well, to reflect some of those changes. We
14 went back, and strategy five we worked closely
15 with Todd Grossman to make sure that our
16 strategy five, as it relates to high-risk
17 financial transactions, is reflective of the
18 work of the commission.

19 We added a new tactic in that
20 strategy five that dealt with ATM exclusion.
21 So this is something that technology exists to
22 allow individuals to exclude from ATM
23 transactions at a casino. It's not very well
24 used, and I think that there's all sorts of

1 potential there. Just as somebody might
2 voluntarily self-exclude, but below that,
3 exclude from marketing, exclude from credit.
4 Perhaps, they want to exclude from hash
5 activity from an ATM machine, as well.

6 And I credit PPC, actually, for
7 pointing that one and that possibility even
8 out to us. So it's another example of
9 innovative -- innovation that comes through
10 partnership, as opposed to us doing our own
11 homework.

12 MR. BEDROSIAN: Which you do.

13 MR. VANDER LINDEN: Which we do, by
14 the way. We absolutely do. We added a new --
15 we revised strategy six to delineate, sort of,
16 engaging the community from within the casino,
17 as well as engaging the community outside --
18 outside of the casino. These casinos,
19 especially a casino like Plainridge Park
20 Casino, and even MGM, are -- they are part of
21 the community. They are -- they're a local,
22 regional casinos. And their involvement, as
23 they very well know, part of their success is
24 largely dependent on engaging within the

1 community and being good stewards within the
2 community.

3 And, finally, we added in a new
4 strategy, strategy seven, that dealt with
5 evaluation and assuring that we are paying
6 attention, our licensees are paying attention
7 to research that we're creating, or evidence
8 that we're creating, as well as more broadly
9 evidence that is being created, and responding
10 to that as we jointly, in partnership, advance
11 these tactics and create new tactics. Did I
12 miss anything else, Marlene and Teresa, and
13 Enrique, of things --

14 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Yeah. Let me
15 mention a couple of things to that end. I
16 think that's a great summary. Let me just
17 mention, I was -- I have been part of the last
18 few -- the initial discussions and then the
19 last few, really, working phone calls, and in
20 some instances, working meetings, in revision
21 mode.

22 If we simply had a document
23 presented to us in full revision mode, I
24 believe it would be too, too busy, given that

1 there had been a lot of changes, some of which
2 are necessary just by terminology, and that
3 may not necessarily be that big of a policy
4 change, which is why I think to format works
5 to be presented here. We could all go back
6 and look at them side to side, and very
7 quickly see the differences.

8 I'm going to -- I want to get into a
9 couple of them in a few minutes. But let me
10 also mention, first, that what I think I
11 brought to this group, if I can say so myself,
12 was the balance between what was clearly a
13 tendency to try -- to add a lot more detail,
14 because we obviously have a lot more detail.
15 We have five more years.

16 So where we first started doing a
17 lot of basic principles and that was great,
18 and as you mentioned, we all like that, we now
19 have five years of GameSense and PlayMyWay,
20 and information and whatnot, and there was
21 what I thought at times, key times only, not
22 often, a tendency to try to write a
23 regulation. And I was, at least, there a
24 couple of times to say -- to remind people,

1 let's make sure this is not a regulation,
2 there's regulations behind it in some key
3 areas here. Let's not try to be so specific
4 that it misses the purpose of this being a
5 framework.

6 So having said that, I can get into
7 a couple that I think, you know, I'd be good
8 to point out to my fellow commissioners just
9 to get their sense. My understanding is that
10 we'll get -- hopefully, get some really good
11 feedback from -- you know, from the community,
12 from many -- our licensees. I understand
13 we're going to present this at the conference
14 that the Mass council hosts later this month,
15 and that would just be an ongoing process. Is
16 that sort of...

17 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Yeah, that's
18 helpful.

19 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: That's great,
20 yeah. Great.

21 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Also, Mark,
22 the survey results, those are very high
23 numbers.

24 MR. VANDER LINDEN: Yeah.

1 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: That's really
2 goods -- it's a sense that that program is
3 really working well for people.

4 MR. VANDER LINDEN: Yeah. I think
5 timing was right for a number of these
6 different initiatives, in terms of how well
7 technology works and people's acceptance and
8 value of some of the resources that we're
9 offering.

10 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: So I wanted to
11 go to -- if that's okay, to one principle
12 here. I'll try to keep it at a high level.

13 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: What page?

14 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: On page 20, on
15 the voluntary self-exclusion. And this is
16 something that we now have firsthand
17 experience with this. And this is the
18 sentence that reads on the second paragraph,
19 that, "gaming wins and losses by banned
20 individuals will be transferred to the MGC
21 Gaming Revenue Fund."

22 And one thing, and we talked about
23 this, and I think it's, perhaps, relevant to
24 highlight here for future reconciling, my

1 understanding is, that when we -- or my
2 recollection is -- thinking about this when we
3 drafted this was, that these -- it's important
4 to communicate to the player and the casino,
5 that if somebody is in violation -- is bound
6 to be in violation of their voluntary
7 self-exclusion, then, that's it. The credits,
8 the jackpots, whatever had happened up until
9 that point is actually, by statute, had to be
10 directed to the Gaming Revenue Fund.

11 What this language has translated,
12 or has resulted in, practically or in reality,
13 is that then the gaming agents and the casino
14 have to have found themselves trying to have
15 to go back to the history of that individual,
16 at the property, to try to determine what may
17 have been a win and a loss, because for PPC
18 and for the Gaming Revenue Fund those
19 categories are different.

