



ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMISSIONER STEBBINS

PRESENTATION CATEGORY 2 – SLOTS PARLOR

FEBRUARY 26, 2014

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMPONENTS

The Application set out three broad groupings of criteria:

- 1. Job Creation
- 2. Supporting External Business
- 3. Regional Tourism and Attractions

OUR APPROACH

- Individual Review of each Application by Review Group, consisting of:
 - Commission staff
 - o Technical Experts
 - Subject-Matter Experts
- Group Discussion
- Additional input gathered from site visits, presentations by Applicants,

follow-up/background analysis and interviews

• Reviewed slots parlor elements of each applicant first.

ADVISORS AND SUPPORT GROUPS

Massachusetts Gaming Commission Advisor

 Jill Griffin, Director, Workforce Development and Supplier Diversity

External Reviewers (Technical Reviewers)

- Lynn Browne, Former Director of Research and the Boston Federal Reserve Bank and current Lecturer in Economics at Brandeis University
- Jennifer James, Undersecretary, MA Department of Labor and Workforce Development
- Betsy Wall, Executive Director, MA Office of Travel and Tourism (MOTT)
- Jonathan Hyde, MA Office of Travel and Tourism

HLT Advisory (Subject-Matter Experts/Consultants)

- Lyle Hall
- Carla Giancola

Pinck & Co. (Process Advisors/Consultants)

- Nancy Stack
- Melissa Martinez







 $\star \star \star \star \star$

OVERALL OBSERVATIONS

- Unquestionably, each applicant has the experience necessary to run a successful Category 2 facility.
- Category 2 license Applications are focused on a regional draw
- Tourism industry benefits much less pronounced than expected for Category 1 (destination casinos) Applicants.
- Applicants focused on demonstrating capability of delivering job creation and operational spending consistent with Host Community and Surrounding Community Agreements.
- Applicants understood impact of future competition (Category 1 casinos) on employment and business spending
- Evidence that applicants knew their region, economic players, and organizations helpful to their success so that they could effectively "hit the ground running" upon award of a license.

APPROACH TO PRESENTATION



* * * * *

TOURISM COMPONENTS

Tourism was reviewed in **TWO PARTS**:

- 1. Tourism and Regional Promotion and Marketing
 - Local agreements to expand gaming draw
 - Cross Marketing
 - Collaboration with tourism and other industries
 - International marketing efforts
 - Record of success
- 2. Other Amenities Enhancement and Business Development
 - Unique business and marketing strategies
 - Other community enhancements
 - Entertainment and athletic events

TOURISM DISCUSSION

We Were Looking For:

Past experience and proposed plans for:

- entertainment and other amenities
- identification of target markets, marketing initiatives, cross-marketing with local business/attractions
- collaboration with Tourism organizations and local economic development agencies.

Demonstrated awareness/knowledge of new local tourism market, including:

- Linkage to marketing activities
- Agreements in place with local tourism agencies

We Found/Didn't Find:

- Experience with and plans for a range of traditional marketing, partnership, advertising and reward (i.e., player card) programs.
- Limited detail on connections to existing Massachusetts marketing infrastructure (e.g., Massachusetts Office of Tourism), attractions/ infrastructure and market segments.

TOURISM RATINGS

Leominster PPE	Plainville SGR	Raynham RP
Very Good	Very Good	Sufficient
Leominster:	Plainville:	Raynham:
 MOUs with local partners Goals linked to regional economic development plan. Endorsements from other cities provided. History of financial support for community organizations and events Extensive entertainment experience. 	 MOUs with local partners Extensive past experience – marketing/loyalty programs, working with convention & visitors bureaus/tourism bodies Significant number of endorsement letters and references. Most likely avenue to maintain uninterrupted harness racing activity Start new regional ecconomic development organization. 	 Focus on sports partnerships. Entertainment and advertising budgets not well explained or linked to proposed development. Potential for supporting harness

 $\star \star \star \star \star$

SUPPORT FOR EXTERNAL BUSINESS COMPONENTS

External Business was reviewed in **FOUR PARTS**:

- 1. Local Business Promotion and Support
 - Local business promotion
 - Local suppliers, business owners
 - Assisting businesses/Promoting regional business
 - Vendor supplied goods
- 2. Minority-, Women-, and Veteran-Businesses Support ("MBE, WBE, VBE")
- 3. Regional Impact
 - Projected benefit for regional economy
 - Regional economic plan coordination (Tourism section)
- 4. Domestic Gaming Equipment

SUPPORT FOR EXTERNAL BUSINESS DISCUSSION

We Were Looking For:

Past experience and plans detailing:

- impacts of cross marketing initiatives
- extent of relationships with local suppliers/vendors,
- arrangements in place with local and WBE/MBE/VBE vendors.

