

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

THE COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS
MASSACHUSETTS GAMING COMMISSION
RACING DIVISION
PUBLIC MEETING

RE: RUNNING HORSE RACING LICENSE APPLICATION

BEFORE: COMMISSIONER GAYLE CAMERON and
COMMISSIONER BRUCE STEBBINS

October 20, 2014 10:30 a.m.
MASSASOIT COMMUNITY COLLEGE CONFERENCE CENTER
770 Crescent Street
Brockton, Massachusetts

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

APPEARANCES:

MASSACHUSETTS GAMING COMMISSION:

Danielle Holmes, Staff Attorney

GUEST SPEAKERS:

George Carney, Jr., Brockton Agricultural

Society

The Honorable Bill Carpenter, Mayor Brockton

Christopher Carney

Paul C. Brooker

1 P R O C E E D I N G S :

2

3 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Good morning.

4 Today is Monday, October 20. This is a public

5 hearing before the Massachusetts Gaming

6 Commission. I am Commissioner Gayle Cameron.

7 Representing the Commission today also present

8 is Commissioner Stebbins. This hearing is being

9 convened pursuant to Massachusetts General Law

10 Chapter 128K section 3.

11 We are here today in Brockton to

12 accept public comments on the live racing

13 application submitted by Brockton Agricultural

14 Society and Middleborough Agricultural Society

15 for a live racing meet to be held at the

16 Brockton Fairgrounds.

17 Before we begin, the Commission

18 would like to thank all of you for being here

19 today. This is a public hearing and it is

20 critically important that you the public be part

21 of the process to ensure that the Commission

22 achieves the best possible results. The purpose

23 of this public hearing is to offer any

24 interested person or group an opportunity to

1 comment on racing license applications.

2 This is not a question-and-answer
3 period or a debate. Once we begin, anyone who
4 wishes to comment on the proposal may raise
5 their hand and be recognized by the Commission.
6 They may proceed to offer their comment. The
7 Commission requests that all speakers please
8 identify themselves prior to commenting. Also,
9 please be sure to keep your voices up as this
10 hearing is being recorded.

11 With that, we will now open up the
12 floor for comments. Mr. Carhey?

13 MR. CARNEY: Good morning
14 Commissioners. My name is George L. Carney, Jr.
15 for the record. I reside at 7 Chilton Road,
16 Brockton, Massachusetts. I'm a lifelong
17 resident of the city. I've been involved with
18 the Brockton Agricultural Society and the
19 Middleborough Agricultural Society for many,
20 many years.

21 The Brockton Agricultural Society I
22 took over the operation in 1956. I was the age
23 of 28 years of age at the time. The Brockton
24 Agricultural Society has been conducting pari-

1 mutuel racing since the early 40s. We started
2 off in the beginning, we used to do harness
3 racing. And then when it split and there was
4 not much interest in it, it a shifted over to do
5 thoroughbred racing. That was before I took
6 over. From 1956 until today I've been in
7 control of the operation.

8 When I started Brockton as a young
9 man, we used to run six days and we always ran
10 after Labor Day. It was very, very successful.
11 Then when the weather used to turn a little bit
12 bad and the new economy was kind of going
13 through a down spell, we decided we'd go to
14 running a summer operation. At that time,
15 Brockton fortunately had a lot of shoe factories
16 and a lot of industries that have since moved
17 on. But unfortunately those things happen in
18 cities today in America.

19 So anyway, we started with running
20 in the summertime, and we became very, very
21 successful. Other fairs decided to do the same
22 thing. When pari-mutuel horseracing started at
23 Brockton in the late 40s, it was always
24 successful and always was successful for many,

1 many years.

2 Then unfortunately in 1972 that was
3 the end of the thoroughbred racing in Brockton
4 because there was a bad tax bill that went
5 through. Those things happen in politics. So,
6 we moved the racing operation to the Raynham Dog
7 Track, which was very successful for many years.

8 And continued on racing under the
9 Brockton Agricultural Society until 1978 when
10 the Legislature changed the law and it wasn't
11 necessary -- it didn't make sense to run
12 Brockton any longer. But all the time we always
13 ran Brockton in Brockton as the fair in the
14 summertime even though there was no racing being
15 conducted there.

16 Since then when we ran the same
17 operation for many, many years. Back in 2001 we
18 decided that we'd come back with racing because
19 they changed the takeout and made it more
20 feasible to conduct pari-mutuel horseracing in
21 Brockton. We unfortunately, only ran it for
22 about one year. But that particular year when
23 we opened it up, we spent over \$3 million
24 renovating the barns.