20 If there's some kind of loss, or
21 some kind of win, let's say, some kind of
22 balance, all of it goes to the -- to the
23 Gaming Revenue Fund, as opposed to losses
24 being split 51/49, because they get taxed at

1 49 percent. And that has proven to be some
2 kind of burden when that happens. Doesn't
3 happen all that often. But when that happens,
4 they have to go back to the tape, they have to
5 figure out where the person may have been,
6 more than one machine, or et cetera, et
7 cetera. And what I just remembered thinking
8 is, the language about wins and losses is to
9 communicate that that's it. There's none of
10 this -- you cannot claim that this balance was
11 from a loss or from a win, so that we don't
12 get into that necessity of having to try to
13 figure it out.

14 My understanding was, that, at that
15 point, all of it, the balance or TITOs,
16 whatever it is, Gaming Revenue Fund, without
17 the necessity of having to go back to the
18 tape. And that's one concept that -- it is
19 right here, that that's also a regulation, if
20 the intention is to try to put people in a --
21 go in an investigatory mission, really. That,
22 by the way, by necessity has to be bound by
23 some time. It's very hard after -- I don't
24 know, after a couple of hours of tape, to, at

1 times, figure out if there had been anymore
2 play.

3 So that's one area that I wanted to
4 highlight. It probably reads the same. But
5 that's given the experience that we've had in
6 between the last time we wrote this. It's one
7 concept that I wanted to introduce as the
8 important highlight.

9 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: So are you
10 suggesting that we do this differently, that
11 we enforce this reg and this policy
12 differently?

13 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Yeah. I'm
14 suggesting, in my opinion, it should be let's
15 just see what the balance is. That's it.

16 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: At that point in
17 time?

18 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Yeah, point in
19 time. And whatever the balance it is, it's
20 going to go, all of it, to the Gaming Revenue
21 Fund, and that -- because the play up until
22 that point could have done any number of
23 offsets, plus one, plus 10, minus 10, plus 10,
24 minus 10. The amount of time that is spent on

1 that, I think, is not the intention. It's
2 resulted in, you know, a bit about burden on
3 gaming agents and the casino, when that
4 happens.

5 MR. VANDER LINDEN: So we did have
6 this discussion. And I believe that that was
7 the intention early on. I recall a discussion
8 about when a person signs up for the voluntary
9 self-exclusion program, it's a contract
10 between the individual and the casino, in the
11 form of this enrollment into the program. And
12 that, when somebody violates their
13 self-exclusion agreement with the casino, they
14 forfeit anything that's on the machine, any
15 jackpot winning that they would have, and
16 that's right. I believe that's that that
17 that's the right path forward.

18 The casino, too, should -- the idea
19 was that the casino, too, should not benefit
20 or not profit from money that was lost by an
21 individual that was on the self-exclusion list
22 on the gaming floor and gambling.

23 The implementation of this idea,
24 taking this concept in theory and

1 implementation, I do understand has created
2 some challenges and a lot of work for the
3 gaming agents and casino. Is that -- I guess,
4 to me, is it worth this idea that nobody
5 benefits from when somebody -- when a
6 voluntary self-exclusion list walks onto the
7 gaming floor. Is that worth it, or what else
8 can we do, additional signage? You know, what
9 review of the efforts that our licensees go
10 through to make sure that everybody's fully
11 aware that, beyond when you sign up for the
12 list, that you know that it's not okay for
13 persons who on the list to come onto the
14 gaming floor while they're on the list.

15 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Well, and one
16 of the things I have relative to in response
17 to, kind of, like, where does the casino come
18 into play here, is that we look at their
19 efforts, their internal controls, you know,
20 and we have the ability to impose penalties on
21 them, for example. If we, at anytime, begin
22 to suspect that you don't seem to be doing
23 enough, let's say, to -- as we believe is part
24 of your duty, I think I come from

1 fundamentally saying this is a voluntary self.
2 Those two things reside on, you know, the
3 public proclamation that the individual makes,
4 and he or she is tremendously disincentivized,
5 because he or she knows that any jackpots are
6 going to be forfeited, you know,
7 automatically. You know, and that's -- that's
8 that guarantee that, you know, anything over
9 \$1,200 is going to be stopped and, you know,
10 confiscated. So anyway -- but I think --

11 MR. BEDROSIAN: Well, I think this
12 is a good issue, and it's a subsequent
13 conversation that we could tee up with the
14 right folks. And I forget, Commissioner. I
15 don't think the regulation's prescriptive, so
16 it's an issue of how we enforce it.

17 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: It's an issue
18 of interpretation.

19 MR. BEDROSIAN: Yeah. So I would --
20 I'd love to get Mr. Band here,
21 Director Vander Linden, and tee it up in a way
22 that the commission could give us guidance on
23 that. I've heard, obviously, the parameters
24 of what sounds like the beginning of

1 discussions.

2 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: And, maybe, people
3 from the licensees, as well.

4 MR. BEDROSIAN: Absolutely. And
5 our -- our future Category 1 licensees might
6 not have thought about this yet.

7 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Yeah. Right.

8 MR. VANDER LINDEN: If I can just
9 say one last thing on that. I think, the goal
10 is that somebody who's on the list, our goal
11 is that they're not on the gaming floor. We
12 don't want to go through the process of
13 confiscating or, you know, escorting the
14 person off of the gaming floor. That's not a
15 good situation. So what can we do to prevent
16 that from happening, to stop the person, if
17 they're contemplating it, to do what needs to
18 be done that would stop them from crossing
19 that line?

20 And I think, just generally
21 speaking, as we contemplate this policy or
22 regulation, I would love to look at it from
23 that perspective, of the prevention of people
24 coming on the floor, who are on that list.

1 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Anybody else have
2 comments on this idea? I don't have a --
3 sorry, go ahead.

4 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: No. Just,
5 it's a good idea to get everybody and listen
6 to everybody.

