

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24

THE COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS  
MASSACHUSETTS GAMING COMMISSION  
PUBLIC MEETING #189

CHAIRMAN

Stephen P. Crosby

COMMISSIONERS

Gayle Cameron

Lloyd Macdonald

Bruce W. Stebbins

Enrique Zuniga

-----

April 28, 2016 10:00 a.m.- 10:10 a.m.

THE SHAW'S CENTER

1 Feinberg Way

Brockton, Massachusetts

1 P R O C E E D I N G S :

2

3 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Ladies and  
4 gentlemen, I am going to call to order the  
5 public meeting 189 of the Massachusetts Gaming  
6 Commission at 10:00 on April 28 at the Shaw's  
7 Conference Center in Brockton.

8 There is one item on this agenda.  
9 Just so everybody can plan a little bit, I'm  
10 going to run quickly through the rest of the  
11 day. We have one, I think, item only for  
12 meeting 189. We will then adjourn meeting 189.

13 We will then go back to meeting 188,  
14 which was going on yesterday. But we have  
15 received a lot of final submissions in response  
16 to yesterday's meeting. We haven't all had a  
17 chance to read these letters and actually think  
18 about them. So, we're going to take a 15- to  
19 30-minute break so we have a chance to really  
20 understand what has been submitted to us  
21 pursuant to yesterday.

22 We will then convene the final  
23 session, it's probably the final session of  
24 public meeting 188, and have the deliberating

1 process on whether or not to make an award in  
2 Region C. In round numbers, I would guess that  
3 would start at quarter of 11 or thereabouts.

4 There's one item on the agenda,  
5 racing division, Director Lightbaum. The ball  
6 is in your court.

7 DR. LIGHTBAUM: Good morning,  
8 Commissioners. George Brown, the chairman of  
9 the Massachusetts Thoroughbred Breeders  
10 Association has submitted a request to run six  
11 restricted races at Finger Lakes this spring.

12 As you recall last year I believe it  
13 was around August 20 we had a similar request  
14 in front of us for them to be able to run races  
15 at Finger Lakes last year which they did. And  
16 it was successful as far as breeders go.

17 This is in response to us not having  
18 a full season of racing, of thoroughbred racing  
19 in Massachusetts. The breeders do intend to  
20 save enough money so that they'll be able to do  
21 their regular stakes races at Suffolk during  
22 those six days that they race. And then also  
23 money to run some restricted races at the  
24 Brockton Fair also.

1                   And my recommendation is to approve  
2 this. It's part of the legislation too.  
3 Catherine could speak to that if you want.  
4 They did get that changed in Chapter 128 which  
5 is the agricultural regulations.

6                   CHAIRMAN CROSBY: They got what  
7 changed?

8                   DR. LIGHTBAUM: They got it changes  
9 so that they could race races outside of  
10 Massachusetts. That was done last year. If  
11 you have any questions, Mr. Brown is here  
12 today.

13                   CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Okay.

14                   COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Do you want  
15 to invite him to say something?

16                   CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Questions or Mr.  
17 Brown, did you have anything to say at the  
18 outset?

19                   MR. BROWN: No, just if you have any  
20 questions.

21                   COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Mr. Chair, I  
22 think this is a sound recommendation. I agree  
23 with it. It worked well last year. Having the  
24 Mass. bred horses have the opportunity to race

1 for those funds is really an important piece  
2 for the breeders. Again, it is uncertain how  
3 many days we'll have this year in the  
4 Commonwealth. So, this just is a nice plan to  
5 supplement whatever days we have here and  
6 whatever opportunities there are.

7 So, I agree with this  
8 recommendation.

9 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Anybody else,  
10 questions? Commissioner?

11 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Yes, this  
12 request of course would come with supplemental  
13 monies from Horse Race Development Fund for  
14 these races; is that correct?

15 MR. BROWN: From the breeders, yes.

16 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: For the  
17 breeders' piece.

18 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Not the Race Horse  
19 Development Fund, but the breeders' share.

20 DR. LIGHTBAUM: The breeders' share.

21 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: The breeders'  
22 share of the Race Horse Development Fund.

23 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: That was going to  
24 be my question too. Thank you. It says funds

1 have been set aside to run 10 stakes, that's  
2 out of the breeders' funds.

3 DR. LIGHTBAUM: Correct, out of the  
4 breeders' funds.

5 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: How much is that?  
6 What's been set aside? Why is that not  
7 detailed here?

8 MR. BROWN: We are going to run six  
9 races at Finger Lakes to begin with. One of  
10 the reasons for that is we have no place to get  
11 our horses fit to run before the Suffolk Downs  
12 races. So, we planned on running these races  
13 at Finger Lakes to help get these horses fit.  
14 And these races are \$35,000 apiece.

15 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: That's the purse,  
16 the total purse per race?

17 MR. BROWN: Yes. Then we have nine  
18 races, we plan on running nine races at Suffolk  
19 Downs for purses of \$75,000 each. And we were  
20 going to try to run one race at Finger Lakes  
21 later in the year for \$75,000 because it's hard  
22 to get the two-year-olds ready to run by August  
23 or September. A lot of them don't get ready  
24 that soon.

1           So, we figured we'd run that race at  
2 Finger Lakes and that way we could put it off  
3 until November and give everybody a chance to  
4 get ready for that two-year-old race.

5           And depending on what happens with  
6 Brockton, we would have money left over for  
7 races at Brockton. And if Brockton doesn't get  
8 ready this year, we could run the rest of them  
9 at Finger Lakes.