1 We have better barns probably than
2 any other racetrack in America or better than in
3 the New England area that's for sure. And we
4 have a nice operation there and always did. The
5 racing was very successful. It was one of those
6 things through legislation that was passed that
7 made it impossible for us to conduct beyond
8 that. It doesn't seem impossible but those
9 things happen so we shut it down.

10 And we haven't given any thought
11 since then. We still run the fair in the center
12 of town, which is always run very successful.
13 But at this particular time, I think there's an
14 opportunity for us to come back into the
15 horseracing business. I understand it. I've
16 been involved with it.

17 In the past, my experience is I
18 worked at Suffolk Downs as the general manager
19 as a very young man. I worked at Rockingham
20 Park as a very young man. So, I've got vast
21 experience in horseracing. I understand it very
22 well, even though most people connect me as a
23 dog track operator, which I've been doing that
24 for many years also.

1 I think this is an opportunity to
2 keep horseracing alive in Massachusetts. As a
3 matter fact, most of the people who work at
4 Suffolk Downs, I have sent word in directly that
5 if you are presently employed at Suffolk and
6 approved by the Commission then you will have
7 the first chance to come and work at the
8 Brockton Agricultural Society. I know most of
9 them personally. I've known most of them for
10 many, many years. The ones I don't know, my son
11 Christopher sitting here with me knows because
12 he owns horses sometimes.

13 Anyway part of this, I appreciate
14 you people taking the time to come down to
15 Brockton. I hope you can look favorably upon
16 our application with Middleborough as well. I
17 am hoping maybe and I can't say it, but I'm
18 hoping we'll be granted the dates and that we'll
19 be able extend the fair racing days from 15
20 maybe to 30 each to start off with. I think we
21 can have 60-day meets in the summer to the early
22 fall, hoping the dates the Commission will
23 decide to grant us. They will be very, very
24 successful.

1 We'll keep all of the local horse
2 people that really have no place to go. And we
3 would make the facility and the license
4 available for training which I understand
5 there's not going to be a possibility to do that
6 much longer at Suffolk. I can't say that I have
7 any knowledge. I've been kind of led into that
8 way that the training is going to be stopped
9 this past Saturday.

10 But if we're fortunate to be
11 licensed, we would open that area, workout with
12 the HBPA whatever has to be worked and hopefully
13 be able to get a favorable approval from the
14 Commission to go forward.

15 I have the mayor of the city of
16 Brockton. He came this morning, and would like
17 to speak on it. And I'm going to turn it over
18 to Mayor Crosby (SIC). Thank you for your time
19 and consideration. Thank you.

20 MAYOR CARPENTER: Good morning,
21 Commissioners. My name is Bill Carpenter and
22 I'm mayor of the city of Brockton. And it's a
23 pleasure to have an opportunity to address the
24 Commission this morning on the application for

1 fair racing days at the Brockton Fairgrounds.

2 I actually too do recall the last
3 time was in 2001, I believe, right around there
4 that thoroughbreds ran at the Brockton
5 Fairgrounds. I thought that season was very
6 favorable for the city, no problems and it did
7 bring some money in.

8 I guess then I was a thoroughbred
9 racing fan. Today my perspective is as the
10 mayor of the city. So, I think from a host
11 community standpoint, I'm sure there'll be some
12 city boards and agencies who will have some
13 questions around traffic and public safety and
14 those types of topics. And I know the
15 conversations have already begun.

16 But our experience working with the
17 Carney family with the Brockton Fair has always
18 been positive. We've always been able to have a
19 good open working relationship. So, I don't
20 actually anticipate any issues in that area.

21 But certainly some of the city
22 councilors and I will be meeting in the near
23 future to begin those conversations as we await
24 to see what direction the Commission goes with

1 the application.

2 Having said that, I think this would
3 be a real positive for the city. With the
4 potential of whether it would be 30 or 60 racing
5 dates at the Fairgrounds, I think first of all,
6 it would give -- it would create an opportunity
7 for some reinvestment in the Fairgrounds itself,
8 the track and some of the infrastructure there
9 with its location right on Route 123.

10 There's no doubt in my mind that
11 there would be spinoff or positives for
12 businesses in the area. We have two shopping
13 plazas in the immediate vicinity, restaurants,
14 shopping plazas, gas stations, convenience
15 stores. We believe that there would be some
16 spinoff revenue for small businesses in the
17 area.