7 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: I don't have a
8 strong feeling about it, but I think it's
9 worth -- one way or the other. But I do agree
10 that it's worth teeing up, so if you will have
11 that on your agenda, you and Ed, you know,
12 pull the right group of people together to
13 talk about it.

14 I had two quick things. I notice on
15 page 23, that encourage breaks in play, we
16 mandate, or we implore that there be clocks
17 displayed in prominent areas. Is that the
18 case in Plainville, are there clocks?

19 MR. VANDER LINDEN: The one clock is
20 in the GameSense information center, that I'm
21 aware of.

22 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Does that meet
23 what you have in mind here?

24 MR. VANDER LINDEN: No, it does not.

1 But, at the same time, the overall purpose of
2 the framework is to lay out our orientation.
3 I would not -- I'm not under the illusion that
4 everybody single piece of this is implemented.
5 But, in general, take look at the overarching
6 strategy is for clocks, which is to promote
7 public health and safety within the physical
8 environment.

9 And if we say, Plainridge Park
10 Casino, what are you doing, or Wynn, or MGM,
11 what are you doing to do that? The idea is,
12 these are all ways in which you can -- you can
13 accomplish that. Some of these are
14 regulations an you have to, some of them are
15 great ideas.

16 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Okay. Well, that
17 goes, again, to the sort of -- what I
18 originally called audit, but it's not the
19 right word, but this oversight assessment.
20 You know there needs to be some sort of
21 systematic way of making sure that, net, these
22 are -- these strategies are being achieved.

23 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Can I point
24 one little thing there that I think is also

1 important, especially, for PPC? And that's
2 the last bullet there, it's provide lounge or
3 sitting areas. I think it should read free of
4 charge, by the way, but it reads well in
5 general, outside of the retail setting.

6 The notion there is, that you could
7 be just sitting. You didn't have to be forced
8 to consume something, or to play or occupy
9 some seat that someone else might be, you
10 know, willing to use to play.

11 And I think that's -- it just makes
12 me remember that -- the case that we had
13 recently, of the person who couldn't leave
14 anybody at, you know, anywhere and resorted to
15 leaving them in the car, because there wasn't
16 even a place to sit.

17 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Sit, yeah. Right.
18 My last thing was on page 32 -- 30 -- yeah,
19 two. You talk about 8.8 percent enrolled.
20 Isn't that the net number? That's -- more
21 than that enrolled, but this is the number
22 that nets -- the percent that nets out.

23 MR. VANDER LINDEN: We'll take a
24 look at that. I've seen over 10 percent.

1 I've seen 8.8 percent. I don't know where it
2 lands right now, but I'll just make sure that
3 that data is correct.

4 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Okay. Maybe it's
5 not enrolled. Maybe it's remain enrolled or
6 enrolled and sustained, or something like
7 that. Maybe it is accurate. I'm just not
8 sure.

9 MS. FIORE: I can add to that. That
10 was taken directly from the evaluation. So
11 that was individuals who remained enrolled
12 throughout the, I believe it's an eight-month
13 study period.

14 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Right. Okay.

15 MS. FIORE: So that's what that
16 figure is.

17 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Okay. But that's
18 not quite what it says here. It says that
19 that's the total number of people that
20 enrolled, which, actually, it's a higher
21 number than that.

22 MS. FIORE: Yeah, we can clarify
23 that.

24 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: So maybe,

1 just add the word remained.

2 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: It's great.

3 Mike Sangalang, I didn't realize who was the
4 artist behind this. But it's great. It looks
5 really great. It's like -- like we were
6 complimenting Paul and Justin for a very, very
7 readable document. And this is that, too.
8 It's great. It's really good. It's really
9 interesting. Really valuable. I'm looking
10 forward to distributing it. So are we now
11 putting this out for public comment; is that
12 the step we're at now?

13 MR. VANDER LINDEN: So the bottom
14 part of the memo, the last piece is the next
15 step. So we will draft two with the
16 commissioners, which we're doing now. And,
17 obviously, you'll all give me your feedback,
18 in addition to where we've discussed it today.

19 The Public Health Trust Fund
20 Executive Committee is another body in which
21 we have a meeting in April. I would really
22 like to see this on the agenda for that
23 meeting. The Mass Partnership for Responsible
24 Gaming is our licensees and a few other

1 entities. I would like to have a sit-down
2 with them and really get their comments on
3 that.

4 The Mass Council on Compulsive
5 Gambling's annual conference is March 20th and
6 21st. There's a session devoted to the
7 revised Responsible Gaming Framework. My
8 vision for that is, we do a presentation
9 almost like this, and we get feedback from --
10 you know, from the people that attend that
11 session, which are sometimes licensees,
12 sometimes clinicians, sometimes people in
13 recovery. And then, we will put it out for
14 public comment, as well. We'll post for
15 public comment. We will take it --

16 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Is that now, you
17 mean, put it out now?

18 MR. VANDER LINDEN: Yeah, starting
19 now.

20 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Yeah, because,
21 Elaine, that would be something we might want
22 to send out to all of our -- our list for
23 people to comment on.

24 MR. VANDER LINDEN: My goal is to

1 have a clean, final, approved framework by
2 May 1st, which would be become the useful
3 document, especially, as MGM is working
4 quickly to open their doors.

5 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Great.

6 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Yeah, I
7 agree. This is excellent. And the new format
8 is terrific. The ideas, you explain the
9 improvements. They all sound terrific. And I
10 didn't realize, and I didn't realize it til
11 I've read your acknowledgments, that you've
12 really done this amount of research. There
13 are 14 different agencies from seven different
14 countries that have helped inform your
15 decision on how to -- what's important in the
16 framework. So that's really impressive, too.
17 I had no idea you had done that level of
18 research, in order to accomplish this goal, so
19 really well done.

