

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24

THE COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS  
MASSACHUSETTS GAMING COMMISSION  
RACING DIVISION  
PUBLIC MEETING

\*\*\*\*\*

RE: RUNNING HORSE RACING LICENSE APPLICATION

\*\*\*\*\*

BEFORE:

Chairman Stephen P. Crosby  
Commissioners Gayle Cameron, Lloyd Macdonald  
Bruce W. Stebbins and Enrique Zuniga

-----

November 5, 2015 3:00 - 4:02 p.m.  
BOSTON CONVENTION AND EXHIBITION CENTER  
415 Summer Street, Room 107 A/B  
Boston, Massachusetts

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24

P R O C E E D I N G S :

COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Good afternoon. Today is Thursday, November 5, 2015. This is a public hearing before the Massachusetts Gaming Commission. I am Commissioner Gayle Cameron representing the Commission today. Also present are all of the other Commissioners joining me.

This hearing is being convened pursuant to Massachusetts General Law Chapter 128A section 3. We are here today to accept public comment on the racing license application submitted by the Sterling Suffolk Racecourse for horseracing to be held at Suffolk Downs.

Before we begin, the Commission would like to thank you for being here today. This is a public hearing and it is critically important that you, the public, be part of the process to insure that the Commission achieves the best results possible.

The purpose of this public hearing is to offer any interested person or group an opportunity to comment on the racing license

1 application. This is not a question-and-answer  
2 period or a debate. Once we begin, anyone who  
3 wishes to comment may raise their hand and be  
4 recognized by the Commission. They may then  
5 proceed to offer comment.

6 We are going to use the microphone  
7 here today because of the size of this room.  
8 So, please, when you make your comment, come up  
9 to the mic.

10 The Commission requests that all  
11 speakers identify themselves prior to commenting  
12 and please be sure to keep your voices up as  
13 this hearing is being recorded.

14 With that we will now open up the  
15 floor for comment. Mr. Tuttle, your license so  
16 we'll ask you to speak first. Then I have a  
17 list of those of you who have signed up. So,  
18 rather than raising your hand, I'll just go  
19 right through the list. Thank you, Mr. Tuttle.

20 MR. TUTTLE: Thank you, Commissioner  
21 Cameron, Commissioners. Judge Macdonald,  
22 welcome.

23 My name is Chip Tuttle from Salem,  
24 Massachusetts. I'm the Chief Operating Officer

1 of Sterling Suffolk Racecourse, the company that  
2 owns and operates Suffolk Downs. Thanks for the  
3 opportunity to address you today on our 2016  
4 request for racing dates.

5 As you are aware, legislation passed  
6 in March of this year extending our 2014 running  
7 horseracing license in Suffolk County through  
8 July 31, 2016 provided that at least one day of  
9 live racing is conducted at the facility in each  
10 of the calendar years 2015 and 2016.

11 This year, this Commission approved  
12 three days of racing September 5, October 3 and  
13 October 31 as well as the distribution of \$1.2  
14 million from the state's Race Horse Development  
15 Fund for overnight purses, and another \$225,000  
16 from the same fund for the annual operating  
17 costs of the New England Horseman Benevolent and  
18 Protective Association.

19 The three-day experiment was a  
20 success with strong local interest and a  
21 combined attendance of 29,000. The average  
22 daily purse distribution including the races  
23 that we conducted on behalf of the Massachusetts  
24 Breeders Association was \$550,000 per day,

1 competitive with other top-tier East Coast  
2 racing venues, attracted competitive fields,  
3 drawing the attention of bettors and allowing  
4 stables that had supported the racing program at  
5 Suffolk Downs for the last several years the  
6 opportunity that shipping home and running here  
7 were well worth their time and effort.

8 In fact, while not all of the purse  
9 monies have been distributed yet we are awaiting  
10 final testing and then it takes a while to get  
11 all of the purse money out, our preliminary  
12 analysis of the first two days shows  
13 approximately 70 percent of the purse money went  
14 to owners, trainers and stables that had  
15 supported racing here in Massachusetts for the  
16 last several years.

17 The vast majority of that to  
18 Massachusetts residents and Massachusetts  
19 breeders. Not a surprise given that we paid  
20 \$1.1 million in overnight purses and \$600,000 in  
21 purses from the Massachusetts Thoroughbred  
22 Breeding Association.

23 When all of the purses have been  
24 distributed, we'll provide this Commission with

1 a final accounting of where all of the purse  
2 money has gone.

3 We're also able to card races that  
4 attracted some of the top stables on the East  
5 Coast. Fan favorites such as trainers Chad  
6 Brown, Bill Mott and Christophe Clement all of  
7 whom had starters in last week's Breeders' Cup  
8 World Championship at Keeneland Racecourse in  
9 Lexington, Kentucky.

10 This too is important in attracting  
11 wagering both from local bettors and from  
12 bettors in other states. All sources wagering  
13 on the three days was just shy \$2.5 million.  
14 That's a significant increase over the daily  
15 average last year when we ran more days.

16 I'm also happy to report that we  
17 conducted the three days of racing without any  
18 serious injury to horse or human. As working  
19 with this Commission over the last several  
20 years, we have made safety and integrity  
21 foremost priorities.

22 Based on this year's results, the  
23 New England HBPA has asked us to double our  
24 dates request from three to six days with the

1 plan to run three two-day festivals in 2016 with  
2 purse levels equivalent to this year.

3 The extension of our license and  
4 your grant of racing days gives many people the  
5 chance to keep working. We're able to keep 80  
6 people working year around. Others that we let  
7 go at the end of 2014 we were able to bring back  
8 on a part-time basis some for three or four  
9 weeks some for 11 weeks, through the entire time  
10 period for the prepping for the racing and then  
11 being there the whole time for all three days.

12 You have your own records,  
13 obviously, on the number of occupational  
14 licensees that this Commission issued. Clearly,  
15 many people were able to speak economically due  
16 to the distribution of the purse money and the  
17 issuance of our racing days.

18 I would also like to take some time  
19 today to correct the record and clear up in  
20 advance some issues that undoubtedly will arise  
21 during the course of today's discussion.

22 One is the false premise being  
23 promoted by some regarding the economics of  
24 year-round simulcast with only three days of

1 racing. I'd like to take this opportunity to  
2 remind you and everyone that our owners at  
3 Suffolk Downs lost about \$10 million a year from  
4 2008 through 2014.

5 Those losses are a matter of public  
6 record from our prior racing applications. Some  
7 have suggested that year-round simulcasting with  
8 minimal racing has resulted in an unfair  
9 economic windfall for Suffolk Downs. Given our  
10 historic losses, I wish that were the case but  
11 it is not true.