10           CHAIRMAN CROSBY: So, the \$35,000  
11 and the \$75,000 purses is supplemented by  
12 breeders' money. It's not the full --

13           MR. BROWN: It's not out of the  
14 Horse Development Fund. It's out of the  
15 breeders' money.

16           CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Okay.

17           COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: I'm sorry. To  
18 make a distinction, it does come from the Race  
19 Horse Development Fund which has two pots of  
20 money, one going to the thoroughbreds that race  
21 here and another one that goes to the breeders.

22           MR. BROWN: That we have 16 percent  
23 of that money from the Horse Development Fund  
24 that goes to the breeders.

1 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Right.

2 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: So, would we  
3 get an actual request for those money or is it  
4 implicit in what Mr. Brown just said?

5 DR. LIGHTBAUM: It's implicit in  
6 what he said. Once the money goes over to the  
7 breeders, it's basically up to them how they  
8 spend it. Obviously, if there was some crazy  
9 thing out there, we might have a comment on it.  
10 But basically that 16 percent goes to them.  
11 And they decide how they want to fund their  
12 races.

13 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Fair enough,  
14 but my point being more basic. There's enough  
15 balance in the fund to use it.

16 DR. LIGHTBAUM: Yes. And there's  
17 money going into it every week.

18 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: With the  
19 activity from the slots parlor.

20 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: So people know,  
21 money from Plainridge, nine percent of the  
22 daily gross gaming revenue from Plainridge is  
23 going into the Race Horse Development and that  
24 continues to supplement the breeders and the



1 thoroughbred.

2                   COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: And the  
3 standardbreds as well.

4                   CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Yes, and the  
5 standardbreds as well, right.

6                   I'm fine with this as Commissioner  
7 Cameron recommends. I just would like for the  
8 heck of it, I'd like to see the arithmetic when  
9 we've got it just out of curiosity. What's in  
10 the fund, what's being used, not for yay or nay  
11 purposes, but just for informational purposes.

12                   COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: You know, I've  
13 been thinking about a good report, the end of  
14 fiscal year is approaching. It could be a good  
15 occasion for us to detail the credits and  
16 debits to all those funds that have been taking  
17 place. I do sign off on the transfers as the  
18 Treasurer of the Commission. But a balance of  
19 the historical year I think is going to be very  
20 good information to bring to the Commission  
21 very soon.

22                   DR. LIGHTBAUM: The breeders have to  
23 do a report anyway and turn that in.

24                   MR. BROWN: We have an audit.

1 DR. LIGHTBAUM: An audit that they  
2 have to do. So, they can certainly make that  
3 audit available to us when it's done.

4 MR. BROWN: It just got completed.

5 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: I would also  
6 add, Alex and Mr. Brown I welcome you to come  
7 back before the Commission and kind of give us  
8 updates as to how these races happened,  
9 obviously closer to the end of the year,  
10 obviously. But we'd be anxious to see what the  
11 results were and kind of get a sense from you  
12 as to their success.

13 Mr. Chairman, I'd move the  
14 Commission approve the request of the  
15 Massachusetts Thoroughbred Breeders Association  
16 to run six restricted Mass. Bred races at  
17 Finger Lakes Racecourse this spring with funds  
18 set aside to race at least nine stakes races at  
19 Suffolk Raceway and some restricted races at  
20 Brockton.

21 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Second.

22 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Further  
23 discussion? All in favor, aye.

24 COMMISSIONER MACDONALD: Aye.

1 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Aye.  
2 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Aye.  
3 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Aye.  
4 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Opposed? The ayes  
5 have it unanimously.  
6 DR. LIGHTBAUM: Thank you.  
7 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Thank you.  
8 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Thank you. Do we  
9 have any other business for this public  
10 meeting? Do I have a motion to adjourn?  
11 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: So moved.  
12 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Second?  
13 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Second.  
14 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: All in favor, aye.  
15 COMMISSIONER MACDONALD: Aye.  
16 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Aye.  
17 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Aye.  
18 COMMISSIONER STEBBINS: Aye.  
19 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Opposed? We are  
20 adjourned.  
21  
22 (Meeting adjourned at 10:10 a.m.)  
23  
24

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24

ATTACHMENTS:

1. Massachusetts Gaming Commission April 26-29, 2016 Notice of Hearing and Agenda
2. Massachusetts Gaming Commission April 25, 2016 Memorandum Regarding Massachusetts Thoroughbred Breeders Association Request to Race at Finger Lakes

GUEST SPEAKERS:

George Brown, Mass. Thoroughbred Breeders Association

MASSACHUSETTS GAMING COMMISSION STAFF:

Catherine Blue, General Counsel  
Alex Lightbaum, DVM, Director of Racing

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24

C E R T I F I C A T E

I, Laurie J. Jordan, an Approved Court Reporter, do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true and accurate transcript from the record of the proceedings.

I, Laurie J. Jordan, further certify that the foregoing is in compliance with the Administrative Office of the Trial Court Directive on Transcript Format.

I, Laurie J. Jordan, further certify I neither am counsel for, related to, nor employed by any of the parties to the action in which this hearing was taken and further that I am not financially nor otherwise interested in the outcome of this action.

Proceedings recorded by Verbatim means, and transcript produced from computer.

WITNESS MY HAND this 1st day of May, 2016.



LAURIE J. JORDAN

My Commission expires:

Notary Public

May 11, 2018