20 MR. VANDER LINDEN: Thank you.

21 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: I'll credit
22 Marlene here, because she has spent a lot of
23 time, you know, giving us feedback, coming to
24 these meeting and helping the team, in

1 addition to Jeff, of course, and Mark and
2 Teresa here, but to help guide this very good,
3 new version.

4 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Looks great.

5 COMMISSIONER MACDONALD: From afar,
6 I'd like to make a couple of comments.

7 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Please, go
8 ahead.

9 COMMISSIONER MACDONALD: Okay.
10 First of all, unfortunately, the reception,
11 while Commissioner Zuniga was speaking, was
12 largely muffled so I can't respond to that.
13 But with regard to the framework itself, the
14 draft of the framework, I think it's an
15 extremely thoughtful, impressive document.

16 What I like most about it is that
17 it's reflective of being evidence-based. It
18 succeeds very well as a framework in fact.
19 And most important in my mind, is that it's a
20 dynamic instrument in the sense that it
21 appears to incorporate the lessons and
22 experiences of actual operations, and also
23 incorporates the research results to date into
24 the new programs and -- into the new programs

1 and the priorities.

2 And in that sense, it does something
3 unusual when -- it actually closes the
4 research loop, if you will, or the evaluation
5 loop, and applies results of research to
6 actual operations and the realization of the
7 objectives of the framework. So Mark and
8 Teresa, it's really a wonderful job.

9 MR. VANDER LINDEN: Thank you.
10 Commissioner Macdonald, if I can just respond,
11 quickly, to one of your comments. I think,
12 you know, we state, upfront, that we try to
13 draw on evidence where evidence is available.
14 And it's really exciting to start to use our
15 research, to start to use evaluation to
16 realize that we're using that to inform our
17 practices. We still hold on to the
18 precautionary approach, which would basically
19 say where there is in evidence we won't sit
20 back, where there's a reasonable degree that
21 we could expect harm to exist. But wouldn't
22 it be great that we continue to chip away at
23 this, where we aren't relying upon that
24 precautionary approach, and that we develop

1 the evidence, a solid foundation of evidence
2 that we build all of our programs, all of our
3 services on.

4 COMMISSIONER MACDONALD: Well, I
5 think that that's, probably, the most
6 fundamentally exciting thing about this. You
7 know, that's why I used the word dynamic,
8 because as do your -- as you do your research
9 it's applied, you know, in practice, to the
10 refinement of the strategies that are being
11 implemented. Couldn't be more important.

12 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Yeah, I certainly
13 agree with that. You know, and it's been
14 exciting for us, people who have been working
15 on the research, to finally start to switch
16 from a baseline project into actually the
17 longitudinal reiteration of the research and
18 beginning to generate data that can bear on
19 this. I agree, it's incredibly important,
20 Commissioner, and a great part of this.

21 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Can I also
22 just emphasize, the precautionary approach is
23 really a very important principle, which is --
24 I'm just repeating a little what

1 Commissioner Macdonald was alluding to. I'm
2 remembering the conference that we were in a
3 couple of weeks ago, one of the presenters,
4 essentially, making the same argument.

5 In the historical context,
6 traditionally, everybody, not just the
7 industry, has taken a very hands-off, there's
8 no evidence, we can really do anything until
9 there's evidence that the intervention is not
10 causing harm, et cetera, et cetera. And
11 that's a really important principle in this
12 framework. And it has translated into things
13 like PlayMyWay, frankly, and other approaches.
14 GameSense, of course, and whatnot. So I think
15 it's very important to highlight the way we
16 have.

17 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: And that's really
18 been a breakthrough initiative for -- this
19 actually started with Mark. It was Mark's
20 language, the first instance, way back.

21 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Yes.

22 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: And it is --
23 you're right. You know, the industry has
24 almost hidden behind the need -- the

1 arguable -- the assertion that you have to
2 have not only research, but oftentimes
3 peer-reviewed -- so-called peer-reviewed
4 research before you can do anything. And
5 that's an incredibly constraining parameter.
6 And there's been pushback from others to us on
7 this, on Mark's utilization of this principle,
8 the implementation of this principle.

9 Although, I will say, that some of
10 the people who have pushed back, MGM for one,
11 AGA for another, probably, Penn for another,
12 have begun to adapt and, you know, appreciate,
13 I think that we've adopted this principle.

14 And Mark is clear to say, that where
15 we take a precautionary approach, where we
16 introduce things, the utility of which has not
17 been clearly demonstrated, that evaluation is
18 a really critical variable. And we will
19 continue to do that. And we do that more,
20 probably, than anybody in the whole world, or
21 certainly in the United States, in terms of
22 evaluating these things -- these initiatives,
23 particularly, where they're not based on
24 comprehensive, data-driven evidence. Go

1 ahead.

2 MS. WARREN: I just want to say
3 something to that, because I, as you all know,
4 work in a number of different markets in other
5 states, and the industry's still scratching
6 their heads in other places, as to how
7 research is happening on the gaming floor.
8 How research is happening in collaboration
9 with the gaming industry.

10 And so, you have not only provided
11 evidence and evaluation methods that have
12 helped here, but I think, really, you could be
13 credited for starting a change in the
14 industry, because the worlds have always been
15 very separated.

16 And so, this document, I think, goes
17 far beyond where folks once considered the
18 industry to be in terms of looking -- not just
19 saying around the precautionary approach, but
20 saying you can be a partner, you can be a
21 stakeholder in this -- in this effort to draw
22 conclusions about what is working, what's not
23 working, and providing data in a field that
24 just generally -- there just wasn't -- the

1 reason there's a precautionary approach is
2 because no one was doing this research, no one
3 was funding this research.

4 So I really think a number of folks
5 talk about the Massachusetts model. But to
6 me, this is -- this is the crux of it. Is
7 that, this is really crucial for the industry
8 in general, not just the player protection and
9 the work happening here in Massachusetts.