12 In an effort to clear up confusion  
13 on this, earlier this week my controller David  
14 Lanzilli and I took Dr. Lightbaum and Doug  
15 O'Donnell, one of the Commission's accountants  
16 through our 2015 operating results year to date.

17 Through the end of September we have  
18 \$7.1 million in income in \$7.2 million in  
19 expenses not including interest, appreciation  
20 and amortization. We expect the results of the  
21 last quarter will be similar.

22 October should be good with two of  
23 the live racing dates in October and the  
24 Breeders' Cup simulcast, but November and



1 December traditionally slow as the holidays  
2 approach.

3           We are not wildly profitable due to  
4 year-round simulcasting. I figured out recently  
5 why that myth may persist other than people  
6 wishing it were true. As you know, we annually  
7 have you approve our contractual relationships  
8 with the advanced deposit wagering companies  
9 with Twin Spires, TBG and Xpressbet.

10           Through a quirk in the way wagering  
11 handle is recorded in Massachusetts, wagering by  
12 Massachusetts residents with these companies  
13 wagering by these companies on our races appears  
14 as on-site wagering at Suffolk Downs. So,  
15 someone could look at the accounting at a glance  
16 and think, geez, there's a whole bunch of  
17 wagering happening at Suffolk Downs. It's  
18 actually occurring off the premises.

19           And as a result, we are only  
20 retaining about a fraction of what we would  
21 retain if it were happening on the property.  
22 So, it leads to the mistaken impression we are  
23 retaining a much higher percentage of the wager  
24 than reality.

1                   Yesterday in Brockton, I heard a  
2 Massachusetts breeder claim in a public meeting  
3 that we had \$14 million revenue this year from  
4 wagering. I wish that that were the case, very  
5 much. The truth is that we keep some people  
6 working as they wait their opportunity to  
7 perhaps work at the Wynn Casino. We provide  
8 each HBPA the MTBA a venue to run at while they  
9 work out their longer-term plans for their own  
10 facility.

11                   We pay our real estate taxes in  
12 Revere and Boston and our other bills while we  
13 plan and permit the development of our property.

14                   You may also hear today from people  
15 who would prefer more race days at Suffolk  
16 Downs. With sympathy for those people who find  
17 themselves in economic hardship, there is no  
18 reasonable premise that's economically viable  
19 for us to run a longer meet.

20                   The promoters of this idea ignore  
21 basic realities. According to the Jockey Club  
22 which is the breed registry for thoroughbreds in  
23 North America, there has been a 40 percent  
24 decline in the foal population in the US, the

1 thoroughbred foal population over the last  
2 decade. As a result, there are no longer enough  
3 horses to support longer schedules here and in  
4 other states even for the purse money that would  
5 be available through the Race Horse Development  
6 Fund.

7 Correspondingly, the number of races  
8 annually has dropped. In fact, other East Coast  
9 venues, even those where purses are supplemented  
10 by gaming, are dealing with the lack of  
11 available horses by reducing their live racing  
12 schedules.

13 In 2014, Delaware Park, which has  
14 gaming at the facility reduced its days by 20  
15 percent and its purses by 15 percent. In 2015,  
16 just this year, Parks Casino and Racing just  
17 outside of Philadelphia reduced its racing  
18 schedule by 27 percent.

19 Even if there were a way to pay all  
20 of the increased expenses associated with an  
21 extended meet, and it's questionable whether  
22 that could even happen given that the Race Horse  
23 Development Fund is limited to purses and that  
24 none of that flows to the operator,

1 unfortunately our experience over the last four  
2 or five years proves that there's not really a  
3 public appetite to attend or wager on  
4 subsistence level racing with a higher number  
5 days and a lower level of purses.

6           Given the prior public discussion  
7 and the likelihood that it will come up today, I  
8 should also take the time to update the  
9 Commission on our conversations with potential  
10 lessees of our property.

11           On September 1 I spoke by phone with  
12 both Tim Ritvow and Mike Rogers, senior  
13 executives of the Stronach Group. I followed up  
14 with an email requesting a face-to-face meeting  
15 to discuss their potential interest in leasing  
16 our facility for the purpose of operating racing  
17 and simulcasting. I have not heard back since  
18 September 1.

19           As a result, and given that their  
20 company and others have had more than a year to  
21 pursue leasing options with us, we've concluded  
22 definitively that that is not something that we  
23 can plan on anytime in the near future and  
24 perhaps beyond.

1           So, we appreciate the Commission's  
2 time and consideration as always. I'm happy to  
3 take any questions that the Commissioners may  
4 have. And I'm happy to stay throughout this  
5 public hearing, Commissioners, so that if  
6 questions come up I may be able to address them.  
7 Thank you.

8           COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Thank you, Mr.  
9 Tuttle. I have a question. How much money are  
10 you assuming or requesting from the Horse Race  
11 Development Fund for this application?

12           MR. TUTTLE: For the purposes of  
13 purses, this year we requested \$1.2 million,  
14 used \$1.1 million. We were looking at similar  
15 daily allocations. So, we'd be requesting \$2.2  
16 million to \$2.4 roughly next year.

17           We haven't got all that done and I  
18 don't know that that's part. If we need to make  
19 that part of our ongoing application process, we  
20 will. But we were looking at about the same  
21 daily level.

22           COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Okay. Thank  
23 you.

24           CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Thank you, Mr.

1 Tuttle.

2 MR. TUTTLE: Thank you.

3 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: First speaker  
4 that signed up for comment is Mr. Bill Lagorio.

5 MR. LAGORIO: Good afternoon,  
6 Commissioners and thank you for giving me the  
7 opportunity to speak before you today.

8 May name is Bill Lagorio and I'm  
9 President of the Massachusetts Thoroughbred  
10 Horseman Association. Our group has evolved  
11 from a grassroots group seeking solutions to a  
12 formal and registered horseman's organization of  
13 over 350 thoroughbred owners and trainers that  
14 are with us now.

15 MTHA has one goal and that is to  
16 return full-time racing to Massachusetts and get  
17 all of our people back to work. The seemingly  
18 simple issue of granting simulcast rights  
19 without a full-time racing license is not so  
20 simple. The MTHA objects to awarding any  
21 commercial licensee simulcasting without a 50-  
22 day live race meet.

23 We have tried the horse festival  
24 approach and it was in our opinion a disaster.

1 The outcome as feared did not benefit the local  
2 horsemen or the local community. At least \$1.5  
3 million of Race Horse Development Fund money was  
4 used in this failed experiment. And we need to  
5 learn from this experience.