Realistic, achievable, experience based projections, including:

- quantification of local spending/ vendor arrangements
- number of arrangements and
- types of partnerships

We Found/Didn't Find:

Past experience and projections of:

- local spending/vendor arrangements
- direct/indirect economic benefit on the host community (and surrounding area). .
- Emphasis on intention to buy locally and facilitate buy-local policies.
- Record of success in meeting vendor requirements.
- Limited detailed information about plans specifically aligned for Massachusetts.

OPERATING EXPENSES

	Operating E	xpenses Su	mmary		
	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	Year 5
Operating Expenditures/COGS Leominster/PPE Plainville/Penn National Raynham/PR					
Marketing Hard Costs Leominster/PPE Plainville/Penn National Raynham/PR					
Entertainment Expenses Leominster/PPE Plainville/Penn National Raynham/PR					
Total Leominster/PPE Plainville/Penn National Raynham/PR					

SUPPORT FOR EXTERNAL BUSINESS RATINGS

Leominster PPE	Plainville SGR	Raynham RP
Very Good	Very Good	Sufficient
Leominster	Plainville	<u>Raynham</u>
 Details provided on outreach plans for contractors (sub trades), and suppliers during operations. Substantive MOU's to 	 Broadest operational track record including detailed financial impacts. Detailed outreach plans for contractors (sub 	 Discussed modeling of Community Partners program used in Bensalem. Past experience shown, but lacking detail on detailed plans for Raynham
 demonstrate partnerships. M3D3 proposal - unique approach to business stimulation -guaranteed financial commitment and Gateway City focus. 	 trades) and suppliers during operations. Maintenance of existing racing operation at Plainridge Racecourse. 	 Marketing and entertainment spending is insufficiently explained/backed-up.

JOB CREATION COMPONENTS

Job creation was reviewed in **THREE PARTS**:

- 1. HR Practices and Employment
 - Employees
 - Affirmative action
 - HR practices (e.g., workplace safety, employee assistance programs)
 - Employee Retention
 - Ethnic diversity
- 2. Workforce Development
 - Hiring and training (generally as well as the unemployed/underemployed)
 - Workforce development
- 3. Labor Relations
 - Organized labor contracts
 - Labor harmony

JOB CREATION DISCUSSION

We Were Looking For:

Detailed and realistic quantification and description of:

- F/T, P/T, FTE jobs -wages, benefits, retention.
- Union FTEs, wages and benefits

Past experience and plans detailing:

- arrangements with colleges/training institutes, and career centers,
- targeting unemployed, underemployed, minorities, women and veterans,
- workforce development and HR practices (onboarding, advancement, employee assistance).

We Found/Didn't Find:

- Solid awareness of staffing requirements through quantification and description of jobs
- Experience, sensitivity and awareness of affirmative action requirements.
- Limited detail on workforce development and HR practices:
- little focus on career path/advancement opportunities and onboarding initiatives
- little detail on how staff would be identified, trained and retained—notably the underemployed and unemployed.

JOB CREATION RATINGS

Leominster PPE	Plainville SGR	Raynham RP
Very Good	Very Good	Sufficient
<u>Leominster</u>	<u>Plainville</u>	<u>Raynham</u>
 Stable payroll/FTE and employee counts over 5 year period. Demonstrated awareness of Mass situation and past experience in Maryland M3D3 proposal has potential for job creation outside the 	 Most realistic payroll and labor estimates. Demonstrated positive track record in union relationships. History of human resource management and job development. Maintains racing employment at 	 Payroll and employee estimates – believed to be aggressive. Unsupported projection of increased non-gaming payroll in year 3 and beyond. Referenced past experience but provided limited detail and linkages to their a
gaming/hospitality area.	Plainridge.	Massachusetts facility.
15 MASSGAMING COMMISSION		

JOB SUMMARY

First Full Year of Operations - Job Summary			
	-	-	
	Leominster/PPE	Plainville/Penn National	Raynham/PR
FTEs			
Gaming			
Non-Gaming			
Other			
Total	671	575	471
Payroll & Benefits			
Gaming			
Non-Gaming			
Other			
Total			
Union FTEs	477	420	236
	4//	420	230
Union Payroll & Benefits			
Payroll & Benefits/FTE			

FINAL THOUGHTS

- Very competitive applications from all three applicants.
- Looking for applicant who has the best opportunity to meet their projections so expectations to the Commonwealth and Communities are met.
- Connection between success in other jurisdictions and detailed plans as to how that would translate for their new Massachusetts facility was critical.
- Strong evidence that the applicant was building relationships with key partners, small businesses and other organizations was key for licensee to hit the ground running.
- We first viewed all applications based on their ability to operate a successful slots parlor.

OVERALL CATEGORY RATING

Leominster PPE	Plainville SGR	Raynham RP
Very Good	Very Good	Sufficient
Job Creation	Job Creation	Job Creation
External Business	External Business	External Business
Tourism	Tourism	Tourism