10 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Great. Thank you.

11 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: I also credit
12 the Reno model. We were simply doing what the
13 Reno model suggests. Have a framework, if
14 you're going to then go back and implement it
15 and then, you know, establish regulations
16 after that.

17 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Although,
18 Director Vander Linden and I have just written
19 a chapter for the book on the Reno model,
20 where we are very clear about how far beyond
21 the Reno model we've gone, and how there have
22 been -- there were substantial limitations in
23 the Reno mode.

24 But you're right the -- you know, we

1 started out by following the parameters of the
2 Reno model, one of which was the framework. I
3 don't think the Reno model anticipated the
4 kind of framework that we were going to set
5 out.

6 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Well, it's a
7 model, and that's how I read it. Then, you
8 know, we add the details in the framework,
9 there's further details in regulations and so
10 on and so forth, and then there's a evaluation
11 and we repeat. Anyway...

12 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Have we given you
13 our chapter?

14 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Yeah.

15 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: We did. Okay.
16 All right. Anything else on this topic, other
17 comments?

18 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Really well
19 done.

20 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Great stuff, yeah.
21 So we'll have about a month or so of various
22 kinds of feedback and iterations and so forth,
23 and then try to button this up by the end of
24 April, 1st of May.

1 MR. VANDER LINDEN: Right. Correct.

2 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Super.

3 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Thank you.

4 MR. VANDER LINDEN: Great. Thank
5 you.

6 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: And I think you
7 have one more.

8 MR. VANDER LINDEN: Right. And I'm
9 pleased to just turn that over to Teresa and
10 Marlene. So take it away, Teresa.

11 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Ms. Fiore.

12 MS. FIORE: Good afternoon,
13 Chairman. As Mark said, today marks the first
14 day of Problem Gambling Awareness Month. And
15 it is a national awareness campaign
16 established to bring awareness to issues
17 associated with problem gambling, and to
18 highlight the resources available to
19 individuals and families who may be affected.

20 Like many of our other responsible
21 gaming initiatives, we partner with the
22 Massachusetts Council on Compulsive Gambling
23 in supporting the outreach -- outreach plan by
24 the GameSense advisers at Plainridge Park

1 Casino.

2 So we are in good company in
3 Massachusetts with some of our neighbors, who
4 are also getting involved with this. I know
5 the Connecticut lottery actually just sent me
6 over their -- it's abbreviated PGAM, their
7 PGAM plan. I know Rhode Island does a lot, I
8 think Vermont, and maybe even Maine does some
9 thing, as well. But we take it a little bit
10 differently.

11 So most of all the -- well, all of
12 the year, except for this month, our GameSense
13 advisers really focus on guests and visitors
14 to the casino itself. This month, we really
15 dedicate and focus our efforts on the
16 Plainridge Park employees themselves. And the
17 reason for that is two-fold.

18 First of all, because they work
19 within the gaming industry, especially on the
20 floor, they, themselves, are at a higher risk
21 of developing a gambling problem. And
22 secondly, they are, sort of, additional eyes
23 and ears, and they are, you know, facing
24 customers every single day. So if they see

1 something, they can work with our GameSense
2 advisers to ensure that we are aware of it.
3 And we are just keeping gambling as safe and
4 as fun as it possibly can be for everyone.

5 So with that, I'm going to turn it
6 over to Marlene, who's going to provide a bit
7 more background on the month itself and share
8 her perspective from the Massachusetts Council
9 on Compulsive Gambling.

10 MS. WARREN: Thank you, Teresa. So
11 Teresa laid it out really well. And I
12 think -- PGAM is -- I'm assuming most of you
13 are aware, used to be a week, and has
14 transformed into a month because there are so
15 many activities. This was actually a
16 brainstorm from Tim Christensen, who used to
17 work in Nebraska and Arizona, and Keith White,
18 get famously started on a napkin at
19 Johnny Rockets. So here we are today, and it
20 has evolved tremendously.

21 And the good news is, is that, you
22 know, Keith will say, you know, people remind
23 me that March is Problem Gaming Awareness
24 Month, because everyone's acutely aware of how

1 they're going to spend their money. They're
2 making sure they save their key things for
3 March, so it's great. And as we know, lots of
4 months get celebrated for lots of reasons and
5 to raise general awareness. I think we
6 finally have a seat at the table, and I think
7 that's tremendous.

8 I'm going to provide you some
9 background on kind of -- the Mass Council kind
10 of has a split personality in the sense that
11 we do a lot of work as it relates to general
12 awareness around problem gambling, and then we
13 also do work around responsible gambling.

14 And so, some of the work around
15 problem gambling is pretty exciting for this
16 month. We are trying to put a -- every week
17 we're going to be doing a lot around social
18 media, and putting out a 25-second -- said
19 minute, they would have killed me, 25-second
20 video via Facebook, and sharing that. And,
21 again, getting a lot of key stakeholders
22 industry, folks in recovery, other human
23 health -- health and human service agencies to
24 share that and build that social media

1 presence. So that's something that's up on
2 our Facebook page today.

3 We are also trying to talk to do a
4 lot of traditional media outreach. I've
5 already been talking to reporters. Certainly,
6 as you spoke with Justin and Paul about
7 earlier, we certainly are getting a lot of
8 calls as it relates to sports gambling, and
9 trying to generally raise the awareness of
10 problem gambling and responsible gambling, and
11 what regulation that takes these things into
12 account look like. So providing a lot of
13 baseline information there.

14 And we do a lot of our, kind of,
15 traditional pieces. Trainings out at high
16 schools. We know that high-school age
17 students are at a high risk for gambling
18 problems. They're a group that often get
19 overlooked, and trying to do some basic work
20 with the high school students directly, but
21 also with the professionals who work with
22 them.