6 Who got hurt and how? The local  
7 horsemen took a major financial hit. I have  
8 figures I have prepared, very accurate figures  
9 based on purse monies that were distributed and  
10 I have copies both of those numbers. 30 local  
11 trainers who are traditionally our local  
12 trainers made 144 starts and ran for \$362,900.  
13 36 out of town trainers --

14 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: What was that?

15 MR. LAGORIO: It was 30 local  
16 trainers made 144 starts and earned \$362,900 in  
17 purse money.

18 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Is that for  
19 2015?

20 MR. LAGORIO: That is for this  
21 three-day festival, yes. 36 out-of-town  
22 trainers made 83 starts and ran for \$643,000.  
23 So, two-thirds of the money left the  
24 Commonwealth, certainly not the intention. I

1 have those numbers if you'd like to see them.

2 The local community and surrounding  
3 businesses suffered financially. The  
4 Massachusetts farm owners and breeders lost out  
5 on the racing side but also lost out on  
6 potential layoffs and the economic impacts the  
7 vendors and the employees would normally  
8 generate.

9 When our horses stay in  
10 Massachusetts, the Commonwealth benefits. When  
11 our horses are forced to run out of state, it  
12 deprives us and the Commonwealth all of the  
13 economic benefits.

14 According to a study submitted in  
15 2013 to the Race Horse Development Fund  
16 committee, and I have a copy here, by the New  
17 England HBPA and the Mass. Thoroughbred Breeders  
18 Association, the Massachusetts racing industry  
19 supported 1489 jobs, 979 on-track direct jobs,  
20 40 direct off-track jobs and 470 jobs on the  
21 farms throughout the Commonwealth with an  
22 estimated economic impact of \$450 million.

23 Based on Chip Tuttle's testimony  
24 before the Commission this past June, the three



1 days of racing was saving 25 to 50 jobs. That  
2 results in a net loss of 97 percent of the on-  
3 track jobs.

4           There has been an estimated 220 farm  
5 jobs lost which is 55 percent of the total.  
6 We've lost 32 of the 40 direct off-track jobs.  
7 And that leaves us with about 253 jobs out of  
8 1489. The result is an 83 percent loss of jobs  
9 with a drop in the economic impact statewide of  
10 over \$250 million. And those facts were  
11 compiled by Deloitte Financial Consulting Firm  
12 and the New York Jockey Club.

13           Members of the Mass. THA are the  
14 folks that are paying the price and it needs to  
15 be reversed. We need to come out of these  
16 current Mass. Gaming Commission hearings with a  
17 plan that gives us a future.

18           The businesses surrounding Suffolk  
19 Downs in East Boston and Revere, many of them  
20 small mom-and-pop type stores, for example  
21 Dunkin' Donuts, bakeries and pizza shops and  
22 even the larger businesses like Target and Stop  
23 and Shop, Wendy's have all seen major declines  
24 in their revenues based on the absence of a live

1 race meet. If there is a positive to these  
2 results, it escapes me.

3 As far as Massachusetts farms,  
4 breeding and agriculture, one of the  
5 Massachusetts largest breeders and farm owners,  
6 Adel Salim will speak. So, I'll move on from  
7 there, but he'll elaborate on the devastating  
8 effects that the loss of full-time racing has  
9 had on those industries.

10 I would like to say that when people  
11 stand up and say that they represent the  
12 breeders, what needs to be clarified is that  
13 many of them have taken up breeding as a  
14 sideline or hobby. And there's nothing wrong  
15 with that. They do not derive a living from  
16 that industry.

17 The breeders who are part of the  
18 Massachusetts Thoroughbred Horsemen Association  
19 are the folks that make their living breeding  
20 and dedicate hundreds of acres of farmland  
21 across the Commonwealth doing just that.

22 Some are third- and fourth-  
23 generation breeders and farm owners. And  
24 without full-time racing, we are losing them and

1 we are losing the farms.

2 Potential new investors interested  
3 in operating full-time race meets in  
4 Massachusetts will remain totally frustrated  
5 until the horsemen simulcast signal becomes  
6 available to only operators running a fully and  
7 meaningful live race meet.

8 Although three days of racing  
9 brought fans back to the track, without a full-  
10 time race meet, there will continue to be a loss  
11 in every day fan interest. And with that the  
12 simulcast business will suffer as well.

13 This was proven at Rockingham Park  
14 in Salem, New Hampshire where they have lost 80  
15 percent of their simulcast revenues since the  
16 track's loss of live thoroughbred racing in  
17 2002.

18 After five years of hard work by the  
19 Massachusetts Legislature to get expanded gaming  
20 right, their original intent has been  
21 frustrated. Expanded gaming is meant to sustain  
22 our thoroughbred racing industry with all its  
23 attending benefits, provide a solid  
24 entertainment option for the Massachusetts

1 residents, provide the opportunity for the Mass.  
2 breeders, farms and all Mass. agriculture to  
3 expand on their long-term plans. And to expand  
4 the Massachusetts tax base including business,  
5 income and real estate.

6 None of the above has happened based  
7 on the hold Suffolk Downs has taken on our  
8 simulcast signal. It is imperative that  
9 everybody understands that the only way to bring  
10 in a new racetrack operator and restore a full,  
11 live race meet is to make our simulcast  
12 available to an operator interested in full-time  
13 racing.

14 I would ask the Commission to weigh  
15 the merits of an application for a few days of  
16 racing and the negative effect it will have on  
17 the future of the racing industry. We are not  
18 under any time constraints. And we need to  
19 leave the door open for a real racetrack  
20 investor.

21 I understand, I can't tell Suffolk  
22 Downs what to do with their property but I can  
23 ask the Commission to release our simulcasting  
24 signal and allow time for a real operator to

1 negotiate within the Commonwealth to restore  
2 live full-time thoroughbred racing.

3 By granting the three-day festival,  
4 we lost over 1200 jobs in order to save 25.  
5 That's a bad ratio. If we insist on a 50-day  
6 meet, we have our best chance to re-create the  
7 1200 jobs we had and keep the current 25.

8 I thank the Commission for their  
9 time. And if you have any questions for me, I'd  
10 be glad to answer them as well.

11 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Mr. Lagorio, I  
12 don't think anybody disagrees with you about the  
13 misfortune of having the thoroughbred racing  
14 decline, but there is nobody at the table who is  
15 proposing to do anything other than six race  
16 days.

17 MR. LAGORIO: That's not true,  
18 Commissioner. We had a hearing yesterday in  
19 Brockton.

20 CHAIRMAN CROSBY: Okay. The other.

21 MR. LAGORIO: The Brockton  
22 Fairgrounds would give us an opportunity  
23 although people say it's not a one-mile track,  
24 the Brockton Fairgrounds would give some of that

1 Race Horse Development Fund money a chance to go  
2 to people it was meant to go to.

3 But as far as nobody's at the door,  
4 and I heard Mr. Tuttle's interjection about the  
5 point about an email on September 1. And I have  
6 a copy of that email. And it was interesting  
7 because it was just casual.