18 Beyond that I think there is a
19 benefit to the city as a whole in terms of
20 continuing to improve the perception in the
21 image of Brockton, so much like a Campanelli
22 Stadium Shaw's Complex that's right across the
23 street, I think it creates an opportunity for
24 the city to bring people from outside the city

1 to come in on a favorable basis, and for them to
2 leave with a positive perception of the city.

3 I think that's one of my challenges
4 as the new mayor is to overcome some negative
5 perceptions of the city that are out there. And
6 we're looking at overcoming that in a number of
7 different ways, but I think this could be one
8 piece of the puzzle if we had the track up and
9 operating for a number of days and thriving.
10 And we will not only bring some commerce into
11 the city, but I think people would go home with
12 a positive impression of the city, which would
13 be very important to us.

14 There is also the potential for some
15 revenue for the city, which during this very
16 difficult economic time is a positive. I went
17 back and looked at the numbers. I think when
18 the meet ran in 2001, it generated about
19 \$200,000 in local revenue to the city of
20 Brockton. So, certainly during these difficult
21 times of fiscal constraint and trying to balance
22 the budget each year and hold the line on taxes,
23 certainly the potential for another stream of
24 revenue from the, I think, it's .35 percent of

1 the handle that goes to the host community would
2 also be a positive for the city helping us with
3 some additional revenues.

4 So, I think in terms of bringing
5 people from outside the city into Brockton on a
6 positive basis, the fact that I think it would
7 be good for businesses in the area who would
8 gain some additional spinoff business from folks
9 that are coming and going to the races, and I
10 think also the additional revenue for the city
11 budget as I just mentioned would all be
12 favorable to the city.

13 So, I would ask that the Commission
14 act favorably upon the application. Thank you.

15 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Thank you,
16 Mayor. Someone else to speak?

17 MR. CARNEY: Commissioners, thank
18 you very much for coming today. My name is
19 Chris Carney. I was the one back in 2000/2001
20 who ran the facility then. And we went over
21 last week to revise the plans for what the
22 future would be in the upcoming racing season.
23 Knowing what the climate is for Suffolk Downs,
24 we have looked at the location of the racetrack

1 and we thought about if you're willing to grant
2 us the license, that we'd be changing some of
3 the gaming regulations in respect to maybe
4 becoming a twilight meet.

5 We're going to line the racetrack.
6 We're going to put a hung ceiling in the
7 grandstand. If you look at the numbers that we
8 do at Raynham, there's about \$36 million a year
9 in revenue generated out of Raynham. So, you
10 can see that simulcasting is not dead. That if
11 Suffolk Downs does close in January, the people
12 from the Braintree/Quincy area are going to need
13 a place to go to simulcast in the meantime from
14 the time that Suffolk closes until that Wynn
15 opens up.

16 There's going to be a pool of money
17 that's going to be generated through the slot
18 machines at Plainville to start that the
19 horsemen would like to share in. And we are
20 going to look to see if we can get an agreement
21 with the HBPA so that we can try some different
22 things.

23 Myself, my father's idea of New
24 England racing is a little different than maybe

1 some of the other people. We'd like to run a
2 longer meet, shorter days in the week, not run a
3 four or five cards a week. Basically run two or
4 three cards a week and lengthen it out there.
5 We'd like amend the fair racing licenses from 15
6 days each to 30 days each so we'll get 60.
7 Maybe go with a two-day a week card maybe 13
8 races in the card. Whatever the amount of the
9 horse flush they have in the area that would be
10 able to handle the cards that we are going to be
11 trying to run.

12 Maybe try with a twilight card,
13 something in the evening. It might be better
14 for Brockton the way things are coming back
15 right now. People might enjoy a night card.
16 It's not legal in Massachusetts right now, but I
17 don't see it being a problem for people changing
18 it.

19 We're going do the widening of the
20 racetrack and keep it open from the day -- We
21 would like to see -- November 15 is a big day
22 for us as it is for Suffolk. We will kind of
23 know what the floor plan is. If it's us and
24 maybe Suffolk or us by ourselves, we would

1 probably open up the barn area right away. And
2 get the track ready so that people can come in
3 and have a place to go for the wintertime.
4 Working on an arrangement with the HBPA.

5 When we ran in 2001, we were sort of
6 held back because Rockingham was running
7 thoroughbred at the time. And they didn't want
8 the horses to come to Brockton and run. So, we
9 got sort of held hostage. The horses that
10 stayed in Brockton, stayed in Brockton and made
11 money in Brockton. We got a few people from
12 Weyland area down there, but it was very hard to
13 get horses that we needed to run Brockton. That
14 was one of the downfalls of Brockton before. It
15 wasn't there was a lack of interest; it was just
16 that problem itself.