23 Law enforcement, as a nice segue
24 from what Christopher Bruce talked about

1 earlier, not just around what they're doing,
2 but, also, they're also in a high-risk
3 category. We've been getting a number of
4 calls from academies to come and speak to
5 the folks that are going through the academy,
6 and trying to build that as a bit of a --

7 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: The police
8 academies?

9 MS. WARREN: Mm-hmm. And trying to
10 build that as a new, kind of, a niche, because
11 I think it's an area that no one, currently,
12 if focusing on. So we're starting to do a
13 number of those -- have a number of those
14 trainings and conversations.

15 We always rely on going to our state
16 recovery centers. As you all might be aware,
17 that Massachusetts really leads in our
18 recovery resources. And so, we have a number
19 of recovery centers. And these are centers
20 that are, you know, storefront. I think we're
21 up to nine or 10 of them, currently, in
22 Massachusetts. And people who are in recovery
23 with any number of things can walk in. And
24 it's not treatment. It's really meant to be a

1 place to connect with other people who are
2 going through the same thing you are going
3 through, but also get connected to job
4 training, education, other resources to lead
5 to building more protective factors in your
6 life.

7 So what they don't typically have
8 are a lot of resources around gambling. So
9 we're out trying to provide those resources,
10 and also build the awareness there so that
11 those folks who are at pretty high risk for a
12 gambling disorder can have a better
13 understanding how to prevent it. And if it
14 happens, what are some of the ways that they
15 can address it.

16 We certainly participate in the
17 National Screening Day. And that is something
18 that Harvard Medical School's division on
19 addictions at Cambridge Health Alliance
20 initiated many years ago. And so, that's on
21 March 13th, where we're providing a short --
22 their screen, the BBGS screen, to people at a
23 number of different agencies. So we'll be
24 working with a number of the treatment

1 agencies in Massachusetts to screen all
2 patients that are walking in or have a table
3 set up in a lobby.

4 We're also working directly with the
5 Mass State Lottery to have tables set up,
6 where we'll have screens and other information
7 available at all their retail centers across
8 the state.

9 We don't have a full confirmation on
10 this, but we are working to get a full
11 confirmation on doing a statehouse day, thanks
12 to the hard work of Representative Wagner's
13 team and working with his group there.

14 Certainly, promoting some of the
15 work out of the Public Health Trust Fund. One
16 of which is the updated, Your First Step to
17 Change guide books that the DOA and DPH have
18 just recently updated, and making sure that
19 people are aware of all the gambling resources
20 that are available through the Mass state
21 clearing house, because there's now a, kind
22 of, new grouping of materials there.

23 And then, one of the things that I
24 think I've spoken to you about in the past, is

1 that, every May we provide a Your First Step
2 to Change recovery weekend. And this is for
3 people who are struggling in early recovery,
4 could be in longer-term recovery, but are
5 trying to us stain that. And that is in a
6 place where, kind of, set them out in the
7 middle of nowhere, in Bolton, Mass, and give
8 them an opportunity, connect with other people
9 who've struggled with similar things, bring a
10 number of speakers in, give them some time one
11 on one with clinicians. So that's something
12 that we will be promoting and recruiting for
13 throughout March, although, we already have a
14 lot of our slots filled.

15 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: How many people
16 typically come to that?

17 MS. WARREN: So we don't have money
18 to do much more than -- we're hoping to get
19 somewhere in the range of 25. I think we
20 already have 18 people signed up for it.

21 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Great.

22 MS. WARREN: And, yeah, it's a very
23 powerful weekend. And then, you know, I'll
24 talk about the GameSense stuff in a moment.

1 But, certainly, a number of folks have alluded
2 to the fact that we're having our statewide
3 conference on March 20th and 21st at the
4 Four Point Sheraton in Norwood, which is
5 really focusing on the public health response.

6 And, you know, that's what a lot of
7 these items that comes Mark comes and speak to
8 you about comes from, certainly, the work from
9 the Department of Public Health. And I'm
10 pleased to say that there's -- the gaming
11 commission will be well-represented there, in
12 terms of talking about the framework, talking
13 about the Public Health Trust Fund Executive
14 Committee and some of the other projects,
15 including the research, Dr. Rachel Volberg
16 will be present. We will have Justin, and we
17 haven't invited him yet, but Paul, hopefully,
18 will join him to talk about sports gambling
19 and online gambling, and the White Paper, and
20 hopefully bring some legislative perspective
21 into that.

22 So in addition to all of that, we
23 also are going to have a number of key
24 researchers in the field.

1 Dr. Heather Chapman, who comes out of -- who
2 works with out of VA system, the only person
3 who focuses on gambling in the VA system, she
4 will be here speaking. We will have someone
5 who's out of the University of British
6 Columbia, Dr. Eve -- I'm going to butcher her
7 last name, but I think it's Litchfield Olson,
8 who will be here talking about near misses and
9 gambler's fallacy and what happens in the
10 brain. We will have Dr. Sarah Yip, and
11 Dr. Patrick Werlinsky (phonetically) from
12 Yale, who will also be doing a little bit
13 around what the brain -- comparing gambling
14 disorder in the brain, as it relates to -- as
15 it connects to cocaine disorder -- or folks
16 having troubles with cocaine.

17 We have folks coming from the --
18 from EDC, the Educational Development Center,
19 talking about some of the prevention work
20 that's happening there. We have researchers
21 coming out of BU, who have some work with
22 prevention and substance misuse, and how that
23 relates to gambling, and a whole bunch of
24 other folks. The gentleman who coined the

1 term "positive play," Dr. Richard Wood is
2 going to be coming in and doing that, and also
3 talking about his site that he set up called,
4 Gam Talk. So a really robust agenda. We
5 invite all of you, certainly, to be there, but
6 also to have the public and others join us,
7 and they can sign up through our website.