8 I talked to Alon Ossip and Frank  
9 Stronach and Mike Rogers and Tim Ritvow are  
10 great people. They're frustrated. They are  
11 frustrated with the Commission. They are  
12 frustrated with the Commonwealth. They don't  
13 see the light at the end of the tunnel. I met  
14 with Alon Ossip in Boston. They invited me into  
15 town and Frank Stronach, we talked.

16 He said to me we can't propose  
17 anything until the simulcasting becomes  
18 available. It's not something we can do. As  
19 long as the simulcasting is being held, nobody's  
20 going to answer the door to a lease.

21 They came up with a pretty decent  
22 lease offer and they were willing to do better.  
23 But nobody is going to answer the door while  
24 they're holding the simulcast. That's the

1 issue.

2           Stronach is interested. Other  
3 investors are interested, but we've pushed them  
4 away by telling them that the simulcasting  
5 really isn't available. And that's the piece  
6 they're looking for. They can make racing work.

7           The foal crop is down 40 percent.  
8 If we went to Brockton and give away decent  
9 money, you can guarantee just like Suffolk Downs  
10 for the past 10 or 15 years, you give them days  
11 and you give them purse money and they will  
12 come. That's been the tradition.

13           As far as other people not being  
14 there, they're not coming as long as the  
15 simulcasting is held up. And that's the Catch-  
16 22 right now. I talk to Stronach on a regular  
17 basis. He's just frustrated.

18           He'd still like to come and talk to  
19 the Commission but he doesn't see any light at  
20 the end of the tunnel as long as simulcasting is  
21 being held sort of held hostage in a way. It's  
22 tied up. They need that. That's a key card in  
23 bringing them in or bringing anybody in to run  
24 full-time racing.

1                   CHAIRMAN CROSBY: You tell us this  
2 company is willing to do certain things under  
3 certain circumstances. That's just words to us.  
4 We've never heard from the company. If there is  
5 something real, somebody has an alternative  
6 strategy or has a set of conditions under which  
7 they would do A, B, C than they need to tell us  
8 what they've got in mind.

9                   MR. LAGORIO: I petitioned the  
10 Commission several times to bring them in, but  
11 we never got together with a meeting. Alon  
12 Ossip is willing to come down from Aurora,  
13 Canada any time that the Commission would like  
14 to meet with him. And he's made that clear to  
15 me.

16                   CHAIRMAN CROSBY: To a public  
17 meeting?

18                   MR. LAGORIO: He's very difficult to  
19 come to a public meeting. He feels as though  
20 it's just not the form he'd like to go with but  
21 he'd come in. I could try. I could try.

22                   CHAIRMAN CROSBY: You know the way  
23 we operate.

24                   MR. LAGORIO: I understand. But I



1 want the Commission to understand that it's  
2 simple semantics.

3 And the semantics are that that  
4 simulcasting signal belongs to the horsemen. It  
5 doesn't belong to a brick-and-mortar structure.  
6 The facility said they were out of the business  
7 last November, yet they want to cling to it,  
8 hold our simulcasting. And that's preventing us  
9 from moving forward.

10 It's a key issue in moving forward  
11 with racing.

12 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Okay, Mr.  
13 Lagorio. I think we certainly understand your  
14 point. And I thank you for your comments. Mr.  
15 Tim Ryan, please.

16 MR. RYAN: Good afternoon. Tim  
17 Ryan, Sutton Mass. family-owned (INAUDIBLE)  
18 Farm. Said to be the oldest thoroughbred farm  
19 in New England. I believe it to be true. I'm  
20 third-generation thoroughbred owner, breeder,  
21 probably crazy, right? My son is also engaged  
22 in racing of thoroughbreds. That's fourth-  
23 generation. I'd like to see his kids get the  
24 opportunity to do that here in the Commonwealth

1 as well.

2           The farms, these guys all talk,  
3 they're breeders, they're breeders. The truth  
4 is the farms are the breeders. I haven't had a  
5 stud at my farm in several years. I foaled out  
6 three or four mares that we own in  
7 Massachusetts. I didn't bother to register my  
8 filly and the other horses as well because we  
9 have limited access to training. We have no way  
10 to get gate cards. We did what we could. We  
11 got them saddle broken. We send them off  
12 somewhere anyway.

13           The short two, three, four, six day  
14 meets just don't appeal. I can't get people to  
15 come to Massachusetts and foal their mares out  
16 at my farm based on a festival of racing.  
17 There's a lot of variables in horseracing.

18           It's just like an athlete. They get  
19 hurt. Some don't progress as fast as others.  
20 When you're limited to two or three weekends out  
21 of the year to get these horses raced and  
22 they're giving you fits, well, missed that  
23 opportunity. There isn't another one coming up  
24 in September, etc. For that reason that hurts

1 it.

2 And not having racing hurts it. The  
3 fill that was put through as far as I know was a  
4 good bill for the casino and gambling. I know  
5 that Plainridge has held themselves to the  
6 standard within that bill. I believe they've  
7 applied for 115 days this year.

8 I just don't understand why we  
9 wouldn't hold the thoroughbred industry to a  
10 standard of days. I was at a meeting when you,  
11 Commissioner Cameron, had told them do not come  
12 back here looking for the shabby short days, not  
13 in those words, but more or less.

14 I took it as you were looking for a  
15 significant amount of days 50, 60, 80, 90,  
16 whatever. I'm not a mind reader but you know  
17 what you meant. I thought he got the joke too,  
18 but I guess not.

19 That said the farms are hurting. Me  
20 and my four siblings keep the farm going. We  
21 all take turns with what we have there. I have  
22 a 36-stall barn. We all work. We all share  
23 taking care. There's \$24,000 a year in property  
24 tax on the farm we have to pay.

1           Without a significant racing we  
2           can't get the people that used to come to  
3           Massachusetts, breed horses, foal horses out,  
4           etc. There are good studs available out there.  
5           There's no need to bring them here for what we  
6           have.

7           We have a lot of promises, a lot of  
8           hope it looks like but nothing really concrete.  
9           With that said, I would ask that you try to hold  
10          whoever you give the racing dates to a higher  
11          standard of the amount of days that they're  
12          going to race so that people would say it's  
13          moving in the right direction.