17 But I think that it's a great little
18 facility. And as I explained to the horsemen --
19 It's probably over 50 called me since the time
20 we talked about doing our application. And I
21 explained to them that the money that we
22 generate in Massachusetts would be best kept for
23 the people in Massachusetts. Being a small,
24 shorter track, the local people get a chance.

1 It won't be the Nick Zitos or New
2 York coming down to Boston. I know it might be
3 nice to have a great race in Boston, but those
4 days might be a little bit far behind us. So,
5 that was our ideas. So, that would be my plan
6 to run the racetrack. Any questions?

7 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Thank you.
8 Would someone else like to speak, Sir?

9 MR. BROOKER: Good morning,
10 Commissioners. Paul Brooker National Director
11 from the International Union of Horseshoers. I
12 have raced at the Brockton Fairgrounds in the
13 60s under many different trainers and had a good
14 meet. And it was always to start of the fair
15 season ending at Berkshire Downs with a 30-day
16 meet. Very enjoyable. Small owners could make
17 income. They could pay their expenses.

18 The atmosphere at Brockton
19 Fairgrounds between management and the workforce
20 is fantastic. I come back in 2001 as an
21 official for Mr. George Carney. And the only
22 other time I've seen issues was at (INAUDIBLE)
23 we had a night of pouring rain. The track was a
24 quagmire.

1 Mr. Carney brought in a flame
2 charger and kept running it over the track until
3 it dried out safe enough to ride. You'll hear
4 complaints about riding on a half-mile track.
5 I've rode in bushes. I've road races down
6 highways and I've road steeple chases. A
7 competent rider can ride any track if he uses
8 his head. I think you will draw them.

9 As he stated earlier, you'll not get
10 New York horses in here. Most of the horses
11 will be local from the local area, which is
12 good. The city of Brockton will get an increase
13 in revenue from spending. And also the
14 transportation system, which badly needs an
15 increase, will benefit from this.

16 I do have concerns. The amount of
17 days of racing 15 and 15 that's fine. Thirty,
18 30 that's fine. When? Will it be prior to
19 Suffolk Downs, post Suffolk Downs or in between,
20 because this will make a big difference not only
21 in horses, revenue to Mr. Carney but with the
22 horsemen themselves.

23 If they decide to leave Suffolk
24 Downs and come to Brockton, will they be let the

1 back in? This is the situation that may evolve.
2 Hopefully, the dates will be awarded to Mr.
3 Carney and his family. And should they, I have
4 already told Mr. Carney I intend to reapply for
5 a position at the Brockton Fairgrounds hopefully
6 as steward and if not, I will again be paddock
7 (INAUDIBLE). A great family to work for and I
8 definitely hope you vote in his favor. Thank
9 you.

10 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Thank you,
11 Sir. Would anyone else like to speak? Mr.
12 Carney, go ahead.

13 MR. CARNEY: Can we incorporate this
14 hearing also into the Middleborough hearing,
15 please?

16 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: Yes. I
17 mentioned both when we started. So, yes, Sir.
18 They are inclusive of both of your applications.
19 Is there anyone that would like to speak
20 separately on that application? There are two
21 applications that we are taking comments on
22 today.

23 So, what we'll do is I want to make
24 sure we give everybody an opportunity. So, we

1 will take a recess. And we'll keep it open.
2 And we'll close this hearing at 11:30. But
3 we'll recess now in case anyone comes in looking
4 for an opportunity to speak. So, we'll be in
5 recess as of now. Thank you.

6

7 (A recess was taken)

8

9 COMMISSIONER CAMERON: This hearing
10 is back in session. Seeing no more speakers, we
11 will officially close the hearing. It is 11:30.
12 Thank you.

13

14 (Hearing concluded at 11:30 a.m.)

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

C E R T I F I C A T E

I, Laurie J. Jordan, an Approved Court Reporter, do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true and accurate transcript from the record of the proceedings.

I, Laurie J. Jordan, further certify that the foregoing is in compliance with the Administrative Office of the Trial Court Directive on Transcript Format.

I, Laurie J. Jordan, further certify I neither am counsel for, related to, nor employed by any of the parties to the action in which this hearing was taken and further that I am not financially nor otherwise interested in the outcome of this action.

Proceedings recorded by Verbatim means, and transcript produced from computer.

WITNESS MY HAND this 21st day of October, 2014.



LAURIE J. JORDAN

My Commission expires:

Notary Public

May 11, 2018