8 So that's kind of the crux of the --
9 you know, the general work of the
10 Mass Council. But specific to the GameSense
11 center, we have really built with, certainly,
12 Teresa and Amanda work very closely together
13 and do a great job, and they have their great
14 pal, Lisa, who's left, but Lisa McKenney from
15 PPC, who have all worked really closely
16 together to develop a really robust program
17 for the back of the house.

18 And what's interesting, and I think
19 actually helpful, is that most casinos spend
20 March looking at back of the house, and then
21 spend Responsible Gambling Education Week,
22 looking at public and working on the gaming
23 floor.

24 We know gaming employees have double

1 to triple the rate of gambling disorder that
2 the general public has. And so, really
3 there's great, great reason to spend that
4 amount of time, not just building their
5 awareness of gambling -- you know, gambling
6 programs and gambling resources, if someone
7 ends up with the problem, but really making
8 sure that they better understand how it works.

9 And I continue -- I think I've said
10 this over the years, but continue to be
11 surprised that the folks who work on a gaming
12 floor, and that's not just at PPC, but
13 certainly I've seen in Connecticut and
14 elsewhere, who work on the gaming floor, but
15 don't really understand how the games work.

16 Our gaming -- GameSense employees do
17 a great job of being able to break it down
18 really simply for anyone who does anything at
19 the casino and be able to talk about that
20 further. So they're going to be in the back
21 of house in the cafeteria? What do they call
22 it? Employee break room to do presentations,
23 to do a lot of the fun things that were a big
24 hit last year, gambling quizzes, Family Feud.

1 Amy has this great giant dice, set of dice
2 that she really likes, that she does this cool
3 program with. They are doing Price is Right,
4 the Cost of Play wheel that they have,
5 Family Feud, Word Searches, Know the Odds,
6 Scavenger Hunt. These were things that people
7 really get engaged with.

8 And one of the things we had is, if
9 they got engaged they could enter in the
10 raffle to get a basket. Well, as we know with
11 gambling, the shorter the time period the
12 better for the people to get the payoff,
13 right? So we are now doing weekly raffle
14 baskets for employees, so that'll, I think, up
15 the interest a bit. We're also providing free
16 food, because free food just works. So --
17 pizza and ice cream and other things that
18 people will also be engaged in seeing and come
19 to the table.

20 There's also an opportunity for
21 folks to nominate employees who've really,
22 kind of, shown in this area. And I think that
23 kind of continues to build pride. And, again,
24 from my work all over the country, that's the

1 number one thing you want to do, is make sure
2 people feel good about the information that
3 they have, and they feel good about the job
4 that they can do. And being equipped with
5 this information often makes people feel much
6 better about the work that they're doing out
7 on the floor, so we really want to continue to
8 acknowledge that.

9 And, finally, you know, the fun
10 things. The interactions with the staff, the
11 photo booths, and just continuing to build
12 those relationships, because that continues to
13 be a really important piece of the GameSense
14 information center, is that our GSAs have good
15 relationship with the staff.

16 So the only thing I'll say, before I
17 turn to over to Teresa, is that, kind of --
18 you know, we're in the process of hiring for
19 MGM and our GameSense advisers. And by virtue
20 of that, we are doing a lot of that right now,
21 in March. And so, right now, we are building
22 the awareness of GameSense, we are being able
23 to talk about Problem Gambling Awareness
24 Month. So that's all happening simultaneously

1 and it's perfect. So the other last thing
2 that GameSense is really trying to do is build
3 social media. And Teresa's going to talk to
4 you a little bit about that.

5 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Before you start,
6 Teresa, did you say your conference is
7 March 21st and 22nd, or April?

8 MS. WARREN: 20th and 21st. And
9 it's April.

10 MS. FIORE: So before --

11 MS. WARREN: And you're headlining
12 so I hope it's on your calendar.

13 MS. FIORE: So I dive into our plan
14 for social media, I just want to add to what
15 Marlene said about the -- we're calling it
16 Nominate a Colleague submission. And that's
17 something that we've actually done for the
18 past year. Every three months our GameSense
19 advisers have nominated a few PPC staff
20 members for contributing to the field of
21 responsible gambling, which could be
22 everything from, you know, really dealing well
23 with the patron who may have been distressed,
24 or just incorporating RG into their role. And

1 we acknowledge them in a quarterly news letter
2 that we send out, with the help of
3 Lisa McKenney, to all of the PPC staff. And
4 it's read to PPC staff members, who don't have
5 a e-mail, by their managers and supervisors.
6 So they're acknowledged.

7 In that letter, they receive a gift
8 card from us, and, most importantly, they
9 receive a handwritten note from
10 Chairman Crosby. And that's presented to them
11 in front of a lot of their peers. And it's
12 actually what's really helped us gain momentum
13 in this program.

14 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: And they're really
15 routinely framed and put on the wall.

16 MS. FIORE: I got to say, they love
17 receiving those notes. And we have a little
18 GameSense stationary that he puts it on. So
19 he asks for some information about what
20 they've done to earn this nomination and it
21 goes in there. So it's really helping to
22 build pride, I think, amongst the staff.

23 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Great.

24 MS. FIORE: So, as Marlene said,

1 we're switching it up this month. And instead
2 of the GameSense advisers nominating the staff
3 members, we are having the staff members
4 nominate each other. And it's just going to
5 be done the same way. They're going to write
6 what they see happening on the floor and
7 they're going to be awarded with a prize
8 that's a bit larger than usual. And the
9 person who actually nominates them is going to
10 be given a small prize and thank you, as well,
11 just for participating. So --

12 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: That's terrific.