14          We'll breed and a couple years from  
15          now we'll have something good going. It takes  
16          three years. A horse carries a baby for 11 to  
17          12 months, people are always looking forward in  
18          this game. If we do something to start  
19          encouraging people that it's coming in the right  
20          direction, I think it will come back. I would  
21          like to see it do that. That's my concern and I  
22          thank you for listening.

23                   COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Thank you,  
24           Mr. Ryan. Mr. Adel Salim. We heard from Mr.

1 Salim yesterday as well. How are you , Sir?

2 MR. SALIM: Good, thank you. Good  
3 to see you. Good afternoon, Commissioners. I  
4 am Adel Salim. And I am the largest breeder in  
5 the state. I sent 11 horses to Finger Lakes  
6 right around the first week of April. There are  
7 22 Mass. breds at Finger Lakes racetrack in New  
8 York.

9 However, there are many Mass. breds  
10 sitting in Massachusetts farms unable to train  
11 or race. Bonuses being paid out of state for  
12 Mass. breds provides 30 percent additional  
13 monies for finishing first, second and third to  
14 a Mass. bred owner. This requires expensive  
15 shipping and for most farm owners and breeders  
16 the expense of paying an out-of-state trainer.  
17 Then you must race your Mass. bred against some  
18 very difficult competition at an out-of-state  
19 racetrack in order to receive these awards.

20 In essence, we are using our Race  
21 Horse Development monies to promote out-of-state  
22 racing which provides no economic benefits to  
23 the Commonwealth and does not assist in any way  
24 those Mass. breeders who cannot afford the out

1 of town expenses. They are left behind.

2 In sharp contrast to that bonuses  
3 paid during regular full race meet in  
4 Massachusetts, 30 percent for first, second and  
5 third. And any open race with an additional 25  
6 percent to the breeder and 15 percent to the  
7 owner of the stallion for a total of 70 percent  
8 additional possible in Mass. bred monies.

9 This gives a horse with average  
10 talent a chance to earn the owner, breeder and  
11 owner of the stallion enough money to continue  
12 breeding in Massachusetts.

13 I'd like just to give you a little  
14 bit of an example here of the cost involved.  
15 And as a breeder and as owner, I'd like to give  
16 you an idea of what's taking place now and the  
17 consequences of not having long-term racing.

18 For horses who race before but had  
19 the winter off, I sent 11 Mass. bred horses to  
20 Finger Lakes. It takes 60 to 75 days of  
21 training to get a horse fit to race short races.  
22 The daily fees a trainer charges at Finger Lakes  
23 is on average about \$55. So, for 11 horses to  
24 get fit, one will have to spend about \$50,000

1 including blacksmith and vets to get to the  
2 first race.

3           You can imagine how much money the  
4 other horsemen are spending outside of  
5 Massachusetts. This money should be spent right  
6 here in the state and nowhere else. This money  
7 should be spent in Massachusetts to create jobs  
8 and benefit the local businesses, to help with  
9 blacksmith and the veterinarians and others make  
10 a living and raise their family here in the  
11 state and not have to move somewhere else to  
12 make a living.

13           As a breeder and a horse owner now,  
14 I have to think very seriously about if I want  
15 to breed in the state or even own because who  
16 wants to travel seven or eight hours to visit  
17 with their horses and see them run? This is why  
18 we need a long-term racing commitment.

19           The stakes races for Mass. bred are  
20 just a small part of the breeding program.  
21 Without a fuller race meet, the majority of  
22 breeders have halted their programs knowing that  
23 their horses cannot participate in regular  
24 series of local open races, stakes races,

1 rewards the most talented while leaving the  
2 horse with average talent without an income  
3 source.

4 To understand the breeding, breeding  
5 farms promote open spaces, employees on those  
6 farms, many local vendors and it continues to  
7 multiply and has a major economic impact in the  
8 state.

9 Briefly, the breeding cycle is to  
10 commit to breed, preparation of the mare to be  
11 bred, pay for stallion service, 11 months of  
12 gestation period. Following the birth of a  
13 foal, you have a period of two years before the  
14 foal, if things work out and stays healthy, will  
15 make it to the racetrack.

16 During these two years, you have an  
17 extended farm stay as well as eventually  
18 breaking the baby and the initial training time.  
19 This requires a full-time farm staff as well as  
20 a large economic impact with local suppliers,  
21 blacksmiths and vets. The cycle requires a  
22 lengthy live-race meet. Without one, and we are  
23 seeing it right now, the breeding industry will  
24 deteriorate and along with it we will lose our



1 farms and all of the agriculture economic  
2 impact.

3 New York has two tracks running  
4 almost year-round. And they have protected New  
5 York bred races at all talent and condition  
6 levels. As a result, New York bred horses are very  
7 much in demand resulting in 50,000 jobs in New  
8 York racing industry and a \$1 billion economic  
9 impact statewide.

10 I am very much opposed to the three,  
11 four, five, six days of racing. The benefit to  
12 local businesses of three, four, five, six days  
13 of racing and the state of Massachusetts is  
14 practically zero.

15 The fact is horses who race in the  
16 three days at Suffolk Downs including mine came  
17 to Suffolk on Friday night. Grooms and trainers  
18 slept in the dorms at Suffolk, raced on Saturday  
19 and went out by Sunday at 8:00 a.m.

20 Can anyone tell me how many  
21 permanent or long-term jobs were created as a  
22 result of the three-day racing? Can anyone tell  
23 me how many feed stores, hay stores,  
24 blacksmiths, etc. benefited from that? We all

1 know the answer. It's zero, absolutely zero.  
2 But we know who benefited from that. It's  
3 Suffolk Downs for keeping the simulcast and HBPA  
4 for getting the kickback.

5 HBPA put propaganda online as how  
6 much the local horsemen earned from three days  
7 of racing, but they never said how much of it  
8 would be spent in Massachusetts. The fact of  
9 the matter is yes, some of this people are local  
10 trainers raced and own horses in Massachusetts.  
11 They made about one-third of the purse  
12 distribution, but these trainers and their  
13 horses do not reside in Massachusetts.

14 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Mr. Salim,  
15 I'm just going to ask you to please try to wrap  
16 up because there are a number of people that  
17 would like to speak. Thank you.

18 MR. SALIM: A couple of more lines,  
19 that's all. Thank you. So, what they earned is  
20 going to be spent where these trainers and their  
21 horses live, not in Massachusetts.

22 They live in New York, New Jersey,  
23 Pennsylvania, Maryland, Delaware, therefore,  
24 creating jobs and benefiting the local

1 businesses everywhere else except in  
2 Massachusetts. And that's what the three days  
3 of racing has done. So, it's a loss of money  
4 and a loss of revenue from the Race Horse  
5 Development Fund. Thank you for giving me the  
6 time.

7 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Thank you.  
8 Ms. Carol Skawinski. Is Carol here to speak?

9 MS. SKAWINSKI: I am from North  
10 Attleboro, Massachusetts. My name is Carol  
11 Skawinski. I am owner, trainer. I was a  
12 jockey. I've been in this industry for years.  
13 I am totally opposed to the three days of races.

14 I participated in these past few  
15 days. I started six horses mainly so I could  
16 make the \$1200 training fee. It's deplorable.  
17 I don't ever want to race under those conditions  
18 again because I ran horses that were unfit and  
19 they ran bad. And I knew that going in that was  
20 going to happen. Don't ever want to participate  
21 that way in my life.

22 However, I want to address it this  
23 way. As far as everybody saying, oh, the foal  
24 crop is down. This started in 2008 with the

1 foal crop nationwide because of the banking  
2 freeze. That's how all this all came into play.  
3 There is a shortage of horses, but it is getting  
4 better.

5 And as far as no interest in racing,  
6 it is there. I have had a farm in Florida. I  
7 have had a farm in Pennsylvania. And I raced at  
8 Presque Isle. So, I know the casino/racino  
9 deal. When that happens, they do not promote  
10 racing. That is a fact. And I've seen it time  
11 and time again.

12 I'm very cracky. I'm sorry about  
13 that. This is very emotional. And everybody is  
14 suffering because of this. Please take this  
15 into consideration. We need a good livelihood.  
16 I'm going to end it there and I thank you.

17 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Thank you.

18 Ms. Paddy Reardon is next.

19 MS. REARDON: Hi, I'm Paddy Reardon.  
20 I'm from Revere, Massachusetts. You probably  
21 know me by now and everything about me.

22 I am opposed to six days of racing.  
23 Suffolk Downs did go in and did lose money, so  
24 didn't the horsemen. They got reduction in

1 purses, reduction in days.

2 We supported Suffolk Downs in their  
3 bid for the casino. We stuck with them. And  
4 when that didn't happen Suffolk Downs said there  
5 would be no more racing. We went on trying to  
6 get racing back in Massachusetts. Then Suffolk  
7 Downs interjects and wants three days because  
8 they lost money. But nobody is giving the  
9 horsemen any money because they lost money.

10 Suffolk Downs hasn't got a right to  
11 get the Race Horse Development money purses to  
12 lick their wounds. Nor do we. We want to work.  
13 We want to race. And we want a full meet. The  
14 only way we can progress with racing in  
15 Massachusetts is to have a full meet like they  
16 do in New York where it's successful, Florida  
17 where it's successful.

18 All of these places are successful,  
19 not from racing three days, not from racing six  
20 days. They are successful because they have  
21 full meets and they put millions and billions  
22 into the economy all the time year after year.

23 I would ask the Commission to not  
24 grant the six days, not grant the simulcast so

1 we can survive as an industry. We took our  
2 lumps when they didn't get the casino. We gave  
3 up a lot but we are willing to move on and work  
4 for that Race Horse Development money, not to  
5 have it handed to us for three days. Thank you  
6 very much.

7 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Thank you.  
8 Mr. Bruce Patten is next.

9 MR. PATTEN: My name is Bruce  
10 Patten. I am the executive director of the New  
11 England HBPA. Thank you for allowing me to  
12 speak today.

13 I'd just like to bring back a little  
14 bit of history, a little more than 13 months ago  
15 the thoroughbred industry in Massachusetts was  
16 struck with a severe and devastating blow. That  
17 was because Suffolk Downs had to face the  
18 reality of accumulating losses from year-to-year  
19 and they made the choice, the business choice to  
20 stop live racing. Our horsemen were left  
21 without a track. For the first time in 80 years  
22 there was no place to race in Massachusetts.

23 The New England HBPA has done  
24 everything possible, rolled over every stone,

1 gone down every path, trying to figure out how  
2 we can help our horsemen in the short-term while  
3 we work for a long-term plan. It's been very  
4 stressful. I've put in lots of hours, all of  
5 our board members, our staff for a solid 13  
6 months.

7           When we first started negotiating  
8 with Suffolk Downs in late September, we decided  
9 that we may have an opportunity to take out a  
10 racing license and see if we could lease Suffolk  
11 Downs property or make some sort of financial  
12 arrangements to use the facility so that our  
13 horsemen could race.

14           We did take out a placeholder  
15 application. The Gaming Commission granted the  
16 placeholder application. We continued  
17 negotiating with Suffolk Downs for a little over  
18 two months. We finally got to the point that  
19 both parties realized this is not going to  
20 happen.

21           We were planning on racing for 65  
22 days. We even submitted a placeholder -- I mean  
23 a supplemental application for 65 days of racing  
24 which we subsequently had to withdraw. We

1 looked at every possible way of doing that.

2 And in early December when the  
3 parties came to the understanding that we  
4 wouldn't be able to make a lot of race days  
5 happen, once again, we had the same stress that  
6 we wouldn't be able to race at Suffolk Downs.  
7 We had zero days.

8 We started negotiating with Suffolk  
9 Downs once again under a different set of  
10 circumstances where the Legislature was in the  
11 middle and the Legislature was intending to  
12 grant a license under special conditions.

13 The Legislature gave everyone 90  
14 days of extended license into 2015 so that the  
15 parties could once again sit down at the  
16 negotiating table and try to make something out  
17 of this. Very difficult negotiations. We need  
18 a track. We have some money through the Race  
19 Horse Development Fund. And Suffolk Downs needs  
20 a lot of money and they have a track. But they  
21 decided not to race.

22 So, with the help of the Legislature  
23 and the way they structured the legislation that  
24 allowed Suffolk Downs to retain some jobs, we



1 were able to work out and again very difficult  
2 negotiations -- racing is a very, very expensive  
3 proposition to hold a race meet.

4           We found those figures out  
5 overwhelmingly time and time again no matter  
6 which way we looked at the numbers, very, very  
7 difficult. So, as we entered into these  
8 negotiations under the gun that we had to get  
9 them done by March 31, the only thing that the  
10 parties could get to to make the numbers look so  
11 that they would work was the three days of  
12 racing.

13           Now I know our horsemen were  
14 devastated. Our board of directors were  
15 devastated. Our board of directors were under  
16 stress the whole time and getting hammered by  
17 our own members. But they did the only thing  
18 that was available.

19           The choice was zero days or if  
20 Suffolk Downs decided to run the one day of  
21 racing because of the new simulcasting law that  
22 there would be one day of racing. We were able  
23 to get it up to three days.