13 MS. FIORE: -- you have a lot of
14 notes to write.

15 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Yeah, great. For
16 a good part of my job.

17 MS. FIORE: And so, also, just
18 building on what Marlene mentioned earlier
19 about social media, we were really trying to
20 promote the GameSense MA Facebook, and I have
21 the actual address written out in the memo for
22 you. But we are going to be posting on it
23 every single day. We're going to be holding
24 contests on it and adding trivia questions to

1 it. And so, the idea is that Plainridge Park
2 casino staff, who participate in it, can go
3 visit the GameSense table set up in the back
4 of house during the month of March, and show
5 the GameSense adviser on staff that they have
6 participated in it, and that participation
7 will get them either a small prize, or their
8 name entered into one of the weekly raffle
9 baskets. So we're really hoping to promote
10 our social media that way.

11 And, finally, I just want to say
12 that we have a few good years of experience
13 with Problem Gambling Awareness Month, where
14 we kind of figure what works, what doesn't
15 work, what people get really excited about.
16 This is the first year that we've built, sort
17 of, measurement and metrics into each of the
18 programs. So we're going to use this year a
19 as a -- sort of a benchmark and a library of
20 different activities for the future. So,
21 hopefully, this time next month I'll have some
22 positive numbers, which I'll be happy to share
23 with you.

24 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Questions?

1 Comments?

2 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Lots of
3 things going on.

4 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: A year from
5 now, it will be a whole different program.

6 MS. FIORE: Yep.

7 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Commissioner
8 Macdonald, do you have any questions or
9 comments?

10 COMMISSIONER MACDONALD: No. Other
11 than to say, it's just very impressive.

12 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Yeah. How are you
13 feeling about the hiring for GameSense at MGM,
14 how many people are you hiring and how's that
15 looking?

16 MS. WARREN: So Amy Gabriella, who
17 is currently our senior GSA at PPC, will move
18 over, be our senior GSA at MGM, and so she's
19 spending a lot more time in western Mass. So,
20 currently, what we're trying to do is fill her
21 spot first at PPC and then move over. I think
22 we're going to be just fine.

23 What's fascinating and shouldn't
24 shock us but continues to shock us, is how

1 many people Amy and Terrence know. So there
2 are a lot of folks that might be coming up
3 from those casinos in Connecticut and
4 Rhode Island and -- so a lot of interest. A
5 lot of interest. Amanda is spending,
6 probably, two to three days a week
7 interviewing, screening, talking with folks.

8 The great news is we've had some
9 tremendous candidates that have already moved
10 forward that are bilingual, trilingual, and
11 we're really psyched about that. So, yeah, I
12 think we're going to have a great team in
13 place by this fall.

14 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: How many will it
15 be?

16 MS. WARREN: Do you want to answer
17 that, given the budget hasn't been approved
18 yet?

19 MR. VANDER LINDEN: Yeah. I mean,
20 to a certain degree, it's based on the budget,
21 but we're trying to replicate what's happening
22 at PPC, which is staffing it seven days a
23 week, 16 hours a day, 365 days a year.

24 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Right. Good.

1 MR. VANDER LINDEN: So we recognize
2 that it's a huge casino. Much, much larger
3 than PPC, so we're trying to build staffing
4 that would accommodate, you know, that large
5 space. So it's probably a couple -- looking
6 at having a couple GSAs on most of the time.

7 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: All the time.
8 Great. Terrific. Great stuff. Thank you all
9 very much.

10 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Good work.

11 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: All set, Director?
12 All right. So that is the end of our agenda
13 items, other than Commissioner Updates.
14 Anybody have anything?

15 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: One quick
16 update. Jill Griffin and Paul and I are going
17 to be back out in Springfield on Monday. We
18 have -- we're going -- we have a number of
19 evens with MGM's procurement team, which is
20 still in the area looking for suppliers and
21 vendors, so there's an event with the local
22 commercial lending community, there's a
23 meeting of our Vendor Advisory Task Force, and
24 then in the evening there's an event with the

1 new minority business alliance that's formed
2 to help minority businesses put themselves in
3 a position to be --

4 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: When is that?

5 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Monday.

6 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Oh, great. Good.

7 Commissioner Macdonald, anything on your end?

8 COMMISSIONER MACDONALD: No.

9 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: All right. Do I
10 have a motion to adjourn?

11 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: So moved.

12 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: All in favor?

13 Commissioner Cameron?

14 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Aye.

15 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Commissioner
16 Macdonald?

17 COMMISSIONER MACDONALD: Aye.

18 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Commissioner

19 Stebbins?

20 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Aye.

21 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Commissioner

22 Zuniga?

23 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Aye.

24 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: And the chair

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

votes aye. We are adjourned. Thank you all
very much.

(Proceeding concluded at 1:18 p.m.)

1 GUEST SPEAKERS:

2 Lance George, General Manager, Plainridge Park
3 Casino

4 Michele Collins, Vice President of Marketing,
5 Plainridge Park Casino

6 Christopher Bruce, Crime Analyst

7 Marlene Warner, Executive Director, Massachusetts
8 Council on Compulsive Gambling

9

10

11 MASSACHUSETTS GAMING COMMISSION:

12 Edward Bedrosian, Executive Director

13 Mark Vander Linden, Director of Research and
14 Responsible Gaming

15 Paul Connelly, Director of Licensing

16 John Ziemba, Ombudsman

17 Teresa Fiore, Program Manager

18 Justin Stempeck, Staff Counsel

19 Elaine Driscoll, Director of Communications

20

21

22

23

24

COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

I, BRENDA M. GINISI, COURT REPORTER, do
hereby certify that the foregoing is a true and
accurate transcription of my stenographic notes,
to the best of my knowledge and ability.

WITNESS MY HAND, this 6th day of March,
2018.



Brenda M. Ginisi