24           And three days was very important to

1 us because what we were trying to do is help at  
2 least the Massachusetts breeders to race their  
3 stake races. And indeed they did. They raced  
4 all the stake races that they normally race. We  
5 gave them that opportunity.

6 We gave other of our horsemen  
7 opportunities, not all of them believe me not by  
8 a longshot, we gave them the opportunity to make  
9 money, put some money back into our horsemen  
10 group and also allow the breeders to do their  
11 thing.

12 By no means is the three days a  
13 solution. We are in a devastating situation  
14 right now. We do not have a viable racetrack to  
15 race at. We looked at county fairs that used to  
16 run horse racing, some of which still have  
17 tracks there but those tracks need severe amount  
18 of capital investment to bring it up to safety  
19 standards.

20 And none of them had a one-mile  
21 oval, but I think many of our horsemen might  
22 consider living with a five-eighths track or a  
23 half-mile track to be able to race. And if we  
24 thought we could make that happen, we would have

1 done that.

2 But the problem is capital  
3 investment. We have no capital to invest. And  
4 the people that have the small tracks that may  
5 be able to be set up for racing did not have the  
6 capital to put it up or weren't willing to put  
7 the capital.

8 So, we had to live with the three  
9 days of racing. There were positives in that.  
10 Some people got some money, not all of them, not  
11 a high percentage of our total membership,  
12 that's for sure, but a lot of the members got  
13 them. That worked good to that extent for a  
14 temporary stopgap measure, by no means a  
15 solution.

16 We are supporting again six days of  
17 racing this year and this application again for  
18 the same reasons. It's not a solution, not at  
19 all a solution. It's a temporary stopgap  
20 measure hoping to help people. Our horsemen  
21 were and still are devastated and hurting very  
22 bad. The people our horsemen employ lost all of  
23 their jobs. The farms are hurting.

24 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Mr. Patten,

1 I'm going to ask you to try to speed this up so  
2 we can make sure we have enough time for  
3 everyone to speak. Thank you.

4 MR. PATTEN: And obviously the  
5 employees of Suffolk Downs who lost their jobs  
6 are all hurting. We have worked very hard. We  
7 contingency planned this two years before this  
8 event happened 13 months ago. And we are going  
9 forward in the Legislature with a bill that will  
10 allow us to create our own racetrack and other  
11 things. It would be a horse park. More about  
12 that in the future.

13 We have been planning that. We have  
14 had overwhelming support from many different  
15 corners of the state for that plan, the concept  
16 of it. I think it has an excellent chance of  
17 becoming a reality very soon.

18 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Thank you,  
19 Sir.

20 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: I have a  
21 question, Mr. Patten. You were mentioning those  
22 times of difficult negotiations when the  
23 Legislature granted the simulcast extension to  
24 Suffolk Downs. Refresh my memory, there was at

1 least an expectation or language in the  
2 legislation that there would be between one and  
3 50 days of racing; is that correct?

4 MR. PATTEN: That's correct.

5 COMMISSIONER ZUNIGA: Is it fair to  
6 say that there was an expectation that there  
7 would be anywhere in between those days of  
8 racing?

9 MR. PATTEN: Not on our part. We  
10 knew the numbers. We had just gone through over  
11 two months of negotiations. We understood the  
12 numbers very clearly. We never believed we  
13 would ever be able to do 50 days.

14 And actually, the numbers came down,  
15 the numbers are that supported everything was  
16 the three days. Both parties have to be willing  
17 to close the gap to be able to negotiate the  
18 ultimate outcome. And that's the best we could  
19 do.

20 Believe me they were contentious  
21 sometimes, very stressful all of the time on  
22 both parties' part. Very difficult to get those  
23 three days to get the parties to agree. Even  
24 your staff knows that the purse agreement wasn't

1 signed until just a few days ago.

2           Hopefully, we'll have little bit  
3 easier negotiations now that we have somewhat of  
4 a known handle on the costs of running these  
5 type of festival races. But we are just trying  
6 to keep things going as best we can without the  
7 funds to take care of the capital investment.

8           COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Thank you,  
9 Sir. Mr. Jay Bernardini.

10           MR. BERNARDINI: Hi, there. My name  
11 is Jay Bernardini. I'm a Massachusetts  
12 resident. I've actually been a horse trainer  
13 for well over 25 years, grew up with a lot of  
14 these people. And right now I'm currently one  
15 of the vice presidents of the NEHBPA.

16           In contrast to some of the things  
17 that have been stated today, I just want you to  
18 know that I raced I think 21 horses over the  
19 three days of racing during the festival and the  
20 horses earned over \$100,000. For a guy like me  
21 that's a lot of money.

22           I currently race a stable of 50  
23 horses in the state of Maryland. We race in  
24 Maryland. We race in West Virginia. We race in

1 Pennsylvania. Obviously, the most optimum thing  
2 would be to be here racing in Massachusetts.

3 I supported the program the last  
4 couple of years, raced two to 300 horses here  
5 last year. And the horses made over half  
6 million dollars. It's tough to leave. We are  
7 all devastated. A lot of people devastated that  
8 they can't work. And others that aren't here  
9 are devastated that we are away from our  
10 families.

11 In contrast to what Mr. Salim said  
12 earlier, I do put the money back into the  
13 Massachusetts economy. I own a home in  
14 Massachusetts. I have a son that's 16 years old  
15 who is growing up without me here in  
16 Massachusetts. And my wife lives here  
17 Massachusetts. So, I cohabitate. I go back and  
18 forth from Maryland to here.

19 It was tough. It was contentious  
20 for our HBPA to decide on three days for this  
21 year, but it was a plus for me. It was a plus  
22 for a lot of my clients. I had double-digit  
23 number of people that support me every single  
24 month year-round in Maryland.

1           They race there. And they are all  
2 coming here with the hope that they can race  
3 here this year a little bit, maybe next year  
4 some. Then in the long-term we develop some  
5 other kind of program. Whether it's at another  
6 facility that Mr. Lagorio's program is looking  
7 at, I would support that 100 percent.

8           I would be at Brockton or anyplace  
9 else. I would bring some of my horses back for  
10 that. If it's next year for three days or six  
11 days or 10 days at Suffolk Downs, I'm going to  
12 fully support that as well.

13           I do talk to Mr. Ritvow and he  
14 represents the Stronach Group that's been talked  
15 about here earlier. They are interested in  
16 racing in Massachusetts. Right now the only  
17 facility that really seems realistic for them  
18 would be Suffolk Downs. And the key to that  
19 when I speak to Mr. Ritvow was he says we want  
20 to make two or \$3 million a year to do that.  
21 That's the bottom line.

22           To me, my answer to him is if you  
23 can make two or \$3 million a year doing it here  
24 at Suffolk, why doesn't Suffolk Downs do it? Or



1 why doesn't the NEHBPA try and do that which we  
2 did.

3 We outlined a lot of ways to run 25  
4 days, to run 30 days, to run 50 days. And in  
5 answer to your question, when we signed and we  
6 went as a group that it was one to 50 days, a  
7 lot of our 10 board members we did think that it  
8 was going to be a lot more than three days.

9 And we have disagreements as a group  
10 as to whether there are enough horses to race  
11 more. If you offer it, I believe people will  
12 come. I really believe people will come.  
13 However, Suffolk Downs needs to make a profit  
14 too or they're not going to run the racetrack.  
15 Chip and his office has made that very clear to  
16 us.

17 So, in closing I'd just like to say  
18 I am thankful for the three days we raced this  
19 year. It was great for me and my clients. And  
20 a lot of out-of-town trainers that can't be here  
21 today to speak but some of them did participate  
22 and make money.

23 Hopefully, we can get something  
24 together for next year. As far as the

1 simulcasting goes I don't know who controls  
2 that. Mr. Lagorio, he's correct that it has a  
3 big influence on what goes on. To me closing  
4 Suffolk Downs, is that the solution? Or working  
5 together and trying to insure racing somewhere  
6 in the future and even more someplace else, I'm  
7 hoping that's a better solution. Thank you.

8 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Thank you  
9 very much. Mr. Anthony Zizza.

10 MR. ZIZZA: Hi, again. Dr. Zizza,  
11 owner and breeder. Just wanted to give my  
12 personal take on the three days. Actually had a  
13 great three days. I speak here just personally.

14 We had lot of family and friends  
15 come out to the meet. We had a great time, both  
16 my family both my friends, all of the people  
17 attended the event. There was upwards of 10,000  
18 people as you know at each event. Everybody was  
19 having an amazing time.

20 I saw a lot of people at the  
21 backside at the barns. A lot of people from  
22 this side, especially the last day who really  
23 looked like they were having a great time.  
24 Everybody enjoyed being together.

1           It was a different atmosphere from  
2 what we see here. It seems like there's a lot  
3 of dissension now but everybody seemed to be  
4 getting along. It was just a great thing to  
5 witness, to see people back doing what they love  
6 to do.

7           So, my purpose of being here today  
8 is simply to say kudos to all of you for  
9 allowing us to run three days. Kudos to all of  
10 the trainers and owners and breeders who  
11 participated. Kudos to Suffolk Downs and to the  
12 HBPA for doing what they did to try to get this  
13 going.

14           And I think it showed that we can  
15 put on great racing in Massachusetts. And  
16 there's a great future for us here. Basically,  
17 that's my role here today.

18           I just wanted to thank everybody and  
19 hope that as we move forward we can all work  
20 together and do great things for racing and for  
21 breeding in Massachusetts. So, I'll be short  
22 and sweet today, but thank you all so much.

23           COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Thank you.  
24 That's the end of the list of folks who signed

1 up. I was just going to ask if there are  
2 additional people who would like to speak. Sir,  
3 you would like to speak?

4 MR. BRAMANTE: My name is Bernie  
5 Bramante. I've been an owner trainer for over  
6 30 years. I've been involved in the racing  
7 industry for over 50 years. There's two issues  
8 that I want to address.

9 One is this foal population. I  
10 think Dr. Lightbaum, who was been around for  
11 quite a number of years has seen the ups and  
12 downs of foal populations. And the fact is that  
13 many, many of those horses that don't make it at  
14 the biggest tracks filter down to tracks like  
15 ours. It's been a historical fact that whenever  
16 we had a full meet, we had horses that -- New  
17 England people always found horses and always  
18 will. That's all I'm going to say on that.

19 The other issue is this what I call  
20 nonsense of nonprofit making. I have never seen  
21 business that hasn't invested some money in  
22 upgrading that wants to make a profit, I have  
23 never seen them make a profit. The plant is in  
24 a state of disarray and decay.

1 I'm not faulting Mr. Tuttle. He has  
2 to live by whatever kind of finances they put in  
3 front of him. That track through last two live  
4 meets has seen some new trainers from down  
5 South, different parts of the country. Each one  
6 of them has looked out from that grandstand and  
7 commented how beautiful a racetrack it is.

8 Inside if you think you are going to  
9 bring in people, you have to have some kind of  
10 an upgrading of any business. I've run three  
11 businesses that were supposedly defunct, run  
12 them quite successfully. It always called for  
13 an investment first.

14 This place has not had any money  
15 invested in it for upgrades. And it never will  
16 make money the way it is being kept. That's all  
17 I have say. Thank you.

18 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Thank you,  
19 Sir. Would anyone else like to speak? Just  
20 briefly, you already spoke once.

21 MR. SALIM: Just a comment. Mr.  
22 Patten gave a great presentation and concluded  
23 his presentation by saying six days is not a  
24 solution.

1 Well, if six days is not a solution,  
2 why waste two and a half million dollars on  
3 something that is not a solution. We are  
4 looking here for a solution, a long-term  
5 solution. And I think we should think and save  
6 the money to give it to someone who is willing  
7 to provide a solution to racing more days.

8 And hopefully like George Carney,  
9 for example, he came forward for more days. And  
10 I think we should save the money for people who  
11 are willing to work with us. Thank you.

12 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Thank you.  
13 Do we have anyone else who would like to speak  
14 before we conclude this hearing?

15 Okay. We will close the hearing.  
16 Thank you all very much for your comments.

17  
18 (Hearing closed at 4:02 p.m.)  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24

1 APPEARANCES:

2 GUEST SPEAKERS:

3 Chip Tuttle, Suffolk Downs

4 William Lagorio, MTHA

5 Tim Ryan

6 Adel Salim

7 Carol Skawinski

8 Paddy Reardon

9 Bruce Patten

10 Jay Bernardini

11 Anthony Zizza

12 Bernie Bramante

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24

C E R T I F I C A T E

I, Laurie J. Jordan, an Approved Court Reporter,  
do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true  
and accurate transcript from the record of the  
proceedings.

I, Laurie J. Jordan, further certify that the  
foregoing is in compliance with the  
Administrative Office of the Trial Court  
Directive on Transcript Format.

I, Laurie J. Jordan, further certify I neither  
am counsel for, related to, nor employed by any  
of the parties to the action in which this  
hearing was taken and further that I am not  
financially nor otherwise interested in the  
outcome of this action.

Proceedings recorded by Verbatim means, and  
transcript produced from computer.

WITNESS MY HAND this 9th day of November,  
2015.



LAURIE J. JORDAN  
Notary Public

My Commission expires:  
May 11, 2018